



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes January 6, 2026

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
New Business

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

Staff: Cathy Flynn, Holly Backus and Sara Johnson
Holly Backus left the meeting at 4:38 pm

In person Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Patten
Remote: Thornewill and Paul
Absent: Pohl
Early departures: Camp at 7:29pm

Meeting called to order at 4:03pm by Stephen Welch
Board: Welch, Oliver MacLeod Camp and Patten
Oliver made the motion to approve the agenda
Motion carries unanimously

I. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION

- Welch announced that beginning later in the month, Old Business meetings will be held from 4:00 p.m. to no later than 7:00 p.m. He noted that the change would take effect at the last Old Business meeting of the month, which was identified as January 26, and stated that the updated schedule would be announced again as the date approaches.

II. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1. Faros Properties, LLC 13915	23 Madaket Rd	Roof change	41/303	T & T Roofing	VO
2. NT Property Owner 13955	19 Honeysuckle Dr	ODS	68/397	LFW	VO
3. Clinton Savings Bank 13901	14-16 Sheep Pond Rd	Re-site house on lot	63/29&30	Bracken Engineering	VO
4. Aleks Istanbulu 13884	5 Elbow Ln	Deck	73.2.4/43	Self	VO
5. Town of Nantucket 13899	95 Goldfinch Dr	Electrical/HVAC upgrades	68/581	David Gray	VO
6. Mark Finnegan 13900	36 Warrens Landing Rd	Fence	38/44	Self	VO
7. Tautemo Way Realty Tr 13920	16 Tautemo Wy	Fenestration OD shower	83/14	Paul Beaulieu	VO
8. Surfside Realty Tr 13891	16 Walsh St	Rev. 12949 infill 33sf	42.4.1/50	R. Newman	CT
9. Elizabeth Salata 13895	32 Jefferson Av	Privacy gates	30/132	Ahern, LLC	CT
10. Douglas McGlathery 13902	4 Evelyn St	Fenestration	73.3.1/61	Angus MacLeod	CT
11. Sconset Trust 13903	122 Baxter Rd	Re-locate erosion fence	48/5	Julie Ruddick Meade	CT
12. ACK MWG, LLC 13904	10 Silver St	Rev. 10342; shutters/windows	55.4.1/187	EMDA	CT
13. Stephen Meister 13898	17 Lauretta Ln	Rev. shed addition	14/16.2	Emeritus, LTD	CT
14. ACK 007 Properties 13910	46 Walsh St	Window replacement	29/101.1	Normand Residential	CT
15. Dubois, Helen 13925	5 Stone Post Wy	Cottage addition	74/80	SMRD	RP
16. Mannion, Jamie 13924	6 Flintlock Rd	MH addition	76/48	SMRD	RP
17. Mannion, Jamie 13923	6 Flintlock Rd	Cabana shed	76/48	SMRD	RP
18. Peacock Mary & Wayne 13927	6 Fargo Way	MH alterations	14/61.1	Barber & Sons	RP
19. Mark Maisto 13932	78 Pleasant St	Pergola	55/654	Gryphon Architects	RP
20. Shimmo Prop LLC 13930	14 Shimmo Pond Rd	Rev. 8718; garage fenestration	43/17	Gryphon Architects	RP
21. NCF 13929	220 Milestone Rd	Rev. 12640; re-site Bog House	51/1	Gryphon Architects	RP
22. Arthur Reade Tr 13928	19 Monomoy Rd	Garage doors and roof	54/260	Gryphon Architects	RP
23. Luke Kelly 13877	81 Cliff Rd	Add pergola to cabana	30/165	R. Newman	AM

HDC Meeting January 06, 2026

24.	Montvale Investments 13879	19 E. Lincoln Av	Porch railings	42.4.1/4	R. Newman	AM
25.	Middle Child, LLC 13864	8R Union St	Remove wart	42.3.1/100.1	BPC	AM
26.	James D Jr Tr 13960	4 Middle Tawpawshaw Rd	Fascia change	53/50	Nate Barber	SW
27.	86/88 Pocomo Tr 13875	86 Pocomo Rd	Demo/move off shed 1	15/41	Emertius, LTD	CP
28.	86/88 Pocomo Tr 13876	86 Pocomo Rd	Demo/move off shed 2	15/41	Emertius, LTD	CP
29.	Barry Boniface 13882	196 Cliff Rd	Cottage- windows/clr chg	40/25.1	Topham Design	CP
30.	Matt Tanenblatt 13866	2 S. Mill St	Omit window/relocate	55.4.1/110	DTA	AM
31.	Carmin Giardini 13943	7 Clifford St	Addition	79/19	Reid Yenor	JP
32.	Ann Donnelly 13942	3 Pinkham Cir	Window well	56/179	JB Studios	JP
33.	Casa Belles Dos, LLC 13944	5 Shawkemo Hills	Shed	27/90	Smith and Hutton	JP
34.	Catherine Molnar 13941	12R Skyline Dr	Shed	79/35	DTA	JP
35.	Mayflower Crescent LLC 13934	74 Monomoy Rd	Demo Move dwelling	43/151	WAPD	JP
36.	INSR Trust 13939	1 N Swift Rock	Rev 12382; fenestration	40/2	Emeritus LTD	JP
37.	Surfside Design, LLC 13959	7 White St	Rev 13701; fenestration	80/9	Emeritus, LTD	SW
38.	Peter O'Brien 13951	8 Newtown Ln	Fenestration	55/581.1	JB Studio	SW
39.	60 Burnell, LLC 13946	60 Burnell St	Rev 13211; rmv porch/winds	49.3.2/18	Botticelli & Pohl	SW
40.	QBW, LLC 13948	4 Wood Hollow Rd	Color change	72/16	R. Newman	SW
41.	2 Green Ln Realty 13945	2 Green Ln	Rev. 13493; rmv windows	42.3.3/130	Gryphon Architects	SW
42.	Robin Buzzuto 13950	6 Nonantum Ave	Cabana	87/140	R. Newman	SW

- **Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, Patten and Thornwill- MacLeod and Paul recused**
- **Oliver made the motion to approve Consents**
- **Motion carries unanimously**

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	57 Somerset, LLC 13893	57 Somerset Rd	Rev. 13646; pool	66/91	Atlantic Landscaping	CT
	• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
2.	Hillary Rayport 13909	89 Main St	Bay window modifications	42.3.3/19	Normand Residential	CT
	• NPT concurrence (preservation easement) on the window modification is needed before the issuance of the COA.					
3.	Town of Nantucket 13952	19 Waitt Dr	Hardscape	67/927	Parker Helwing	VO
	• Fence to be off the property line, at least 1' inside. Cut a half-moon at base of fence, every third section allowing vegetation, like climbing hydrangea, to grow on both sides of fence.					
4.	8 Gull Island LLC 13926	8 Gull Island Ln	Fence	42.4.3/95	Barrett Enterprises	VO
	• Fence not to be on property line. Maintain existing vegetation.					
5.	Mannion, Jamie 13922	6 Flintlock Rd	Pool	76/48	SMRD	RP
	• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
6.	Luke Kelly 13885	81 Cliff Rd	Spa	30/165	R. Newman	AM
	• Spa must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
7.	Milton Rowland 13883	18 Mt. Vernon St	Reduce barn size	55.4.4/32.1	Normand Residential	AM
	• Change 6 light sash to 8 light on East barn doors (and center).					
8.	Morgan Winn 13956	6 Sleepy Hollow	Fence	66/453.2	LFW	VO
	• Fence installed at least 1' off property line. Cut a half-moon at base of fence, every third section allowing vegetation, like climbing hydrangea, to grow on both sides of fence.					
9.	Craig Gambee 13916	160 Madaket Rd	Pool	39/13.6	Atlantic Landscaping	CP
	• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
10.	Val Velle 13938	160 Madaket Rd	61.5sf vestibule/window chg	39/13.6	CWA	CP
	• Date of construction to be added to the COA.					
11.	7 Maple LLC 13918	7 Maple Ln	Pool- hardscape	67/303.6	Emeritus, LTD	CP
	• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
12.	Brett Krumper 13880	5 Davis Ln	Cupola on shed	82/72	Val Oliver Design	CP
	• Date of construction to be added to the COA.					
13.	89 Easton N. T. 13847	89 Easton St	Hardscape/ODS	42.4.2/61	BPC	AC
	• Vegetation (privet) continue east side of outdoor shower to screen from North Avenue, and add date of construction to the COA.					
14.	21 Folger Ave, LLC 13886	21 Folger Av	Solar ground array	80/42	ACK Smart	AC
	• Maintain existing vegetation and add where needed (indigenous screening (pines)). Not to be seen at time of inspection and in perpetuity.					
15.	79 Orange St, LLC 13877	79 Orange St	Roof top solar	55.4.1/89.1	ACK Smart	AC
	• Black 3-tab asphalt roof, hedge to remain in perpetuity, and add correct date of construction & name of dwelling to the COA.					
16.	Daniel Murphy 13937	8 Golfview Dr	Pool Spa hardscape	66/192	Jardins Intl	JP
	• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
17.	Joanne Curlee 13949	121 Wauwinet Rd	Roof walk access	12/10	R. Newman	SW

- Circular stairs to be painted “gun metal gray”.
- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod Patten and Thornewill
- Camp made the motion to hold 2 Dukes for further discussion.
- Motion carries unanimously
- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod Patten and Thornewill- Oliver and Paul recused
- MacLeod made the motion to approve consents with conditions minus 2 Dukes Rd
- Motion carries unanimously

IV. SIGNS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	22 Federal St, LLC 13953	22 Federal St	Master Sign Plan	42.4.2/31	Jonas Baker
	• Motion to approve with Sign C removed from plan. The Council will entertain replacement in the future.				
2.	111 OSR, LLC 13931	111B Old South Rd	Master Sign Plan	68/167	Emeritus, LTD
	• Motion to approve signs #2 & #4 modified to 12” x 12”.				
3.	111 OSR, LLC 13853	111B Old South Rd	Upstate Door- wall sign (OB)	68/167	Emeritus, LTD
	• Motion to approve.				
4.	111 OSR, LLC 13933	111B Old South Rd	Upstate Door- wall sign #2	68/167	Emeritus, LTD
	• Motion to approve with the 12” x 12” adjustment.				
5.	Great Harbor Yacht Club 13944	56 Union St	G.H.Y.C est 2003- wall sign	55.1.4/33	Emeritus, LTD
	• Motion to approve with the condition that the material is changed to wood.				
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod Patten and Oliver; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul				
	• MacLeod made the motion to approve Sign Committees’ recommendation				
	• Motion carries unanimously				

V. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

- MacLeod inquired about a proposed hardscaping project along the bike path at 3 Baltimore; Cathy Flynn confirmed the application was being pulled due to an easement issue and would not proceed. Oliver noted that 81 Cliff Street was highlighted on the agenda but had not been reviewed by Holly Backus. Backus explained she did not provide comments because the proposal involved adding a pergola to a cabana, which is not a historic structure, and therefore did not raise preservation concerns. Welch agreed that the project was not a significant issue. Overall, the discussion served to clarify application status and confirm that no outstanding preservation issues required further review.

VI. CARRIED OVER FROM NEW BUSINESS 11/18/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Joseph Marchese 13602	5 Copper Ln	Remove window	42.3.3/91	Carey Company VO
	• Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill and Paul; Alternates: Camp, Patten				
	• MacLeod made the motion to approve with the condition that instead of removing the window it becomes a blind window				
	• Motion carries unanimously				

VII. NEW BUSINESS 12/09/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Surfside Design, LLC 13676	7 White St	New dwelling	80/9	Emeritus, LTD RP
	• Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, Thornewill and Patten; Alternates: Paul				
	• Camp made the motion to approve as submitted				
	• Motion carries unanimously				
2.	Luka Milisic 13862	6A Daffodil Ln	Hardscape	68/772.1	Alex Trifunovic VO
	• Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten				
	• Camp made the motion to approve through Exhibit A with natural to weather simple vertical board fence with Type II cap; alternating sections of ½ moon cut at base with planting material.				
	• Motion carries with Welch as a No				
3.	Courtney Lea Ney 13766	1 Chapel St	Shutter color change	73.4.2/17	Self VO
	• Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten				
	• Oliver made the motion to approve as submitted with the date and name added to the COA				
	• Motion carries unanimously				
4.	Greg Raiff 13786	100 Low Beach Rd	Alterations	75/27	Val Oliver Design CT
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Paul and Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver				
	• The board discussed concerns that the proposed gable-forward design conflicted with the main mass and linear character of the house and suggested that an eave-forward approach could retain second-floor space while better fitting the structure. Alternative approaches were discussed, including retaining the gable-forward element on the south side or duplicating the existing dormer to maintain proportion. The application was unanimously held for revisions, with the board requesting changes related to fenestration, overall massing, and reducing the visual impact of the proposed gable-forward design.				

- MacLeod made the motion to Hold for revisions
 - Motion carries unanimously
5. Ferry Views, LLC 13843 72 Monomoy Rd Pool 43/115 Ahern, LLC RP
- Welch, Oliver, Patten, MacLeod and Camp; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul
 - MacLeod made the motion through with existing vegetation to remain
 - Motion carries 4-1 with Camp as a No
18. Steven Cohen Tr 13888 2 Dukes Rd Vehicular gate 41/187 Ahern, LLC AC
- Gate to be natural to weather.
 - Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Camp and Paul; Alternates: Patten; recused: Thornewill
 - Camp made the motion to approve with the gate to be NTW and moved back aligned with the tennis court. Vegetation on both sides through Exhibit A.
 - Motion carries unanimously
6. David Gregory 13832 53 Nobadeer Av New dwelling 88/54.1 WAPD RP
- Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Patten; Alternates: Paul, Thornewill
 - The board discussed concerns regarding the proposed height and proximity of the house to the beach; the appropriateness of a two-story structure within the low-slung coastal landscape. Members suggested reducing the overall height to approximately 22–23 feet and potentially lowering the eaves to better align with the surrounding neighborhood context. Additional concerns were raised about fenestration, particularly the placement of windows near the chimney and the overall number of windows, with suggestions to reduce and simplify window openings to lessen visual impact.
 - Camp made the motion to hold for revisions
 - Motion carries unanimously

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 1/06/2026

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Policarpo Dacruz 13848	12 Pine Tree	Rooftop solar	68/223	Craig Orn	VO
	• No representation, Held					
2.	Wolfram Fam Tr 13849	7 Folger Ln	Rev. 11662; garage	42.4.4/33.3	WAPD	AC
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill and Paul; Alternates: Patten; Recused: Oliver • Camp expressed concern that increasing the formerly single-story garage to nearly two stories was inappropriate given its proximity to Coffin Park and the surrounding natural landscape. She felt the original, smaller scale was more appropriate for a building adjacent to such a setting and stated that the initial, more diminutive design was the right choice for the site. • Paul stated that he had no concerns with the proposal due to the existing and anticipated natural vegetation buffering views from Coffin Park. He appreciated that the structure was located in the least visible area of the site and felt that, over time, the cobblestone color would help it blend into the surroundings. • Thornewill expressed concern about the increased ridge height, noting that the building now read more like a main house than a garage. She stated a preference for the simpler character of the originally approved design and felt that the increased scale was not appropriate for the setting. • MacLeod stated that he preferred the previous proposal and felt the current revision was too tall and overly detailed, describing it as “tricked out” with balconies, dormers, and fenestration. He noted that while such elements might be appropriate in other areas of the island, they were not suitable for a rural, natural setting adjacent to Coffin Park. • Welch noted that the most visible element from Coffin Park would be the new second story and suggested design changes to reduce its impact, such as orienting the simpler east elevation toward the park or removing some of the additional fenestration. He stated that he could support the design if approximately six inches were removed from the overall height. • MacLeod made the motion to Hold for revisions • Motion carries unanimously					
3.	Stacey Davis 13855	13 Williams St	New dwelling	55/134	Val Oliver Design	AC
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver • The board discussed the steep grade change across the site and emphasized the need for a detailed site and retaining wall plan, noting code requirements for egress paths and legal setbacks. Concerns were raised about the building’s “tall and skinny” proportions, with some members stating such massing is typically only approvable when heavily screened and others suggesting the need for clearer architectural hierarchy or a reduction to one-and-a-half stories. While it was acknowledged that existing vegetation and surrounding structures limited visibility and mitigated some massing concerns, questions remained regarding pedestrian and vehicular access and which street would ultimately serve the site. The board directed the applicant to return with a revised site plan showing topography, retaining wall locations and heights, clear access and egress routes, and clarified setbacks. • Camp made the motion to Hold for revisions • Motion carries unanimously					
4.	Peggy Whalen 13854	2 S. Cambridge St.	Extend dormer	59.4/16	Val Oliver Design	AC
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten and Thornewill; Alternates: Payl; Agent: Olver					

- MacLeod made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion approved unanimously
5. Tork ACK, LLC 13865 **1 Mothball Way** Demo/move dwelling 83/42.4 Emeritus, LTD AM
- Board: Welch, Oliver MacLeod Camp and Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten
 - Paul made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries unanimously
6. Leo Nick 13869 **0 Winn St** New dormers 41/184.1 EMDA AC
- Board: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod and Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul
 - MacLeod made the motion to approved due to limited visabilty
 - Motion carries unanimously
7. Luke Kelly 13890 **81 Cliff Rd** Pent roof 30/165 R. Newman AM
- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver and Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul
 - Oliver made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries 4-1 MacLeod- no
8. Madaket Land Tr 13987 **3 Baltimore St** Hardscape 60/19 Tony Butler AM
- No representation, Held
9. Tom ACK, LLC 13892 38 Chuck Hollow New pergola 66/91 JB Studio VO
- Board: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Paul and MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten
 - Oliver made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries unanimously
10. Tom ACK, LLC 13713 38 Chuck Hollow Rev. 12052; rmv 66sf of shed 66/91 JB Studio VO
- Board: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Paul and Thornewill; Alternates: Patten
 - Oliver made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries unanimously
11. Tom ACK, LLC 13702 38 Chuck Hollow Rev. 12052; red shed to 165sf 66/91 JB Studio VO
- Board: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Paul and Thornewill; Alternates: Patten
 - Oliver made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries unanimously
12. 19 Sherburne TP N.T. 13907 19 Sherburne Turnpike New dwelling 30/173.1 Sophie Metz CT
- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten and Thornewill; Alternates: Paul; Recused: Oliver
 - Thornewill made the motion to approve as submitted except dropping the plate height on the front central dormet.
 - Motion carries unanimously
13. 19 Sherburne TP N.T. 13906 19 Sherburne Turnpike New guest house 30/173.1 Sophie Metz CT
- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten and Thornewill; Alternates: Paul; Recused: Oliver
 - MacLeod made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries unanimously
14. 19 Sherburne TP N.T. 13905 19 Sherburne Turnpike New shed 30/173.1 Sophie Metz CT
- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten and Thornewill; Alternates: Paul; Recused: Oliver
 - MacLeod made the motion to approve as submitted
 - Motion carries unanimously
15. Seventy Eight Cliff LLC 13908 **78 Cliff Rd** New dwelling 30/71 Sophie Metz CT
- Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Paul and Thornewill; Alternates: Paul; Recused: Oliver
 - Thornewill expressed concern that the house was very close to the road given the size of the lot. She noted that the main and side entries, along with their porches, appeared nearly identical and gave the impression of a duplex, and recommended differentiating the entries by giving the main entrance greater hierarchy and setting the house farther back from the street.
 - Paul agreed with concerns about the similarity of the entries and noted that the massing could be improved by introducing clearer hierarchy, either by emphasizing the main mass or reducing adjacent elements. He also commented that it took some time to identify the front door, indicating that additional detailing or emphasis was needed to better define the primary entry.
 - MacLeod expressed concern that the proposed design, when considered with the future garage and shed, could create an imposing wall along both Cliff Road and Derrymore. He noted that larger lots carry a responsibility to preserve more open space at the street rather than walling off the property. He also observed that the main, side, and rear entries shared similar form and height, resulting in a lack of hierarchy and telescoping of forms, and felt the continuous massing and similar rooflines made the project feel imposing and insufficiently articulated. He recommended reviewing full streetscape views and perspective drawings that include landscaping to better evaluate the overall impact.
 - Camp expressed concern about the massing and the building's proximity to Cliff Road, suggesting it be set farther back from the street. She felt that the two gambrel roof forms in succession were redundant and recommended establishing clearer

hierarchy by allowing the primary corner mass to taper down. She also supported concerns about the project creating a “wall” effect and agreed that breaking up the overall length and height would improve the design.

- Welch, Chair, expressed more support for the proposal, noting that the design replicated elements found elsewhere on Cliff and had a human scale with appropriate proximity to the street when considering the planned landscaping. While he felt the overall detailing and scale were strong, he requested rendered perspectives with and without landscaping, as well as a full streetscape view, to better evaluate potential wall and massing impacts
- Camp made the motion to hold for revisions and a streetscape along Derrymore and Cliff; perspectives with and without landscaping.
- Motion carries unanimously

16.	Shelley Dolan 13911	1 Pawguvet Ln	Move off/demo dwelling	30/129.1	Normand Residential	CT
	• Board: Camp (Acting Chair), MacLeod, Oliver, Patten and Paul; Alternates: Thornewill; Recused: Welch • MacLeod made the motion to approve as submitted • Motion carries unanimously					
17.	Shelley Dolan 13913	1 Pawguvet Ln	New dwelling	30/129.1	Normand Residential	CT
	• Board: Camp, MacLeod, Oliver, Patten and Paul; Alternates: Thornewill; Recused: Welch • Oliver praised the applicant for keeping the new house similar in character to the previous structure, noting that the public would likely appreciate that approach. She also supported reducing the number of French doors from four to two or three. • MacLeod noted several departures from the previous house design, including that the east elevation along Pawguvet now presents a long, uninterrupted wall with five windows instead of the former smaller gabled bump-out. He suggested breaking up or adding articulation to extended wall sections and expressed concern that the front door now reads more like a side or rear entry, resulting in a loss of entry clarity. He echoed concerns about the number of French doors and questioned the revised second-floor balcony, noting that it now projects to the face of the wall and should be reconsidered. • Patten expressed general appreciation for the new design's similarity to the previous house and stated her support for the other comments raised, particularly the concern regarding the four French doors. • Paul agreed that the main entry now feels diminutive and lacks clear hierarchy, appearing overly tucked in. He suggested refining the south elevation gable, such as bringing a corner board forward to add articulation, and strongly supported modifying the configuration of the four French doors. • Camp supported reducing the number of French doors and agreed with comments encouraging more summer “cottage charm” and greater breakup of the main massing. She also noted that the south elevation appeared bland and suggested adding architectural interest, such as a sunroom or additional articulation. • The board's primary concerns focused on the increased fenestration, particularly the four French doors, as well as the visibility and hierarchy of the main entry, the treatment of wall massing and corner boards, and the overall articulation of the new elevations compared to the previous house. While members generally supported the architectural direction, they requested targeted refinements to address these specific issues. • MacLeod made the motion to Hold for revisions including provision of a floodplain elevation certificate and design revisions • Motion carries unanimously					
18.	Shelley Dolan 13912	1 Pawguvet Ln	Re-site shed	30/129.1	Normand Residential	CT
	• Board: Camp, MacLeod, Oliver, Patten and Paul; Alternates: Thornewill; Recused: Welch • Oliver made the motion to approve as submitted • Motion carries unanimously					
19.	ACK Reward, LLC 13921	149 Main St	Fenestration/brick change	41/169	BPC	AM
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver and Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul • Camp made the motion to approve as submitted • Motion carries unanimously					
20.	Jeffrey Greenberg 13919	30A Orange St	Rev 10837-as-built window casings	42.3.2/200	Emeritus, LTD	AM
	• Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver and Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul • Oliver made the motion to approve with the option to add a bed detail molding • Motion carries unanimously					
21.	John Danks 13740	10 Meadowview Dr	Add dormer/pent roof	56/146	Zoran Milorski	VO
	• Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul • The board expressed concern that the proposed dormers were not set back sufficiently from the gable ends and eaves, noting that guidelines require greater inset so dormers properly relate to the main roof massing. Additional concerns were raised about					

inconsistent window patterns between the dormers and the main house, with members recommending that fenestration be harmonized for visual consistency. The proposed front pent roof was also critiqued as unnecessary and overly complex for the house style, with a preference for a simpler approach. The board noted that the submitted drawings lacked accurate scale and detail and requested properly measured elevations and sections to demonstrate proportionality, code compliance, and real-world feasibility. Members encouraged the applicant to review historic district guidelines, local precedents, and work closely with HDC staff. The board found the dormer proposal noncompliant as submitted and voted to hold the application for revisions addressing setbacks, proportions, fenestration, and documentation.

- Camp made the motion to Hold for revisions
- Motion carries unanimously

22.	Mayflower Crescent LLC 13935	74 Monomoy Rd	New dwelling	43/151	WAPD	JP
-----	------------------------------	---------------	--------------	--------	------	----

- No representation, Held

23.	Courtney McKechnie 13972	14 Lyon St	Window/stairs	55.4.1/114	Self	JP
-----	--------------------------	------------	---------------	------------	------	----

- No representation, Held

24.	Courtney McKechnie 13940	14 Lyon St	Historic determination	55.4.1/114	Self	JP
-----	--------------------------	------------	------------------------	------------	------	----

- No representation, Held

25.	100R Wauwinet Tr 13947	100R Wauwinet Rd	Rev 13204; rmve win muntins	11/24.3	Botticelli & Pohl	SW
-----	------------------------	------------------	-----------------------------	---------	-------------------	----

- No representation, Held

26.	7 Orange Sr, LLC 13958	7 Orange St VIEW	New Dwelling	42.3.1/149.1	Emeritus, LTD	SW
-----	------------------------	-------------------------	--------------	--------------	---------------	----

- Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill and Oliver; Alternates: Paul, Patten
- MacLeod questioned the historic precedent for placing a gambrel roof adjacent to another gambrel, noting that design guidelines advise using this roof form sparingly. He also expressed skepticism about the proposed “three over five bays” window configuration, stating that historic photographs read more as a three-over-three arrangement. He further noted concern that the scale of the proposed building could overwhelm the site, particularly in relation to the adjacent historic brick gambrel and the nearby church.
- Camp stated that while the building was handsome, it read as more suburban in character and raised concern that the “three over five” bay configuration was not typical for downtown Nantucket. She felt the additive rear masses were a significant departure from the primary form, noting that the middle mass with extensive glazing would “light up like a lightbulb.” She also expressed concern that the third-floor half-round windows were excessive and not appropriate for the historic context.
- Thornewill expressed concern that the proposal competed with its prominent neighbors, including the brick gambrel and the Unitarian church, rather than deferring to them. She felt the proportions recalled a prior gambrel project on Fair Street that appeared too tall and visually dominant and questioned whether the “three over five bays” configuration was appropriate in this context, regardless of its appearance in a hand sketch.
- Oliver stated that she liked the main portion of the design and said the “three over five” bay configuration did not concern her. She did, however, express uncertainty about the massing on the rear and side elevations, noting that these areas could be visible due to the setback of the neighboring building.
- Welch expressed concern that placing a new gambrel so close in style and scale to the existing brick gambrel created a significant visual conflict, particularly as shown in the context renderings. He advised that a Victorian-style structure, more consistent with the site’s true history, might be more harmonious and easier for the board to support. He also requested clear, full-elevation drawings and perspective views to allow the board to better evaluate the project’s impact and compatibility with the surrounding streetscape.
- MacLeod made the motion to Hold for revisions
- Motion carries unanimously

27.	17 Sherburne Turnpike 13957	17 Sherburne Turnpike	Gate/ODS	30/172.1	LINK	VO
-----	-----------------------------	-----------------------	----------	----------	------	----

- Board: Welch, MacLeod, Oliver, Patten and Paul; Alternates: Thornewill
- The board discussed the proposed driveway gate at the top of the steep hill and an outdoor shower, noting that there were no visibility concerns with the outdoor shower. Members strongly objected to the proposed gate location at the street, stating that driveway gates are not characteristic of the area and would not be approvable along Sherburne Turnpike. Additional concerns were raised that the steep slope would cause the gate to appear to “float” above the driveway when open, creating an unattractive and impractical condition. The board indicated that any future gate proposal would need to be set farther into the property, integrated into the landscape, and supported by detailed drawings, including topography, cross-sections, and a landscape plan. The board clarified that the gate as proposed could not be approved but welcomed a revised application with alternative placement and appropriate documentation; the outdoor shower was considered approvable.
- Patten made the motion to approve the outdoor shower but not approve the gate.
- Motion carries unanimously

Board: Welch, Paul, Oliver, MacLeod and Patten; Alternates: Thornewill

- **MacLeod made the motion to approve the December 09, 2025; December 16, 2025 minutes**
- **Motion carries 3-2 Welch- no; Oliver- abstained**

Board: Welch, Oliver MacLeod and Patten

- **Oliver made the motion to adjourn at 7:57pm**
- **Motion carries unanimously**