



HDC Minutes, December 16, 2025; adopted January 06, 2026

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes, December 16, 2025

2 Fairgrounds Road

Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Old Business

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair) Abby Camp (Sitting Chair), Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

Staff: Cathy Flynn, Holly Backus, Sara Johnson and Fiona Johnson

Holly Backus left the meeting at 4:15pm

Meeting called to order at 4:00pm by Abby Camp

In person: Camp, Patten, Oliver

Remote: Thornewill, Paul, MacLeod

Early departure: Oliver at 5:40PM

Absent: Welch, Pohl

Oliver made the motion to approve the agenda.

Approved by: Camp (Acting Chair), Oliver, MacLeod, Paul, Patten

Alternate: Thornewill

I. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION

- Change to Old Business Meeting hours: 4pm – 7pm, effective mid January 2026.
Held over for discussion

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Vitto Petruzzella 13263	9 Nobadeer Way	New dwelling	68/116	Kris Megna	CT
2.	Vitto Petruzzella 13264	9 Nobadeer Way	2 nd dwelling	68/116	Kris Megna	CT
3.	Vitto Petruzzella 13262	9 Nobadeer Way	Garage/ADU	68/116	Kris Megna	CT
4.	Alfred Sanford 13874	35 Vesper Ln	Window/doors	55/125	Ridgevale Development	VO
5.	Thomas Lehmacher 13870	14 Meadowview Rd	Window replacement	56/144	Thornewill Design	VO
6.	Susan Bannon 13878	2A Winn St	Window and door revisions	41/183.1	NAG	VO
7.	Golden Pond, LLC 13850	64 & 66 Baxter Rd	Rev. 13084; cabana	49/188 & 51	WAPD	VO
8.	12 W. Sankaty 13851	12 West Sankaty RD	Rev. 12727; add window	73.4.2/82	EMDA	VO
9.	32 Woodbine LLC 13881	32 Woodbine St	Rev. garage 2' wider	80/188	MCA+	AC
10.	NHA 13846	15 Broad St	Roof change	42.4.2/61	Lydon & Sons	AC
11.	Town of Nantucket 13860	9 Backus Ln	Baseball dugout- Home	67/16 & 401	Brook Meerbergen	AC
12.	Town of Nantucket 13861	9 Backus Ln	Baseball dugout- Visitor	67/16 & 401	Brook Meerbergen	AC
13.	Six Corners, LLC 13871	20 India St	Roof change	42.3.4/22	M. Freedman	AC

- **Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Paul, MacLeod; Alternates: none; Recused: Oliver, Thornewill**
- **Patten made motion to approve consents**
- **Motion carries unanimously**

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	41 W. Miacomet Tr 13867	41 W. Miacomet Rd	Rev. 7672; reduce pool size	86/13.1	Jardins International	VO
	• Pool must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade changes from existing or as noted on the application.					
2.	Fowzie Sabiah 13852	77 Hooper Farm Rd	Rooftop solar	67/328	Craig Orn	VO
	• Due to lack of visibility of the rear (typically, not approved on light gray roof). If roof is re-shingled, it should be black.					
	• Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Oliver, Patten, Paul, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill					
	• Oliver made motion to approve consents with conditions					
	• Motion carries unanimously					

IV. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

No discussion took place.

V. OLD BUSINESS 12/02/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Tom Myers 13606	20 Massachusetts Ave	Boathouse	60.3.1/321	Val Oliver Design
	- Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver - Hold until next Old Business meeting, 1/13/2026				Last heard 11/18/2025

VI. OLD BUSINESS 12/16/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Warren Peacock 13445	6 Fargo Way VIEW	Garage Apartment	14/61.1	Beau Barber
	- Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: none - Paul recommended lowering the plate height, so the fascia aligns with window headers and reducing the height of the pent roof on the north elevation or increasing garage door height to improve visual balance. - Oliver suggested that increasing the pent roof pitch could help reduce perceived verticality. - MacLeod recommended annotated drawings with bubbled revisions and side-by-side or thumbnail comparisons of prior and current plans. - Oliver made the motion to be hold for revisions with the previous submittal included as a side-by-side comparison. - Motion carries unanimously				
2.	17 Eat Fire Spring, LLC 13395	17 Eat Fire Spring Rd	Door/window change	20/58	EMDA
	- Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: none - Oliver made the motion to approve with condition that the color is changed to Nantucket Gray - Motion carries 4-1 (Camp nay)				
3.	Virginia Irwin 12621	115 Cliff Rd	New dwelling	41/7	Val Oliver Design
	- Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent Oliver - Held for full board				Last heard 10/14/2025
4.	Virginia Irwin 12629	115 Cliff Rd	Guest house/garage	41/7	Val Oliver Design
	- Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent Oliver - Held for full board				Last heard 10/14/2025
5.	Virginia Irwin 12616	115 Cliff Rd	Pool house	41/7	Val Oliver Design
	- Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent Oliver - Held for full board				Last heard 10/14/2025
6.	Virginia Irwin 12619	115 Cliff Rd	Re-site shed	41/7	Val Oliver Design
	- Track - Held for full board				
7.	Virginia Irwin 12618	115 Cliff Rd	Pool/hardscape	41/7	Val Oliver Design
	- Track - Held for full board				
8.	Maxwell House, LLC 13707	15 Cliff Rd	Rev. 5805; driveway	42.4.4/56	MCA+
	- Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Paul, MacLeod; Alternates: none - Patten made the motion to approve as submitted - Motion carries unanimously				

- | | | | | | |
|-----|---|--------------------|-----------------------|----------|------------------------------|
| 9. | 30 N. Beach St., LLC 13432 | 30 N. Beach St. | New hotel building | 29/130 | Emeritus, LTD |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul</i> Held for full board | | | | <i>Last heard 10/28/2025</i> |
| 10. | 30 N. Beach St., LLC 13405 | 30 N. Beach St. | Hardscape | 29/130 | Ahern, LLC |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Track</i> Held for full board | | | | |
| 11. | Dara Foundyler 13207 | 8 Massachusetts Av | New boat house/garage | 60.2.4/1 | LINK |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Thornewill, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: none MacLeod made the motion to approve through Exhibit A with both garage doors be natural-weather vertical board with white trim, shutters be white, and the pedestrian door be white with a nine-light configuration with lower panel and the pent roof removed. Motion carries unanimously | | | | |
| 12. | Steven Chen Tr. 13422 | 32 Hulbert Av | Hardscape | 29/72 | LINK |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Thornewill Oliver made the motion to approve through Exhibit A modifying Option 4 to be a typical curved arbor, held together with purlins on the sides. The circle to be cut down to a gate, leaving the bottom “swoop” with the lattice removed at the second horizontal member. The previously discussed Belgian block perimeter/apron was to be incorporated, with dimensions and materials clearly documented. Motion carries 4-1 (Camp nay) | | | | |
| 13. | Michelle Kolb 13662 | 8 Macy Rd | Hardscape | 60/246 | Michelle Kolb |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Board: Camp (Acting Chair), Patten, Thornewill, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: none Thornewill found the proposed gates generally inappropriate for the site and indicated that a split-rail fence would be acceptable if set back from the property line. Only Gate F, located at the southeast corner near the pickleball court and minimally visible, was considered appropriate. Members noted that existing vegetation would not sufficiently screen the other gates, which were viewed as overly decorative for the setting. Also noting a three-foot grade change across the site, with elevations ranging from 11 to 14 feet, and observed that no retaining walls were shown. Members requested additional information addressing grading impacts, particularly for the pickleball court, and clarification on how gates and fences would be set back from the property line Paul suggested that a single, simpler gate on Massey Road—such as the alternate Gate E—would be more consistent with rural precedents. The salvaged gates were viewed as too formal for the street setting. Camp supported split-rail fencing with turkey wire around the property and a single simple, natural-weather gate on Massey Road. Concerns were raised about grade changes affecting the feasibility of the pickleball court and the challenges of achieving effective visual screening, given the site’s openness and likely wind exposure on any proposed trees. MacLeod expressed that the pickleball court should not be raised above grade and must be level at elevation 11, given the absence of fencing. Salvaged fencing material could be acceptable if finished in Nantucket gray or Quaker gray along the conservation land boundary. Members noted that three gates along Massey Road are excessive and should be simplified, with preference for the alternate E or F gates in natural-weather finish. Split-rail fencing was supported if set back approximately five feet from the property line. Thornewill made the motion to be held for revisions requesting more information on the pickle ball court Motion carries unanimously | | | | |
| 14. | Vestal Nantucket LLC | 85 Vestal St | New dwelling | 56/252 | JB Studio |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Recused: Thornewill; Mullen: Oliver</i> Held for full board | | | | <i>Last heard 12/02/2025</i> |
| 15. | Vestal Nantucket LLC | 85 Vestal St | Garage/studio | 56/252 | JB Studio |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul; Recused: Thornewill</i> Held for full board | | | | <i>Last heard 12/02/2025</i> |

16.	Vestal Nantucket LLC	85 Vestal St	Shed	56/252	JB Studio
	• Track • Held for full board				

17.	Vestal Nantucket LLC	85 Vestal St	Pool-hardscape	56/252	JB Studio
	• Track • Held for full board				

- Board: Camp, Patten, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: none
- MacLeod made the to approve minutes from December 2, 2025
- Motion carries unanimously

- MacLeod made the motion to adjourn at 5:52pm
- Motion carries unanimously