



MINUTES

October 14, 2025

TOWN OF NANTUCKET

Meeting called to order at 4:01pm by Stephen Welch
 Pohl made the motion to approve the agenda.
 Board: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod. Motion carried unanimously.
 In person: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod
 Online: Thornewill
 Absent: Paul
 Staff: Holly Backus and Fiona Johnson

I. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

Staff comments can be printed for board members before the meeting, please let Holly know.

II. OLD BUSINESS 10/14/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Geoff Smith- 13163	22 Coffin St VIEW	Driveway revisions	73.4.1/36	E. Churchill

- Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul

Last heard 9/23/2025

The commissioners reviewed the driveway before the shed. Commissioner Oliver noted 9 Coffin Street being a similar driveway scenario and that it's prevalent in the area. Commissioner MacLeod agreed with Staff's comments on the driveway and shed location. The guidelines are clear not to have parking, driveway or shed in front of the structure. The proposed is what we try to avoid and try to have the driveway as far away from the corner as possible. Commissioner Camp stated that having the driveway as far in as possible from West Sankaty. Commissioner Welch was not thrilled with the location, but it's approvable.

Oliver made the motion to approve the application as submitted.

Welch, Patten, Oliver, voted Yes, MacLeod & Camp voted No. (3-2)

2.	Geoff Smith- 13164	22 Coffin St	Shed	73.4.1/36	E. Churchill
----	--------------------	--------------	------	-----------	--------------

- Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul

Last heard 9/23/2025

The applicant mentioned that the shed had been relocated and that there will be a hedge in front. Commissioner MacLeod said the shed should follow the guidelines should be behind the façade of the main house and to the side. Agree with the Preservation Planner's comments. Commissioner Camp is ok with the proposed.

Oliver made the motion to approve the application as submitted.

Welch, Patten, Oliver, Camp, voted Yes, MacLeod voted No. (4-1)

3.	Zach Dusseau- 13220	41 Macy's Ln VIEW	Roof top solar	68/34	ACK Smart
----	---------------------	--------------------------	----------------	-------	-----------

- Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul

Last heard 9/23/2025

The commissioners discussed that the proposed solar panels on 41 Macy's Ln would be highly visible from the street and did not conform to the guidelines, which discourage panels on the front of the main structure. While some commissioners acknowledged the financial and practical benefits of solar for working-class neighborhoods, the majority emphasized the need to preserve the historic character and follow established guidelines. Suggestions for visual mitigation, such as additional landscaping or alternative panel placement, were considered, but ultimately the board decided to approve solar panels only on the rear roof, not on the front-facing side.

MacLeod made a motion to approve the installation of solar panels exclusively on the rear roof of the primary structure, allowing the entirety of the rear roof plane to be covered with panels, and not to permit any panels on the front, street-facing roof.

Motion carries unanimously.

4.	Six Lily St, LLC 13326	6 Lily St (Sconset)	Addition/fenestration	73.3.1/109	Emeritus, LTD
----	------------------------	---------------------	-----------------------	------------	---------------

- *Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten; Alternates: Paul, Oliver* *Last heard 9/23/2023*

The commissioners discussed that, although the applicant had made some reductions to the size and height of the proposed addition at 6 Lily St, several members felt the new mass was still too large and overwhelmed the historic structure, and they recommended further reducing and setting back the addition to make it more sympathetic to the original building.

Camp made a motion to hold the application for revisions, specifically to address concerns about the massing and placement of the addition.

Motion carries unanimously.

5.	28 Pine LLC- 13019	28 Pine St	Fenest/ replace foundation	42.3.2/47	Emeritus, LTD
----	--------------------	------------	----------------------------	-----------	---------------

- *Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul* *Last heard 8/12/2025*

The commissioners discussed that, while they appreciated the applicant's efforts to reduce the size of the front bump out and dormer at 28 Pine St, several members felt the dormer was still too large and recommended it be changed to a shed style, and they also suggested redesigning the front bump out to better reflect the historic character of the building.

Camp made a motion to hold the application for revisions, specifically to address concerns about the dormer size and style and the design of the front bump out. Motion carries unanimously.

6.	Darrell Ferguson 12852	42 Chuck Hollow	VIEW Retaining wall	75/65.1	Self
----	------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------	---------	------

- *Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten; Alternates: Oliver* *Last heard 8/19/2025*

The commissioners discussed that the stone wall, columns, and gate at 42 Chuck Hollow were out of character for the rural neighborhood, and they recommended reducing the height of the entry columns and gate, removing the far end columns and all lattice, and maintaining evergreen screening to minimize the wall's visibility.

Camp made a motion to approve the application with a condition to make the posts on either side of the main gate no higher than 60 inches (including a simple cap), to cut down the gate to match that height, to remove all lattice, to dismantle the far end posts, and to maintain evergreen screening so the wall is minimally visible.

Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill voted Yes, Welch voted No. (4-1)

7.	Virginia Irwin 12621	115 Cliff Rd	New dwelling	41/7	Val Oliver Design
----	----------------------	--------------	--------------	------	-------------------

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver* *Last heard 6/10/2025*

The commissioners discussed that, while they appreciated the simplification of architectural details, they felt the overall massing of the house at 115 Cliff Rd was too large and grand for its prominent site, the flanking gambrels and oversized roof walk were inappropriate, and further revisions were needed to create a more understated and contextually appropriate design.

Pohl made a motion to hold the application for revisions.

Motion carries unanimously.

8.	Virginia Irwin 12620	115 Cliff Rd	Garage/guest house	41/7	Val Oliver Design
----	----------------------	--------------	--------------------	------	-------------------

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver* *Last heard 6/10/2025*

The commissioners discussed that the dormer on the 115 Cliff Rd Garage should be set back further from the wall below, the garage doors should be simpler and better proportioned, and the cross gambrel should be lower or narrower to improve the building's overall scale and relationship to the main mass.

MacLeod made a motion to hold the application for revisions.

Motion carries unanimously.

9.	Virginia Irwin 12616	115 Cliff Rd	Pool house	41/7	Val Oliver Design
----	----------------------	--------------	------------	------	-------------------

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver* *Last heard 6/10/2025*

The commissioners discussed that, while the pool house design at 115 Cliff Rd was architecturally interesting, its visibility from Cliff Road required a landscape plan with sufficient screening to minimize its impact on the streetscape.

Camp made a motion to hold the application for revisions and to request additional information, specifically a landscape plan for screening. Motion carries unanimously.

10.	Virginia Irwin 12619	115 Cliff Rd	Re-site shed	41/7	Val Oliver Design
-----	----------------------	--------------	--------------	------	-------------------

TRACK

11.	Virginia Irwin 12618	115 Cliff Rd	Pool	41/7	Val Oliver Design
-----	----------------------	--------------	------	------	-------------------

TRACK

12. Van Velle 13314 **10 Maxey Pond Rd** As-built deer fence 40/100 OID
• *Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul* *Last heard 9/23/2025*
The commissioners discussed that the deer fence at 10 Maxey Pond Rd should be moved back from the property lines and screened with vegetation to minimize its visibility, and that the gate should be modified to reduce its visual impact, ensuring the fence blends better with the surrounding landscape.
MacLeod made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the deer fence be moved back from the property lines, screened with vegetation, and the gate modified as discussed, with these requirements to be documented in an exhibit.
Motion carries unanimously.

13. Dylan Wallace 13115 **65 Polpis Rd** **VIEW** Rooftop Solar 43/13 Self
• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul* *Last heard 9/09/2025*
The commissioners discussed that, although solar panels were appropriate for the agricultural use of 65 Polpis Rd, they were concerned about the high visibility of panels on the front roof and recommended limiting panels to the rear roof unless the driveway was relocated and additional screening was provided to better comply with local guidelines and minimize visual impact.
Pohl made a motion to approve solar panels on the rear roof of the structure, and to allow panels on the front roof only if the driveway was relocated and additional screening was provided, with the roof to be black.
Motion carries unanimously.

Board: Welch, Patten, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod
MacLeod made a motion to adjourn @5:56pm
Motion carries unanimously.