



Approved HDC Minutes September 2, 2025; adopted October 7, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

4 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Vallorie Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod,

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten, Joe Paul

~~ MINUTES ~~

DATE 9/2/2025

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM

Called to order at 4.02pm, and announcements by Stephen Welch, Chair

Staff in attendance: (Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Fiona Johnson, Administrative Specialist; Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist)

Members Present: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Patten

Remote Participants: MacLeod, Paul, Oliver

Absent Members: Thornewill

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures:

Adoption of Agenda:

Motion: Pohl made a motion to approve the agenda. Approved by Pohl, Camp, Welch, Patten, Oliver

Carries unanimously

I. COMMENTS BY CHAIRMAN

Stephen Welch mentioned at the beginning of the meeting that the HDC takes comments from the public through an email address (HDC public comment at HDCPublicComment@nantucket-ma.gov). Comments are due by 8am the Monday prior to the meeting.

II. CONSENTS WITH CONDITIONS

1.	NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
	DuBois, Helen	5 Stone Post Way	Pool	74/80	SMRD

- Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, Patten

Motion to approve made by Oliver

Carries unanimously

III. OLD BUSINESS OR NEW BUSINESS WITH THE DATE

	NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
1.	Mark Howard	13A Willard St	Rev 11672; as-built skirt/AC	42.4.1/15.1	Thornewill Design

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten

Board Discussion: questions raised about the roofwalk height, concern that the condenser should not be located on the street side.

Suggestion to treat the AC unit like an enclosed shower space. Recommendation to use climbing hydrangea to screen the AC unit.

Motion: Ray Pohl made a motion to approve with an Exhibit A (adding climbing hydrangea along the front porch, extending the fascia, adding a horizontal band around the base, and keeping the existing trees until vegetation matures)

Carries 4-1(AM)

2. Nancy Breckenridge 170 Cliff Rd Guest House 41/68 MCA+

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: none

No concerns.

Motion: to approve as submitted by Angus.

Carries unanimously

3. Michelle Velle 10 Maxey Pond Rd Sports Court 40/100 Outside by Design

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none

Board Discussion: slide closer to the house. Should sink down minimum of 4'.

Motion: Angus made a motion to approve with an Exhibit A by moving the tennis court closer to the cabana, sink the court 4 feet down from the lowest elevation, and ensure the court does not get closer to the west property line

Carries unanimously

4. Mark Welshimer 3 New Mill St Addition 42.3.3/190 CWA

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten

Public Comment: Micky Rowland, et al suggested changing the mullion window to a single window.

Holly Backus: requested date of construction to be noted, dimensions and square footage of the addition to be included on the COA.

Motion: Val made motion to approve thru staff with date of construction on COA as infill in the OHD c. 2000 and the dimensions of the revised addition to be added to COA

Carries unanimously

5. Easy St LLC 4 Easy St Wind/door/dormer alterations 42.3.1/79 Susan Shepard

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Recused: Oliver

Public Comment: Micky Rowland et al, the front porch was not part of the original structure, and concerns were raised about the accuracy of the elevation drawing. Suggestions included adjusting the drawing to better reflect the actual roof and sidewall, along with a request for more detailed drawings and information about the window manufacturer. Holly Backus: recommended Option 2

Board Discussion: Suggestions included changing the multi-paned window to a six-over-six style, with concerns raised about trim and historical details. The removal of the porch was appreciated. Color discussions initially proposed white trim and sash, but after recommendations, the choice settled on Quaker Gray or Nantucket Gray for the siding with white trim. Modifications included adjusting the northeast porch roof to a shed roof, setting back the right-most portion of the first-floor porch, and ensuring windows match existing ones in size and materials.

Motion: Abby made a motion to approve with Exhibit A (adjusting the northeast porch roof to a shed roof, setting back the right-most portion of the first-floor porch, and ensuring that windows match existing ones in size and materials and to be TDL. For the color scheme, the motion suggests choosing either Quaker Gray or Nantucket Gray for the siding, retaining white trim, and potentially adopting a monotone approach).

Carries unanimously

6. Kinney 7 Delaney Rd New dwelling 41/128 R Newman

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul

Board Discussion: Roof needs to be in front of dormer; drop one window where there are 7 windows. Needs to get stepped back so that it is in line with the middle section; get rid of shingle space.

Motion: Ray made a motion to approve with an Exhibit A moving the dormer back so all in one plane; remove on the middle windows; make windowsills lower to fill in more of dormer.

Carries unanimously

7. Kinney 7 Delaney Rd Solar Array 41/128 R Newman

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten

No concerns

Motion: Angus made a motion to approve as submitted.

Carries unanimously

8. Scimone 4 Wood Hollow Rd New dwelling 72/16 R Newman

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul; Recused: Oliver

Public Comment: Linda Williams concerns - The lot lacks any existing screening, and the proposed plantings are unlikely to grow tall enough quickly, leaving the lot completely open. The building is oversized in comparison to neighboring structures, measuring 28 feet in height and approximately 70 feet in width, with eaves aligning with nearby buildings but presenting a full two-story mass. Design concerns center on the three large, flush dormers facing the street, which are a typical for the area and contribute significantly to the perceived scale. To reduce verticality and better integrate with the neighborhood, it was suggested to extend the porch around the front of the middle section, reduce the overall length and height of the building, and revise the dormer design.

Board Discussion: The design was viewed as a departure from the surrounding cottage-style homes, with concerns that the three flush dormers created a “condo effect.” Simplification, reduced scale, and greater differentiation in massing were recommended, along with a faster step-down in the structure. While the wraparound porch was appreciated, window proportions were seen as problematic, with similar sizes used across differing massing. Suggestions to reduce scale included making dormers smaller, dropping the eave line, or both. The height was seen as excessive, and extending the porch was supported to lessen vertical impact. Overall, the structure was considered larger, taller, and busier than its neighbors, with a need for stronger visual hierarchy—potentially by dropping the middle or rear sections and breaking up the uniformity in the design.

Motion: Abby made a motion to hold for revisions.

Carries unanimously

9. Scimone 4 Wood Hollow Rd Cabana 72/16 R Newman

TRACK

10. Scimone 4 Wood Hollow Rd Pool 72/16 R Newman

TRACK

11. Surfside R.T. 16 Walsh St Re-site/demo/move 42.4.1/50 R Newman

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten, Oliver

Public Comment: Micky Rowland, et al- Recommended rotating the house to align with East Lincoln Street. Suggested slicing off part of the western gable.

Oliver Carr, property owner: argued that rotating the building would require major structural changes and that a full rotation would significantly compromise the functionality of the living spaces.

Board Discussion: concerns were raised about the house not aligning with the street and the presence of multiple French doors facing it, which some felt were too prominent. Suggestions included adjusting roof lines and porch configurations to better integrate with the streetscape. Additional feedback focused on the overall massing and placement of the structure on the lot, emphasizing the need for a more context-sensitive approach.

Motion: Abby made a motion to hold for revisions.

Carries unanimously.

12. Dean Lampe 5 Gray Ave New dwelling 67/320 Dean Lampe

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Recused: Oliver

Board Discussion: Several members expressed appreciation for the design improvements, with one noting the building’s attractive appearance, balance with vegetation, and appropriate massing. Joe and Angus both mentioned the absence of floor plans but acknowledged the positive changes. Angus appreciated the comprehensive site plan and felt the stretched massing improved spacing between houses, though he raised concerns about the alignment of the left-side gable and the visual impact of the inset porch, suggesting more traditional Nantucket massing transitions.

Motion: Abby made a motion to approve contingent on shifting the secondary left gable and connector 2 feet to refine the structures.

Carries unanimously.

13. Dean Lampe 5 Gray Ave Shed 67/320 Dean Lampe

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Recused: Oliver

No concerns

Motion: Connie made a motion to approve as submitted.

Carries unanimously.

14. Dean Lampe 5 Gray Ave Pool 67/320 Dean Lampe
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Recused: Oliver

No concerns

Motion: Connie made a motion to approve as submitted (pool not to be visible at time of inspection and no grade change from existing).
Carries unanimously.

15. Vestal Nantucket LLC 85 Vestal St Main house revs 56/252 JB Studio

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: none

Public Comment: Linda Williams raised concerns - The project faces opposition from neighboring properties and lacks a surveyed site plan. It involves substantial earthworks to level the site, with previously proposed retaining walls now removed. Additionally, there are concerns about the visibility and scale of the proposed structure.

Board Discussion: Camp appreciated the changes but expressed concerns about the guest cottage and hardscaping. Val Oliver welcomed the house being moved back but requested more details on the retaining walls. Connie Patten and Angus MacLeod focused on discussing grade changes and building volumes. Meanwhile, Ray Pohl recommended further revisions and emphasized the need for a surveyed plan.

Motion: Abby made a motion to hold for significant changes and a surveyed plan. If not included than will not be reviewed.

16. Vestal Nantucket LLC 85 Vestal St Guest house 56/252 JB Studio

TRACK

17. Vestal Nantucket LLC 85 Vestal St Cabana 56/252 JB Studio

TRACK

18. Vestal Nantucket LLC 85 Vestal St Pool 56/252 JB Studio

TRACK

19. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Mixed Use – Lot A, building 2 68/9 LFW

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

Board Discussion: Board members expressed overall satisfaction with the latest revisions, particularly appreciating the change from gable-forward to eave-forward orientation, which they felt greatly improved the design. The clear graphics and site plan were praised for effectively differentiating the three lots and making the development feel less like one large block. While members had few concerns about the current building, there were notes for future phases—specifically, avoiding uniform building heights to prevent a monolithic appearance. Ray suggested changing all second-floor B windows to larger A windows to reduce shingled wall space and modifying the porch roof pitch to allow for a full-sized matching window above the entry. These proposed changes were accepted and included in a motion to approve the design with those adjustments.

Motion: Angus made a motion to approve through Exhibit A with B windows to A windows on the second floor; change portico pitch to 6/12; change to A window on W elevation.

Carries unanimously.

20. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Lot A Hardscape 68/9 LFW

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

No concerns

Motion: Joe made a motion to approve as submitted.

Carries unanimously.

21. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Duplex- Lot B, building 1 68/9 LFW

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

No concerns

Motion: Angus made a motion to approve as submitted.

Carries unanimously.

22. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Mixed Use- Lot B, building 2 68/9 LFW

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

Board Discussion: The main concern raised was that the east-facing door on the front street (Toomb's Court) feels more like a secondary or back door rather than a proper front entrance, which diminishes its presence. Although the building's scale was appreciated, the small porch and simple pent roof over the door contribute to this perception, especially since the area in front appears to be just asphalt, offering little screening or visual softness. It was suggested that the porch be redesigned with real columns and made wider to give the entrance

more prominence and a welcoming feel, fitting its role as a retail or office space. The group agreed this adjustment could be managed through staff review as a formal exhibit A.

Motion: Angus made a motion to approve with an Exhibit A with East porch extends South with 1' of the South gable with posts resembling each other.

Carries unanimously.

23. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Lot B Hardscape 68/9 LFW
Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

No concerns

Motion: Angus made a motion to approve as submitted.

Carries unanimously.

24. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Duplex- Lot C, building 1 68/9 LFW
Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

No concerns.

Motion: Joe made a motion to approve as submitted.

Carries unanimously.

25. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Mixed Use-Lot C, building 2 68/9 LFW
Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver

Board Discussion: Joe Paul noted the building's height closely matched Lot B Building 2, while Abby Camp recommended lowering the height to avoid uniformity. Angus MacLeod criticized the minimal setback of the front door and the building's resemblance to neighboring structures, a concern shared by Connie Patten, who emphasized the need for more variation. Ray Pohl suggested three specific changes: reducing the building's height, removing a small single-story protrusion from the front gable, and swapping B windows for larger A windows to minimize shingle exposure.

Motion: Abby made a motion to hold for revisions.

Carries unanimously.

26. 1 Toombs Ct LLC 1 Toombs Court Lot C Hardscape 68/9 LFW
Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver
TRACK

IV. NEW BUSINESS 8/26/2025

1.	NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
----	------	---------	---------------	------------	----------------

1.	ACKkoda LLC	42 Shimmo Pond Rd	Rev 12633; color change	43/126	Botticelli & Pohl Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Oliver, Patten; Alternates: Paul; Agent: Pohl
----	-------------	-------------------	-------------------------	--------	---

No concerns

Motion: Val made the motion to approve as submitted.

Carries 4-1 (MacLeod- nay).

2.	Artist Assoc	8 Federal St	New second floor addition	42.3.1/172	EMDA
----	--------------	--------------	---------------------------	------------	------

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Camp, Oliver; Alternates: Paul, Patten

Public Comment: Micky Rowland, et al - expressed concerns regarding changes that could alter the building's historical character, criticizing the ridge placement and overall massing as inappropriate. They also highlighted issues with fenestration and proportions and specifically questioned the design of the cupola.

Board Discussion: suggested lowering the second-floor top plate height, adding horizontal structural elements, improving the building's proportions, and taking the historical context into account. The board recommended conducting further historical research, adjusting the building's proportions, reconsidering certain design elements, and ensuring the building's historical integrity is preserved.

Motion: Angus made a motion to hold for revisions.

Carries unanimously.

3. Dukes Road LLC 2 Dukes Rd Tennis pergola 41/187 Botticelli & Pohl
Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Paul, Patten; Recused: Oliver; Agent: Pohl
No concerns
Motion: Connie made a motion to approve as submitted.
Carries unanimously.

4. Dukes Road LLC 2 Dukes Rd Barn revisions 41/187 Botticelli & Pohl
Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Patten, Paul; Recused: Oliver; Agent: Pohl
No concerns
Motion: Connie made a motion to approve as submitted.
Carries unanimously.

5. Nant Conserv. Found. 220 Milestone Rd Hardscape 51/1 Gryphon Arch
Hold for representation
6. Shepard David 10A W Dover Rooftop solar 55.4.1/192 AckSmart
Hold for representation
7. Dylan Wallace 65 Polpis Rd Rooftop solar 43/13 Self
Hold for representation

Approve Minutes	August 5, 2025: CLG Minutes June 27,2025 Board: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Patten, Motion to approve made by Angus Carries 4-1 (Welch-nay)
	• Next HDC Meeting- September 9, 2025
Other Business	• Discussion on distinguishing between solid and veneer brick on chimneys and foundations. • Classification of street trees & vegetation mapping. • Review policy of move/demo hearings in relation to new dwellings and historic dwellings. • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demos and options for house moves. • Value of written submission and submission deadlines.

Adjournment: 8:01PM

Motion: Motion to adjourn made by Angus

Vote: Motion was passed by a unanimous vote 4-0