



HDC Minutes September 9, 2025; adopted September 30, 2025
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

Committee/Board/s	Historic District Commission (HDC) – New Business
Day, Date, and Time	Tuesday, September 9, 2025, at 4:00pm *HYBRID
Location / Address	COMMUNITY ROOM 4 FAIRGROUNDS ROAD & REMOTE PARTICIPATION VIA ZOOM

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Welch called the meeting to order at 4:01PM

Staff in Attendance:	Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Fiona Johnson, Administrative Specialist
Attending Members:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Patten, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill
Remote Participants:	Paul
Absent Members:	None
Late Arrivals:	Camp at 4:27 PM
Early Departures:	Camp at 5:45 PM

Motion to amend agenda by moving #31, 10 Angola, from consent agenda and hold per agent's request (MacLeod)

Voting: Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill, Paul; Alternates: none; Recused: Pohl, Oliver

Carries unanimously

I.COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION AND/OR VOTE

- Revised HDC Meeting Schedule July 29, 2025 – October 21, 2025
- HDC Meeting Schedule October 28, 2025 – January 27, 2026

Voting: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul

Motion to approve made by Oliver

Carries unanimously

II. CONSENTS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agenda</u>
1.	Susan Hutton 13153	4 Maine Ave	Fence/gate/patio	60.3.1/451	Ferrantella Landscaping VO
2.	Kay Jabren 13178	5 California Ave	Rev.12180- chg stair location	60.3.1/448	J. Martinson VO
3.	Thomas Fusaro 13181	6 Toombs Ct	Rooftop solar	68/155	ACK Smart VO
4.	Carl Keller 13182	22 Creek Ln	Rooftop solar	38/103	ACK Smart VO
5.	47C NFR Trust 13185	47C Nobadeer Farm	Addition and dormers	69/102.3	Botticelli & Pohl VO
6.	Erin Donohue 13205	26 Gosnold Rd	Addition	30/89	Botticelli & Pohl VO
7.	Michael Kramarz 13197	20 Cannonbury Ln	Fence/gate	74/14	Brian Lenane VO
8.	Greg Raith 13228	5 Sheep Common	Rev Studio dormer	54/278	LFW RP
9.	Klaus Kleinfeld 13172	13 Hawks Circle	Demo pool	73/49.1	George Berg RP
10.	36 Meadow View LLC 13210	36 Meadow View Dr	Shed	56/135	Self VO
11.	Fusaro, Riley 13199	8 Toombs Ct	Move house on	68/153.3	Val Oliver Design JP
12.	60 Burnell LLC 13211	60 Burnell St	Add/ revs	49.3.2/18	Botticelli & Pohl CT
13.	CNV Surf LLC 13184	68 Shawkemo Rd	Rev 12281; garage	44/5	Emeritus, LTD CT
14.	Janet Eyre 13162	18 Lindberg Ave	Addition to solar array	73.4.1/9	ACK Smart AM
15.	Maple Lane Trust 13190	3 Maple Ln	Shed	67/303	Brook Meerbergen CP
16.	Montgomery C & D 13198	88 Goldfinch Dr	Roof replacement	68/696	DTA CP
17.	Susan Engel 13191	106 Surfside Rd	Cottage addition	67/80	Normand Residential CP

18. Kathleen McIntosh 13112	8 Tom's Way	Addition	67/52	Structures Unltd	SW
19. David Bailey 13218	83 Sankaty Rd	Rev MH Deck	49/91.1	LFW	SW
20. John Welch Jr Tr 13222	3 Black Walnut	Demo Spa	48/1	LFW	SW
21. John Welch Jr Tr 13819	3 Black Walnut	Demo pool	48/1	LFW	SW
22. John Welch Jr Tr 13217	3 Black Walnut	Demo/move shed	48/1	LFW	SW
23. John Welch Jr Tr 13223	3 Black Walnut	Demo cabana	48/1	LFW	SW
24. Deborah Kenney 13173	1 Luff Rd	Patio door change	66/349	South NE Windows	AC
25. Brian Brill 13169	14 Stone Barn Way	Roof change	29/908	T & T Roofing	AC
26. Jen-Eric LLC 13176	26 N. Water St	Stairs/dormer	42.4.3/23	Chuck Lenhart	AC
27. Wallace 13188	35 Meadow View Dr	Shed mve off to 8 BayBerry Ln	51/131	Jeff Morash	AC
28. Jeff Morash 13189	8 Bayberry Ln	Shed mve on frm 35 Meadowview	67/72	Jeff Morash	AC
29. Tracey Grace 13194	211 Polpis Rd	Extend dormer	26/31	Val Oliver Design	AC
30. Brian Rice 13193	2 Reacher Ln	Addition	66/337	Chuck Lenhart	AC
31. Marcus Mignone 13201	10 Angola St	Hardscape	55.4.4/79	Val Olver Design	JP
32. Robert Blair 13226	16 Swift Rock Rd	Rev garage/apt	40/39	LFW	JP
33. Victoria Hanson 13229	3 Nichols Rd	Shed rotation	92.4/58	LFW	JP

Voting: Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill, Paul; Alternates: none; Recused: Pohl, Oliver

Motion to approve #1 - #30 and #32 - #33 made by MacLeod

Carries unanimously

10 Angola St was held, per applicant.

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	100R Wauwinet Trust 13206	100R Wauwinet Rd	Demo dwelling	11/24.3	Botticelli & Pohl VO	
	• Photos of existing dwelling to be added to the file.					
2.	Tom Kaza 13227	1 Whero Whero Ln	Pool	67/471	R Ande	RP
	• Pool not to be seen at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
3.	Matthew Manera 13170	15 Morey Ln	Pool/patio	73.3.1/38	Watersca	JP
	• Pool not to be seen at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
4.	Nantucki Madhe LLC 13231	15 Swift Rock Rd	Pool	40/72	Ryan Conway	CT
	• Pool not to be seen at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
5.	Nantucki Madhe LLC 13230	15 Swift Rock Rd	Relocate shed on site	40/72	Ryan Conway	CT
	• Confirm the minimum setback at the rear and side property lines for location.					
6.	Benjamin DeRuyter 13152	12 Acadamy Ln	Fence	42.4.3/87	Thornewill Design	AM
	• Type II fence to be on both sides of stair and along side stairs as shown in photo 11 of 11 Academy Lane across the street.					
7.	Browning/Allen 13151	69 Somerset Rd	Roof top solar	66/85	Cotuit Solar	AM
	• Maintain vegetation so solar is not visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity.					
8.	Nant Theatre 13158	5 N. Water St	Add dormers	42.4.2/88	EMDA	AM
	• Step dormers back a minimum of 12" behind walls below and lower fascia to window head casings.					
9.	Charles Paget 13183	33 Millbrook Rd	2 nd floor dormer addition	56/316	DTA	AM
	• Step dormers back a minimum of 12" behind walls below.					
10.	2 Cabot Lane, LLC 13179	2 Cabot Lane #1	Roof change MH	30/254.3	T & T Roofing	CP
	• Date of construction, c. 1888, Harriet H. Swain House built by James H. Gibbs to be written on the COA					
11.	Susan Parkin 13180	2A Cabot Lane #2	Roof change Cottage	30/254.2	T & T Roofing	CP
	• Date of construction, c. 1971 Phillips Cottage to be written on the COA					
12.	Victoria Hanson 13225	3 Nichols Rd	Hardscape pool	92.4/58	LFW	JP
	• Pool not to be seen at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					

Voting: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Recused: Pohl, Thornewill

Motion to approve made by Oliver

Carries unanimously

IV. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

Holly informed the commission that she is currently drafting the required Fiscal Year CLG report for Massachusetts Historical Commission. She informed the board that they have reviewed approximately 2100 COAS for the 2024-2025 Fiscal Year. Holly also reminded the commission of the

notations on the staff comments for the commissioners to reach out with any questions on Staff Comments. Angus had a question on the “historicness” of 72 Baxter Road regarding the Historic Determination application and how much of the building is historic within the island’s period of significance. Holly mentioned that the structure would be changed to remove the character-defining features. Val made a general comment; she misses Holly giving staff reports as its hard to remember all the information provided.

V. NEW BUSINESS 08/26/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Nant Conserv. Found. 13130	220 Milestone Rd	Hardscape	51/1	Gryphon Arch	AC

220 Milestone Road – Ethan Griffin presented the application addressing grading, hardscaping, decking, and hardscape. No concerns were raised by the commissioners.

Vote: Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill, Pohl; **Alternates:** Paul; **Recused:** Oliver
Motion to be approved as submitted
Carries unanimously

2.	Shepard David 13148	10A W Dover	Rooftop solar	55.4.1/192	AckSmart	AC
----	---------------------	-------------	---------------	------------	----------	----

10A West Dover (Rooftop Solar) –No concerns.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul; **Alternates:** Connie Patten; **Recused:** Oliver
Motion to be approved as submitted
Carries unanimously

3.	Dylan Wallace 13115	65 Polpis Rd	Rooftop solar	43/13	Self	VO
----	---------------------	--------------	---------------	-------	------	----

65 Polpis Road (Solar Project) – Commissioners expressed concerns about the number and placement of solar panels. Val Oliver noted panels were placed on the front, visible from Polpis Road, and felt there were an excessive number on the house. Angus MacLeod questioned whether the building was a primary dwelling despite being labeled secondary, raised concerns about solar guidelines regarding front-facing panels, and worried about north-facing panels. Ray Pohl agreed on the number of panels, acknowledged the low roof pitch might justify north-facing panels, but was concerned about visibility from Polpis Road. Stephen Welch suggested considering a ground-mounted array and potential agricultural solar options. Applicant Caroline Wallace cited

cost constraints as a farmer and mentioned a greenhouse in front that could provide screening. The board unanimously voted to hold the project for revisions, recommending removal of north- and front-facing panels, exploring ground arrays, and considering landscape screening.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Val Oliver, Connie Patten, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Joe Paul, Carrie Thornewill
Motion to be held for revision
Carries unanimously

VI. NEW BUSINESS 09/09/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Robert Hatcher 13171	72 Baxter Rd	Historic Determination	49/44	Botticelli & Pohl	AM

72 Baxter Road – Discussion centered on whether to grant a historic determination. Angus MacLeod expressed concerns, citing preservation planner input about prior structural changes and doubting the presence of a historic structure to protect. Ray Pohl supported granting the determination, noting that two-thirds of the building remains a single-story hip roof house and that altered buildings can still retain historic character. Holly Backus referenced a previous COA approving structural modifications. Val Oliver and others favored determination, emphasizing retention of original elements and the importance of preservation. The board approved the historic determination, finding the structure retains its historic character, with Angus dissenting.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornewill; **Agent:** Ray Pohl
Motion made Val Oliver approved as submitted.
Carries 4 – 1 (Angus MacLeod-nay)

2. Erik Carneal 13174 23 Golfview Dr Rev. 6776; 74sf addition 66/175 Botticelli & Pohl AC

23 Golfview Dr.— Bob Paladino highlighted key changes including the garage revised to a two-car layout, the north elevation now featuring two bays instead of one, and an overall height increase of 15–18 inches to 23 feet. Commissioners expressed concerns: Angus MacLeod noted issues with dormer setbacks, window proportions, increasing height, and preferred the previous design's symmetry. Abby felt the 23-foot height disrupted proportions, with too much roof above the dormer, favoring the earlier design aligned with guidelines. Ray Pohl preferred the prior design, finding the new one busier and concerned about six-light window proportions. Stephen Welch was troubled by the atypical roof pitch and felt the height increase did not improve the design, favoring earlier four-pitch drawings for their traditional look. The board unanimously voted to hold the project for revisions, requesting the applicant's address proportions, height, and design elements.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Joe Paul; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten; **Agent:** Ray Pohl
Motion made Joe Poul approved as submitted
Carries unanimously

3. Melissa Druley 13168 10 Candle House Ln As-built clr chg- **VIEW** 55.4.4/51 Melissa Druley
Hold for Representation

4. 111B Old South Rd, LLC 111B Old South Rd Commercial storage building 68/167 Emeritus, LTD
13175

111 Old South Road – Commissioners had no significant concerns, and no detailed comments were made.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Joe Paul, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten
Motion made Val Oliver approved as submitted
Carries unanimously

5. Stephen Burbage 13186 47 Quidnet Rd MH addition 21/143 Mellows & Paladino AM

47 Quidnet Road (Main House) – Bob Paladino outlined key changes including massing adjustments, window modifications (two-over-two replacing six-over-six), addition of two dormers, and pulling out some masses by about three feet. Commissioners generally found the design acceptable but raised concerns: Ray Pohl was generally okay but noted some design issues; Val Oliver and Abby both expressed concern about the skylights and felt the massing remained similar with minimal changes; Angus MacLeod was concerned about the east-facing dormer, plate glass window, window proportions, and horizontal panes in the flush dormer; Stephen Welch noted minimal visibility with no major concerns but suggested minor revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten, Joe Paul
Motion to hold for revisions made by Angus MacLeod with dormer top plate window header relationship and fenestration revisions.
Carries unanimously

6. Stephen Burbage 13187 47 Quidnet Rd Guest house 21/143 Mellows & Paladino AM

47 Quidnet Road (Guest House) – Bob Paladino outlined key changes: garage revised to a two-car layout, north elevation now with two bays, and overall height increased by 15–18 inches to 23 feet. Commissioners expressed several concerns. MacLeod noted issues with dormer setbacks, window proportions, increased height, and preferred the symmetry of the previous design. Abby felt the new 23-foot height disrupted proportions, added too much roof above the dormer, and was less in keeping with guidelines. Pohl preferred the previously approved design, found the new version busier, and questioned six-light window proportions. Welch raised concerns about the atypical roof pitch and felt the height change detracted from the design; he preferred the traditional appearance of the earlier four-pitch version.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten, Joe Paul
Motion made by Angus MacLeod to hold for revision
Carries unanimously

7.	35 MVD, LLC 13196	35 Meadow View Dr	Main House addition	56/131	LDA Architects
----	-------------------	-------------------	---------------------	--------	----------------

35 Meadow View Drive – Commissioners expressed concerns regarding massing and architectural elements. Pohl noted issues with a flush dormer joining two gables without setback and two large skylights. Abby agreed about skylights but felt overall massing was consistent with existing. MacLeod raised concerns about the east-facing dormer, plate glass window on the north elevation, and east-facing balcony. Oliver cited over-fenestration on the south (pond-facing) elevation and the large chimney. Welch had no significant concerns due to limited visibility.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornehill, Connie Patten, Joe Paul
Motion made by Angus MacLeod to hold for revisions adding the previous proposed (9/9/25) with the revisions and include a planting Buffer.

Carries unanimously

8.	Brandon Eldridge 13192	26 Arlington St	Solar addition	76.1.3/281	Isaken Solar	AC
----	------------------------	-----------------	----------------	------------	--------------	----

Hold for representation

9.	100R Wauwinet Trust 13204	100R Wauwinet Rd	New dwelling	11/24.3	Botticelli & Pohl	CT
----	---------------------------	------------------	--------------	---------	-------------------	----

100R Wauwinet Road – Commissioners reviewed the proposed new construction. Carrie recommended using mutton windows and advised against clear glass for a new build. Abby felt the hip roof over the front door was out of place and expressed concern about the five ganged windows drawing attention. Angus MacLeod was concerned about the west elevation facing the harbor, recommending mutton windows, kick panels, and simplified fenestration. Stephen Welch focused on the potential impact of glass coatings on water-facing windows. The applicant noted the new structure would be slightly taller than the existing 27-foot building and aimed to maintain a similar window design.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Carrie Thornehill, Angus MacLeod, Joe Poul, Connie Pattern,
Motion made by Abby Camp to hold for revisions, adding muttons and a VIEW.

Carries unanimously

10.	Steven Geldart 13203	6 Cherry St	Historic Determination	55/386	Val Oliver Design	CT
-----	----------------------	-------------	------------------------	--------	-------------------	----

6 Cherry Street – Val Oliver noted the house dates circa 1940, possibly as early as 1909, with a sewer hookup in 1974 suggesting conversion from bar to house. Existing windows are not original; the proposal includes changing two side windows (mitigated by a hedge), rear newer Marvin SDL windows, and adding a six-light bathroom window. Angus MacLeod requested clarification on the historic date and more information on the structure's origin. Holly Backus expressed concerns about SDL vs. TDL window types and sought confirmation on manufacturer details. The board discussed confirming the historic character and verifying the original construction date.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Joe Paul, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornehill, Connie Patten; **Agent:** Val Oliver
Motion to approve made by Joe Paul adding the date of construction.

Carries unanimously

11.	Steven Geldart 13202	6 Cherry St	Replace 2 win/add 1window	55/386	Val Oliver Design	CT
-----	----------------------	-------------	---------------------------	--------	-------------------	----

6 Cherry Street (Window Replacement) – Holly Backus requested clarification on SDL vs. TDL window types and confirmation of manufacturer details. Val Oliver clarified that existing windows are Marvin SDL, and the proposed replacements will match the same Marvin type. The project includes replacing two side windows and adding a six-light bathroom window. Commissioners had no significant concerns, confirming the new windows match the existing Marvin windows with the Nantucket profile.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Joe Paul, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod; **Alternates:** Carrie Thornehill, Connie Patten; **Agent:** Val Oliver
Motion made, Angus MacLeod hold for revision

Carries unanimously

12.	Stan Chervin 13200	4 Meadow View Dr	As-built door color VIEW	56/149	Sanne Payne
-----	--------------------	------------------	---------------------------------	--------	-------------

4 Meadow View Dr- no concerns with color. Not in the OHD.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill; Alternates: Connie Patten, Joe Paul
Motion to approve as-built color and waive the as-built fee made by Ray Pohl.
Carries 4-1 (Angus MacLeod- nay)

13. Hackel, Michael 13232	15 Deer Run	Pool hardscape	57/22	Atlantic Landscaping CP
----------------------------------	--------------------	-----------------------	--------------	--------------------------------

15 Deer Run – The application for a pool and fire pit was reviewed. The features are located approximately 250 feet from the road, behind existing foliage, and not visible from the street. Joe Paul initially flagged the application due to the pool's location on the side of the house. Upon review, commissioners found no concerns, nothing, no visibility and no change in grade from prior existing conditions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten; Alternates: Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul
Motion made by Val Oliver to approve with the pool not to be visible time of inspection and in perpetuity. No changes to grade from prior existing prior to time of application.
Carries unanimously

14. Dusscou, Zach 13220	41 Macy Ln	Roof top solar	68/34	Ack Smart	CT
--------------------------------	-------------------	-----------------------	--------------	------------------	-----------

Hold for representation.

15. Perpetuwhale Invest LLC 13224	6 Stone Post Wy	Hardscape fence pool	74/38.1	LFW	JP
--	------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------	------------	-----------

Hardscape, Fence, and Pool – Linda presented the project, including a deer fence. Joe Paul initially raised concerns about the fence's location, advocating for it to be placed behind the privet hedge to reduce visibility. The board unanimously decided the deer fence must be located inside the hedge, not on the street side.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Joe Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten
Motion to approve though Exhibit A with the fence on the inside of the hedge made by Angus MacLeod.
Carries unanimously

16. 12 Oak Hollow Nom Tr13221	12 Oak Hollow Ln	Move off/ demo	56/128	Topham Design
--------------------------------------	-------------------------	-----------------------	---------------	----------------------

12 Oak Hollow Ln – Arthur Reade and Joe Topham presented the application. All board members confirmed they had reviewed the application in advance, with no concerns raised prior to the meeting.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Val Oliver, Ray Pohl, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten; Alternates: Joe Paul, Carrie Thornewill
Motion made, Val Oliver approved as submitted

Motion to approve August 12, 2025, minutes made by Angus MacLeod
Voting: Stephen Welch, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill
Carries 3-2 (Welch and Oliver- nay)

Motion to adjourn made by Oliver at 5:54PM
Carries unanimously