



Approved HDC Minutes August 19, 2025; adopted October 7, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes August 26, 2025

2 Fairgrounds Road

Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

Staff: Cathy Flynn, Holly Backus and Fiona Johnson

Meeting called to order at 4:02 pm by Stephen Welch

Attending: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten and Thornewill

Remote: Paul

Early departures: Welch at 6:00 PM

Oliver made the motion to approve the agenda.

Voting: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Oliver, Pohl

I. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION AND/OR VOTE

- Discussion and view of window samples:
- Bob Leahy of Norwood Windows provided a wood window sample that was insulated true-putty. He explained it's a n 5/8" muntin with a beveled profile, like an old Nantucket window. The meeting rail is 1- 5/16". There are two different colors for the spacer – white & black. It has a screen attachment and inset storm panel.
- The Chair acknowledged that the board is not in the business of promoting one company over another however, it would be nice to have a visual reference in the future of what is an acceptable "Nantucket" window, both TDL & SDL.
- Matt MacEachern– showed a Muntin Window that's wood, SDL, with "Nantucket Profile" with no spacer. The example was shown for the pending 14 Silver Street revision and this would help avoid triple track.

II. SIGNS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Zero India, LLC	Zero India Street	Projecting Sign Entrance 1 (Marissa Collections)	42.3.1/130	The Sign Lady
	• Recommends approval subject to the submission of an updated application noting the lighting details and location of the sign bracket, and the removal of all window decals, which must be applied for under a separate application if desired.				
2.	South Water Realty, Inc.	21 S. Water Street	Projecting Sign (Julie's Kitchen)	42.4.2/102	The Sign Lady
	• Recommends approval as submitted subject to the chalkboard sign being removed.				
3.	Nant. Islands Land Bank	22 Broad Street	Projecting Sign (Land Bank)	42.4.2/34	Eleanor Antonetti
	• Recommends approval as submitted subject to the removal of the fence sign.				
4.	POATNE	Tom Nevers East	Directional/Traffic sign	NA	Bert Johnson
	• Recommends that the application be held for a complete application and a master sign plan of the neighborhood.				

Voting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul

Motion to approve recommendations of the SAC made by Camp.

Carries unanimously

III. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

Angus had a question for Holly about her comments for 14 Silver St regarding the muntin profile and asked what she thought about the window presented. Holly said having the window sample visual was beneficial for the board's review. The building is c.1834 and the window survey received during the addition review indicated many of the existing windows within the main structure were replaced (vinal clad), however the ones on the second floor were original and made of wood. Those original muntin profiles were thin. Holly mentioned about 25 Hussey St – the structure is Individually Significant structure from c.1733, but the ell with the proposed fenestration changes were done in 2012. And because of that information, she didn't have many concerns about the fenestration changes proposed on the ell, as they were not on the main

block of the 300+ year old dwelling. CLG minutes will be submitted to the commission for an upcoming agenda for approval. NAPC CAMP webinar starts this week and highly recommends signing up, as the meeting video and documents are available on-demand.

IV. OLD BUSINESS 08/05/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Nicole & Joel Whidden- 11541	11 Davis Street	New dwelling	82/75	Emeritus
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten</i>				<i>Last heard 7/22/2025</i>

No concerns

Motion to approve made by Oliver.

Motion carries unanimously.

V. OLD BUSINESS 8/19/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Robert L Ray Trust 12911	25 Hussey St	VIEW MH Addition	42.3.4/25	BPC
	• <i>Commissioners: MacLeod (Acting Chair), Pohl, Oliver, Camp, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill; Agent: Paul</i>				<i>Last heard 7/29/2025</i>

Board members discussed the limited visibility of the changes, the alignment and style of the new doors and transom, and the overall classical appropriateness of the design. While some concerns were raised about the modern appearance of the sliding doors and the detailing, most board members felt the changes were acceptable due to the limited visibility and the fact that the work was on a newer addition.

Pohl made a motion to approve utilizing the existing 12-over-12 windows on the north elevation and to be repurposed on the east elevation, closest to Hussey Street.

Carries 4-1 (Camp- nay)

2.	Carr Surfside Realty Tr 12949	16 Walsh Street	Re-site/partial demo/renov	42.4.1/50	R. Newman
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 8/05/2025</i>

The board discussion on 16 Walsh St centered on the applicant's revised design, which included rotating the building, adding a one-story element, and modifying windows. Board members expressed ongoing concerns about the building's proximity to Walsh Street, the overall massing, and the design of the pediment over the front door. Suggestions included moving the building further from the street, simplifying the massing, and removing the pediment.

Pohl made a motion to hold application for a revisions

Motion carries unanimously.

3.	Branden Scimone 12945	4 Wood Hollow Road	New Dwelling	72/16	R. Newman
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul; Recused: Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 8/05/2025</i>

The board discussion focused on the applicant's revisions, which included lowering the building's height, reducing its width, and removing some windows and a second-level porch. While board members and abutters appreciated these improvements, they continued to express concerns about the building's overall massing, the lack of a one-story additive element, the design and integration of the porch, the amount of glazing, and the proposed color scheme. Suggestions were made to further lower the height, better integrate the porch to unify the building's appearance, and reconsider the color and fenestration.

Camp made a motion to hold application for a revisions.

Motion carries unanimously.

4.	Branden Scimone 12943	4 Wood Hollow Road	Cabana	72/16	R. Newman
Track					
5.	Branden Scimone 12942	4 Wood Hollow Road	Pool	72/16	R. Newman
Track					
6.	Beach Bucket LLC 12893	14 Silver Street	Rev 1178; view	55.4.1/182	Emeritus LTD
	• <i>Commissioners: MacLeod (Acting Chair), Pohl, Oliver, Camp, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul</i>				<i>Last heard 7/29/2025</i>

No concerns

Oliver made a motion to approve the application as submitted.

Motion carries unanimously.

7.	Gilbey, Mason 13013	54R Union Street	Garage to dwelling	55.1.4/32.1	Val Oliver Design
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 8/12/2025</i>

Board members discussed the scale and design of the porch, suggesting it could be larger or hipped for better proportion and symmetry, and considered the impact of parking and site constraints on the design. There was also discussion about the building's height, eave details, and door proportions. While some members felt the two-story mass was out of scale for a secondary structure and suggested a wrap-around porch, the applicant explained the limitations of the site.

Paul made a motion to approve with the 12-light doors be changed to four-light doors to better match the windows.

Carries 4-1 (MacLeod- nay)

8.	Darrell Ferguson 12852	42 Chuck Hollow Road	As-Built retaining wall	75/65.1	Self
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul; Alternates: Patten, Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 7/15/2025</i>

The board decided to hold for a site view before making a final decision and asked the applicant not to make further changes until after the view.

Camp made a motion to hold the application for a View.

Motion carries unanimously.

9.	9 Hulbert Ave. RE Tr- 12979	9 Hulbert Avenue	Addition/renovation	29.2/.3	Val Oliver Design
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 8/12/2025</i>

Board members discussed whether the proposed changes appropriately differentiated the addition from the historic structure, with suggestions to further drop the ridge and eave or use a flush shed dormer. There was consensus that a simpler approach, more in keeping with the historic massing as shown in old photos, would be preferable.

MacLeod made a motion to approve the previous, simpler submission that better matched the historic character and massing of the original structure.

Motion carries unanimously.

10.	Scrambled, LLC 12926	47 Hulbert Avenue	Rev. 12516; omit chim/fenest	29/15	BPC
	• <i>Commissioners: MacLeod (Acting Chair), Pohl, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Agent: Paul</i>				<i>Last heard 7/29/2025</i>

The board discussion focused on revisions to the design, including restoring some windows to their original size, bringing back a chimney, narrowing a mass to its existing size, and replacing a picture window with three double-hung windows. The main point of discussion was the style of the sliding doors on the north (ocean) elevation, with board members agreeing that four-light sliders would be most appropriate to match the house's character.

Camp made a motion to approve the project with the condition that the sliding doors on the north elevation be four-light units.

Motion carries unanimously.

11.	1 Toombs Court, LLC 12913	1 Toombs Court VIEW	Duplex- Lot A, building 1	68/9	Linda Williams
	• <i>Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Recused: Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 7/29/2025</i>

The board discussion focused on revisions to the duplex's window placement and overall massing. Board members appreciated the changes but suggested that the first-floor windows on the north elevation should be spaced further apart, rather than aligned with the second floor, to provide better visual balance. There were also concerns about the building's height and the overall density of the development.

Thornewill made a motion to approve with the first-floor windows on the north elevation remain as originally submitted, and the second-floor windows as revised, to achieve the desired splaying effect.

Carries 4-1 (Camp- nay)

12.	1 Toombs Court, LLC 12912	1 Toombs Court VIEW	Mixed use- Lot A, building 2	68/9	Linda Williams
	• <i>Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten; Recused: Oliver</i>				<i>Last heard 7/29/2025</i>

The board discussion focused on revisions to the design, including removing a non-functional front door, adding a window, and adjusting the dormer to avoid intersecting the gable. While some board members felt the changes were appropriate, there were concerns about the overall

density of the development and the visual impact of having two gable-forward buildings in line along the streetscape. The board suggested that making one of the buildings eave-forward would help soften the appearance and provide better variety.

Pohl made a motion to hold for revisions to explore this design change.

Motion carries unanimously.

13. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12934	1 Toombs Court	Hardscape- Lot A	68/9	Linda Williams
TRACK				
14. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12914	1 Toombs Court	Duplex- Lot B, building 1	68/9	Linda Williams

The board discussion focused on concerns about the lack of variation in size, massing, and roof heights among the buildings in the development. Board members suggested that more variety and better organization of the application materials were needed, and that perspective renderings would help them better understand the visual impact of the project. While the building itself was generally considered appropriate, the board was concerned about the overall density and uniformity of the site.

MacLeod made a motion to hold application for a revisions.

Motion carries unanimously.

15. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12915	1 Toombs Court	Mixed use- Lot B, building 2	68/9	Linda Williams
TRACK				
16. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12932	1 Toombs Court	Hardscape- Lot B	68/9	Linda Williams
TRACK				
17. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12909	1 Toombs Court	Duplex- Lot C building 1	68/9	Linda Williams
TRACK				
18. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12910	1 Toombs Court	Mixed use- Lot C, building 2	68/9	Linda Williams
TRACK				
19. 1 Toombs Court, LLC 12936	1 Toombs Court	Hardscape- Lot C	68/9	Linda Williams
TRACK				

20. Boulevard Prop Grp 10839	20 Main Street	Pool	73.3.1/50	Linda Williams
-------------------------------------	-----------------------	------	-----------	----------------

- Commissioners: Pohl(Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: none

Last heard 5/27/2025

Oliver made a motion to approve the proposal with conditions that vegetation and screening be maintained to ensure the pool is not visible at the time of inspection and thereafter and the fence to be NTW picket fence.

Carries 3-2 (Camp, MacLeod- nay)

21. Ten Straight Wharf, LLC 12355	10 Straight Wharf	Rev. 10021; addition	42.3.1/137	Linda Williams
--	--------------------------	----------------------	------------	----------------

- Commissioners: Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul

Last heard 7/08/2025

Oliver made a motion to approve the application as submitted, with the condition that the south addition be moved back another two feet, for a total of four feet.

Carries 3-2 (Camp, MacLeod- nay)

22. Arthur Reade 12964	19 Monomoy Road	Alterations	54/260	Gryphon Architects
-------------------------------	-----------------	-------------	--------	--------------------

- Commissioners: Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: Thornewill

Last heard 8/12/2025

MacLeod made the motion to approve the application as submitted.

Motion carries unanimously.

23. 3 Pops Ln Holding Tr 12896	3 Pops Lane	Rev. 11088; re-site/reno GH	60.2.4/64.1	MCA+
---------------------------------------	--------------------	-----------------------------	-------------	------

- Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Oliver, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul

Last heard 8/05/2025

Camp made a motion to approve the application Option C for the guest house renovation at 3 Pops Lane, selecting a location that tucks the guest house behind the main house to minimize visibility and preserve the character of the area.

Motion carries unanimously.

24. 3 Pops Ln Holding Tr 12895	3 Pops Lane	Garage	60.2.4/64.1	MCA+
---------------------------------------	--------------------	--------	-------------	------

- Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Oliver, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul

Last heard 7/29/2025

MacLeod made the motion to approve the garage as cited in option C of the guest house application.

Motion carries unanimously.

25. 3 Pops Ln Holding Tr 12897	3 Pops Lane	Pool	60.2.4/64.1	MCA+
Commissioners: <i>Pohl (Acting Chair), Oliver, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul</i>				<i>Last heard 7/29/2025</i>

Board members agreed that the pool should be located between or behind structures to minimize visibility and preserve the open landscape, with the architecture providing the primary screening so that the pool is not visible from public ways. The consensus was that the final location of the pool should be determined after the main structures are built, with a staked-out footprint to assess visibility. The applicant agreed to stake out the pool location after construction and return to the board for further review.

Camp made a motion to hold application for a revisions.

Motion carries unanimously.

26. Vestal Nantucket, LLC 12439	85 Vestal Street	New dwelling	56/252	JB Studio
Commissioners: <i>Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Welch</i>				<i>Last heard 8/05/2025</i>

The board discussion focused on the overall scale, siting, and grading of the proposed development. The board and several members of the public raised concerns about the amount of development on the site, the need for a surveyed site plan and cross-section to show how the project would follow the natural grade, and the potential impact of retaining walls and hardscaping on the neighborhood's rural character. Some board members felt the project was still too large for the lot and suggested downsizing or simplifying the program. Others acknowledged improvements in the new orientation and configuration but emphasized the need for more detailed information on grading and site sections.

MacLeod made a motion to hold application for a revisions.

Motion carries unanimously.

27. Vestal Nantucket, LLC 12442	85 Vestal Street	Garage	56/252	JB Studio
TRACK				
28. Vestal Nantucket, LLC 12441	85 Vestal Street	Cabana	56/252	JB Studio
TRACK				
29. Vestal Nantucket, LLC 12440	85 Vestal Street	Pool	56/252	JB Studio
TRACK				

Camp made a motion to hold the Minutes from July 1, July 8 and July 29 till next week.

Motion to adjourn at 8:27PM made by Camp

Motion carries unanimously.