



HDC Minutes August 12, 2025; Adopted September 9, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, August 12, 2025

4 Fairgrounds Road and Remote Participation via Zoom
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-chair), Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver, Angus McLeod
Associate Commissioners: Connie Patten, Carrie Thornewill

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Welch called the meeting to order at Tuesday, August 12, 2025, at 4:02 pm
Motion to approve the agenda (MacLeod); Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul
Carries unanimously.

Staff in Attendance:	Fiona Johnson , Administrative Specialist, Cathy Flynn , Land Use Specialist, Holly Backus , Preservation Planner
Attending Members:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Joe Paul, Carrie Thornewill
Remote Participants:	
Absent Members:	Ray Pohl
Late Arrivals:	
Early Departures:	

I. CONSENT

II. CONSENTS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Diane Archer- 12962	1 Weetemo Road	Shed	15/57	Thornewill Design AC
2. Daniel Murphy- 12972	8 Golfview Drive	Rev 12555; massing/fenestration	66/192	Gryphon Architects AC
3. Allens. LLC- 12968	2 Allens Lane	Garage apartment	55/234.7	Normand Residential AC
4. Krumper Family- 12971	5 Davis Lane	Front door color chg	82/72	Val Oliver Design CP
5. Krumper Family- 12970	5 Davis Lane	Arbor style change	82/72	Val Oliver Design CP
6. Debra Bechtold- 12981	5 Manatook Way	Roof change	73/83	Vasil Marinov CP
7. Shellacked- 12984	4 Gay Street	Arbor/gate- As-built	42.3.4/19	Val Oliver Design CP
8. Dick Maxamillian 12991	8 Bluebird Lane	Shed	68/593	Bob Savitz CP
9. Born Wild, LLC 12987	5A Rosebud Lane	Shed	68/783.2	Emeritus, LTD CP
10. Leonie White 13038	17 Cynthia Lane	Enclose rear deck	67/462	Self VO
11. Aaron Mcauley 13002	14A Equator Drive	Enclose porch	66/234.1	Nate Barber VO
12. Jonathan Brightbill 12999	3 Towaddy Lane	Shed	49.3.2/14.2	Structures Unltd VO
13. John Carroll 13000	12 Baltimore Street	Shed	60.24/75	Structures Unltd VO
14. Dean Lampe 12998	3 Manatook Way	Rev. 11804; chg hip to shed	73/82	Self VO
15. John Sully 12965	47 Pleasant Street	Roof change	55/17.1	T & T Roofing
16. Nancy Breckenridge- 12978	170 Cliff Road	Garage studio	41/68	MCA+ AM
17. Clay Street Dev. 13050	44 Skyline Drive	Move off from 70 Washington St	79/990	Structures RP
18. Kathleen McIntosh 13049	8 Tom Way	Move-on from 44 Skyline	67/52	Structures RP
19. Bryan Ryder 13020	16 Mary Ann	Drive Roof top solar	68/445	SunWind RP
20. Margaret Lovett 13012	18 Tom Way	Window replacement	67/44	Val Oliver Design RP
21. Serendipity LLC 13018	77 Pocomo	Basement walkout/addition	15/6	Emeritus LTD VO
22. CBM Polpis Trust 13045	275 Polpis Rd	Demo/shed	25/16	Emeritus LTD VO
23. Nantucket Bey LLC 13046	1 Shawkemo Hills	Fens/ new porch	27/42	Emeritus LTD VO
24. Land Bank 13026	50 Old South Rd	Shed	68/68.1	Eleanor Antonietti VO
25. Mickey Rowland 12995	18 Mt. Vernon Street	Driveway apron	55.4.4/32.1	Normand Residential JP
26. Helen Lynch 13004	43 Warren's Landing Road	Color change- MH	38/49	Normand Residential JP
27. Helen Lynch 13003	43 Warren's Landing Road	Color change- cabana	38/49	Normand Residential JP
28. Helen Lynch 13001	43 Warren's Landing Rd	Color change- shed	38/49	Normand Residential JP
29. Alexander Woodley 12989	3 Newtown Court	Fence	55/210.2	Val Oliver Design JP

HDC Minutes August 12, 2025; Adopted September 9, 2025

30. Rowland/ Hackel 13035	15 Deer Run Rd	Reno Dwelling	57/22	LFW	JP
31. 55 Orange LLC 13054	55 Orange St	Renew COA- Shed	42.3.2/98	Permits Plus	SW
32. 11 Pine Street Realty Tr 13048	11 Pine St	Rev window change	42.3.3/24.1	WAPD	SW
33. The Peterson Trust 13051	8 Jefferson Ave	Rev 12239 addition	29/49	Botticelli & Pohl	SW
34. Thrones/ Hackel 13030	51 N Liberty Rd	Historic Determination	41/500	LFW	JP
35. Conservation Found 13008	Coatue	Historic Determination	16/5	Val Oliver	
36. Lasota Family 12992	8 Maple Lane	Garage door color change	67/303.4	Val Oliver Design	AM
37. McCollum, Susan B 13014	35 Eel Pt Rd	Demo pool	32/63	Botticelli & Pohl	AM
38. Susan McCollum 13006	35 Eel Point Road	Rev. 12678; fenest	32/63	Botticelli & Pohl	AM
39. Hey Lover, LLC 13032	38 Lovers Lane Lot A	Cabana	68/68	Normand Residential	AM
40. SurfsideACKscapes,LLC-13009	2 Nonantum Avenue	Cabana	87/5	Normand Residential	AM

Joe Paul - Motion to approve the Consent Agenda

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten, Joe Paul (Carrie Thornwill & Val Oliver recused)

Carries unanimously.

II. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Diane Archer- 12963	1 Weetemo Road	Porch/renovations	15/57	Thornwill Design AC
• Replacement windows, Anderson A series, must meet the historic Nantucket style muntin profile.				
2. Ashley Gebhardt- 12983	11 Sesapana Road	Move on shed	68/26	Structures Unltd CP
• Shed colors and roof shingles to match house.				
3. Nancy Breckenridge- 12976	170 Cliff Road	Pool	41/68	MCA+ AM
• Updated site plan indicating the location of the pool equipment. Pool and pool equipment not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade changes from existing or as noted on the application. perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.perpetuity. No grade changes from existing or as noted on the application.				
4. Nantucket Hist Assoc 13033	15 Broad Street	Addition	42.4.2/61	Emeritus, LTD SW
• Paint service door medium gray akin to weathered shingles.				
5. Seven Pleasant, LLC 12985	7 Pleasant Street	Replace/reduce spa	42.3.3/158	Normand Residential SW
• Spa not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade changes from existing or as noted on the application.				
6. 37 Cliff Road Nom Tr 13043	37 Cliff Rd	Shed move	42.4.4/42	Garden Group SW
• Not to be visible at times of inspection and in perpetuity.				
7. 37 Cliff Road Nom Tr 13044	37 Cliff Rd Hardscape	pool	42.4.4/42	Garden Group SW
• Not to be visible at times of inspection and in perpetuity.				
8. Davies, Elizabeth 13023	35 Wauwinet Rd	Solar roof	20/34	AckSmart JP
• Date of construction, c. 1850 farmhouse, to be written on the COA				
100 Wauwinet Tr 13005	100 Wauwinet Road	Rev. 12786; barn	11/24.1	Botticelli & Pohl AM
• Colors to be noted on application				
10. 100 Wauwinet Tr 13007	100 Wauwinet Road	Rev. 12521; pool house	11/24.1	Botticelli & Pohl AM
• Un-mutinied East picture window not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity				
11. Wendy Greenberg 13034	16 Dukes Rd	hardscape- wall/fence	41/61	LFW JP
• Screen the retaining wall from the street.				

Abby Camp - Motion to approve the Consent with Conditions Agenda

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Val Oliver, Joe Paul (Thornwill- recused)

Carries unanimously.

I. SIGNS				
Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. ZERO INDIA, LLC • ENTANCE 1 (MARISSA COLLECTIONS)	ZERO INDIA ST	PROJECTING SIGN	42.3.1/130	THE SIGN LADY
2. SOUTH WATER REALTY INC • (JULIE'S KITCHEN)	21 S WATER ST	PROJECTING SIGN	42.4.2/102	THE SIGN LADY
3. NANT ISLAND LAND BANK • (LAND BANK)	22 BROAD ST	PROJECTING SIGN	42.4.2/34	ELEANOR ANTONIETTI

IV. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

V . NEW BUSINESS 08/12/2025

Vote: Sign Advisory Council did not meet due to lack of quorum

Motion: No action taken

COMMISSION Q & A WITH PRESERVAITON PLANNER

Holly reminded the commission about the NAPC Summer Course coming up – highly recommended. The latest HDC Surveys (Form B) from the last survey work has been accepted by MHC (39 at Brant Point and 98 in the Fish Lots.) Any old 1989 Surveys are included with the new forms, if there are any. Resilient Nantucket Design Guidelines Firmette Maps can be done by applicants on the Town's website.

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent	
1. 5 Orange St, LLC- 12975	5 Orange Street	Addition	42.3.1/149	Thornewill Design	AM
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul; Agent: Thornewill					
The Historic District Commission did not approve the 5 Orange Street application as originally submitted and held it for revisions. They recommended reducing the number of skylights to one per roof plane, preserving more historic details—particularly the arched windows—eliminating the proposed balcony, adding character-defining elements such as kick panels or Greek details, and ensuring that the fenestration and additions appear more historically appropriate. The applicant was asked to return with a revised design that better reflects the historic character of the structure. Motion: Abby Camp held it for revisions Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten. Carries unanimously					
2. Dean Lampe- 12960	5 Gray Avenue	New dwelling	67/320	Self	CT
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul; Alternates: Patten; Recused: Oliver					

The Historic District Commission did not approve the 5 Gray Avenue application and held it for revisions due to concerns that the massing is too complicated and doesn't fit the neighborhood, the secondary mass on the left needs to be pushed back, the front elevation appears too busy, the proportions of the primary mass require adjustment, and the west elevation needs simplification. The board requested the applicant simplify the overall design, reduce the complexity of the massing, provide context for the other two lots in the subdivision, and reconsider the fenestration and detailing. The applicant was asked to return with a revised design that better reflects the neighborhood's character.

Motion: Angus MacLeod held it for revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul

Carries unanimously

3. Dean Lampe- 12973	5 Gray Avenue	Shed	67/320	Self	CT
TRACK					
4. Dean Lampe- 12974	5 Gray Avenue	Pool	67/320	Self	CT
TRACK					
5. Arthur Reade- 12964	19 Monomoy Road	Alterations	54/260	Gryphon Architects	CT
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill and Paul					

For 19 Monomoy Road, the motion was to hold the application for revisions. The board had concerns about the over-fenestration and the black trim color. Stephen Welch suggested that a monotone color scheme would be more appropriate. The motion to hold for revisions was made and

unanimously passed by the board members.

Motion: Val Oliver held it for revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Connie Patten
Carries unanimously

6. Nancy Breckenridge- 12977 170 Cliff Road Guesthouse 41/68 MCA+ AM
No representative.

7. 9 Hulbert Ave RE Tr- 12979 9 Hulbert Avenue Addition/alterations 29.2/3.3 Val Oliver Design AM
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul; **Alternates:** Patten; **Agent:** Oliver

The Historic District Commission held the application for the addition at 9 Hulbert Lane for revisions due to concerns about the height and fenestration. The board recommended reducing the overall height, lowering the top plates on dormers by about 9 inches, adjusting the fenestration to be more proportional, and ensuring the detailing aligns with the historic character of the structure. The applicant was asked to return with a revised design addressing these concerns.

Motion: Abby Camp made the motion to hold the application for revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul
Carries unanimously

8. 9 Hulbert Ave RE Tr- 12980 9 Hulbert Avenue Historic Determination 29.2/3.3 Val Oliver Design AM
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul; **Alternates:** Patten; **Agent:** Oliver

No concerns

Motion: Angus MacLeod made the motion to approve.

Vote: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul
Carries unanimously

9. Diane Montgomery-12994 88 Goldfinch Drive Roof top solar 66/693 Cotuit Solar VO
The applicant was not present.

10. Alfred Sanford 12830 8 Cato Lane New dwelling 55/663 Ridgevale Development VO
The applicant was not present.

11. Auburn Cottage, LLC 12990 46 Easton Street Rev. 11261; deck/hip roof 42.4.1/22 Botticelli & Pohl AM
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul; **Alternates:** Patten, Oliver

The Historic District Commission approved the application for 46 Eastern Street as submitted. MacLeod noted that the porch appeared deep and the pent roof shown was more than a “mock-up”

Motion: Joe Paul made the motion to approve.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul
Carries unanimously

12. Mickey Rowland 12997 18 Mt. Vernon Street Main House- add porch 55.4.4/32.1 Normand Residential JP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; **Alternates:** Thornewill, Paul

No concerns.

Motion: Macleod made motion to approve.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Connie Patten
Carries unanimously

13. Mickey Rowland 12996 18 Mt. Vernon Street Garage 55.4.4/32.1 Normand Residential JP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; **Alternates:** Thornewill, Paul

No Concerns.

Motion: Vall Oliver to approved as submitted

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Connie Patten
Carries unanimously

14. Mark Welshimer 12988 3 New Mill Street Addition 42.3.3/190 CWA JP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver, Paul; **Alternates:** Thornewill, Patten

The Historic District Commission held the application for 3 New Mill Street for revisions due to concerns about the complexity of the design,

particularly the two-story mass with an elevator. The board recommended simplifying the massing, creating a more straightforward structure, and potentially using a hip roof in place of the proposed design. The motion to hold for revisions was made and unanimously approved by the board.

Motion: Abby Camp made the motion to hold the application for revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver

Carries unanimously

15. Bailey Kim 13016 7 Brewster Rd Color change MH 54/286 Tom Nicosia RP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Thornewill, Patten, Oliver; **Alternates:** Paul; **Recused-** MacLeod

Motion: Abby Camp to approve the color change to white for both the main house and guest house.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten, Val Oliver

Carries unanimously

16. Bailey Kim 13017 7 Brewster Rd Color change GH 54/286 Tom Nicosia RP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Thornewill, Patten, Oliver; **Alternates:** Paul; **Recused-** MacLeod

Motion: Abby Camp to approve the color change to white for both the main house and guest house.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Joe Paul, Connie Patten, Val Oliver

Carries unanimously

17. Ennismore Mews LLC 13029 3 Hickory Meadow Gate 41/73.1 Atlantic Landscaping RP
The applicant was not present.

18. Alfred Sanford LLC 13015 10 Cato Ln Main House Revs 55/125 Ridgevale Development RP
The applicant was not present.

19. Gilbey, Mason 13013 54R Union St garage to dwelling 55.1.4/32.1 Val Oliver Design JP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill; **Alternates:** Patten; **Agent:** Oliver

The Historic District Commission held the application for 54R Union Street hold for revisions due to concerns about the height of the structure, fenestration, the appropriateness of the design, the second-floor deck, and the overall massing.

Motion: Abby Camp made the motion to hold the application for revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul

Carries unanimously

20. Patrick & Emily Dolan 13011 7 Comeau Ln Front door replacement 49.3.2/13 Self RP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill; **Alternates:** Paul; **Agent:** Oliver

The Commission felt a 6 light would be more appropriate with 6/1 windows.

Motion: Carrie Thornewill made motion to approve with a 6 light through Exhibit A.

Note: that Chair stated if want to add porch, opt not to do it and come in with a revision and the Chair will sign off on it.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten.

Carries unanimously

21. Ack Reward LLC 13021 149 Main St Move on site add & reno 41/169 BPC VO
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; **Alternates:** Thornewill; **Agent:** Paul

The Historic District Commission approved the application for 149 Main Street with specific revisions to help maintain the historic character of the bungalow. The approved changes included modifying the dormer windows to six-light windows and scoring the concrete foundation to resemble the original block foundation.

Motion: Angus MacLeod made the motion to approve through exhibit A with the dormer windows being a 6 light and the foundation scored to resemble existing foundation.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten, Val Oliver

Carries unanimously

22. CBM Polpis Trust 13031 275 Polpis Rd New dwelling 25/16 Emeritus LTD VO
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; **Alternates:** Patten, Thornewill

No concerns

Motion: Joe Paul made the motion to approve the design as submitted.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Joe Paul

Carries unanimously

23. 28 Pine LLC 13019 28 Pine St Fenestration/replace found/alter 42.3.2/47 Emeritus LTD VO
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Paul, Patten

The Historic District Commission held the application for 28 Pine Street for revisions due to several concerns about the proposed additions. The board noted that the front porch addition would significantly alter the character of the house, the gable dormer on the Farmer Street facade appeared too large, and adjustments were needed to reduce the height of the dormers and top plates. Modifications to the front door detailing were also recommended.

Motion: Angus MacLeod made the motion to hold the application for revisions.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Carrie Thornewill

Carries unanimously

24. Pride Foundation II Trust 13028 166 Cliff Rd New Dwelling 41/69 S Metz JP
Commissioners: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill; Alternates: Paul, Camp

The Historic District Commission approved the application for 166 Cliff Road with modifications to the roof walk railing detail. The board agreed to simplify the design by replacing the complex cross-detail with a single horizontal detail at the base. Angus MacLeod made the motion to approve the application with the Exhibit A modification, and it was unanimously passed by the board.

Motion: Angus MacLeod motion to approve through Exhibit A.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten, Val Oliver, Carrie Thornewill.

Carries unanimously

25. 7 Brewster Nantucket LLC 13047 7 Brewster Rd Pool hardscape 54/286 KMLD JP
Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten, Thornewill

Concerns were with the retaining wall on property line. Contours would have been helpful.

Motion: Joe paul made the motion to approve.

Vote: Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Joe Paul

Carries unanimously

27. Dougherty Anne 13024 2 Lincoln Street Solar roof 73.4.2/83 AckSmart JP
No representative.

28. Gerald Schwartz 13048 11 & 21 Nonantum As- Built Fence/gate cattle grate 87/58 KMLD JP
Commissioners: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill; Alternates: Paul, Camp

The Historic District Commission approved modifications for 11 & 21 Nonantum, which included removing the cattle grates, increasing screening vegetation, moving the fence 20 feet back from Nonantum, replacing metal posts with wood posts, and adding an as-built fee. Angus MacLeod made the motion with these specifications as an Exhibit A modification, and it was unanimously approved by the board.

Motion: Angus MacLeod made the motion to approve with moving the fence back 20' from Nonantum; posts to be screened with plant material; mesh to fade into vegetation; no cattle grates and the as-built fine to be paid. .

Vote: Stephen Welch, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten, Val Oliver, Carrie Thornewill.

Carries unanimously

Motion to adjourn made by Abby Camp at 6:28PM

Vote: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten

Carries unanimously.