



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes **August 5, 2025**
2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul
Staff: Holly Backus, Fiona Johnson and Aleksander Trifunovic
Holly Backus left the meeting at 4.25 pm

Meeting called to order at 4:00 PM by Stephen Welch

Oliver: made the motion to approve the agenda. Approved by Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten, Carrie Thornewill
In person, Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Camp, Patten
Thornewill, Paul via zoom

I. CONSENTS

#	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1	Connolly Realty Tr- 12967	150 Surfside Road	Curb cut	80/33	Self

The motion was made by Oliver and approved unanimously by the board members present.

II. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

Holly Backus informed the commission that CLG minutes will be provided soon for the board's review and approval, at their leisure. No commissioners had any questions on her comments, however Commissioner Oliver appreciated her reviews.

III. OLD BUSINESS 08/05/2025

#	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1	Warren M. James ETAL-12526	12 Madequecham Valley Rd	Relocate on site/addition	89/12	Emeritus, LTD

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten

Last heard 6/03/2025

Discussion: The presentation was focused on renovation and addition to an existing structure, with an acknowledgment of the property's limited future due to potential ocean encroachment.

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Ray – Carried: Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver – Welch (nay)

2	ACK 007 Properties, LLC- 12823	46 Walsh Street	Garage/studio	29/101.1	Normand Residential
---	--------------------------------	-----------------	---------------	----------	---------------------

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul

Last heard 7/15/2025

Discussion: There was general support for the single door option.

One suggestion was made to include an integrated roof, while another proposed removing the roof entirely.

Concerns were raised that the overall balcony design may not align with traditional Nantucket architectural style.

Motion: Motion to approve with an exhibit A with balcony reduced to 3 feet deep and one door- option B made by Val – Carried Welch, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill, (MacLeod nay)

3	Smiley Sea Street, LLC- 12819	10 Sea Street	New dwelling	42.4.2/50.1	Normand Residential
---	-------------------------------	---------------	--------------	-------------	---------------------

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten, Thornewill

Last heard 7/15/2025

Discussion: The roof walk was reduced from 10 to 9 feet wide and its depth was decreased by 4 feet. The window pattern was changed to six-over-six, with enlarged first-floor windows, a new triple window on the second floor, and a large window added in the gable end. The board suggested reducing the size of the left gable and lowering the gable window by 6 to 8 inches. Concerns were raised that the building feels cramped on the site and appears to overwhelm it, with additional comments about window sizing and trim details. The board requested more information, including FEMA certification, and asked for revisions to lessen the building's overall scale and impact

Motion: To hold for revisions made by Angus – Carried Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul

4	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12439	85 Vestal Street	New dwelling	56/252	JB Studio
---	------------------------------	------------------	--------------	--------	-----------

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Welch *Last heard 7/8/2025*

Discussion: the applicant presented revisions including a rotated building footprint, relocation of the cabana further back on the site, reduction of some retaining walls, and a lowered north ridge to reduce visibility from Duke's Road. However, neighborhood concerns were raised about the excessive use of retaining walls, the overall density of the project, significant grade changes, and potential impacts on adjacent properties. Board members echoed these concerns, citing issues with scale, density, and site compositions specifically noting the structure's proximity to Vestal Street, the unnatural landscape, and the visibility of the large north elevation from below. In response, the board did not approve the current proposal.

Public Comment: Linda Williams had concerns about its overall scale and impact on the site and surrounding neighborhood. The retaining walls were viewed as excessive in both height and extent, with particular concern about the magnitude of walls required to accommodate the proposed pool. The site was considered too dense, with too many structures for the small lot, resulting in a development that overwhelms the property and exceeds the appropriate scale for the location. Significant grade changes involving extensive cutting and filling were seen as an unnatural alteration of the landscape. Impacts on neighboring properties were also a concern, including potential loss of screening, inadequate setbacks, and the fact that the lot is considerably smaller than adjacent parcels. Additionally, questions were raised about whether the number of proposed bedrooms complies with health department regulations, leading to a recommendation for a detailed grade assessment by a surveyor.

Motion: Motion to hold for major changes to the site layout made by Abby – Carried Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten

5	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12442	85 Vestal Street	Garage/studio	56/252	JB Studio
---	------------------------------	------------------	---------------	--------	-----------

TRACK

6	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12441	85 Vestal Street	Cabana	56/252	JB Studio
---	------------------------------	------------------	--------	--------	-----------

TRACK

7	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12440	85 Vestal Street	Pool	56/252	JB Studio
---	------------------------------	------------------	------	--------	-----------

TRACK

8	Elisabeth Hussell- 10969	43 Orange Street VIEW	As-Built color change	42.3.2/222	LINK
---	--------------------------	-----------------------	-----------------------	------------	------

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none. *Last heard 9/10/2024*

Discussion: The board noted the proposed blue was quite bright and wanted a more traditional color scheme to go with the neighborhood. General consensus was fine with proposed Newport Blue on door only.

Motion: Motion to approve with blue proposed for door and white sash made by Angus – Carried: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul.

9	Nicole & Joel Whidden- 11541	11 Davis Street	New dwelling	82/75	Emeritus
---	------------------------------	-----------------	--------------	-------	----------

Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Patten *Last heard 7/22/2025*

HOLD

10	JDB 34 Liberty, LLC- 12161	34 Liberty Street	Replace frnt door/windows	42.3.4/82	Linda Williams
----	----------------------------	-------------------	---------------------------	-----------	----------------

Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten *Last heard 5/27/2025*

Discussion: The board was supportive of the window and door replacement, seeing it as a necessary preservation effort

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Val – Carried: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul

11	3 Pops Ln Holding Tr- 12896	3 Pops Lane VIEW	Rev. 11088; re-site/reno GH	60.2.4/64.1	MCA+
----	-----------------------------	------------------	-----------------------------	-------------	------

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul *Last heard 7/29/2025*

Discussion: The board discussed the guest house location, with one member suggesting relocating it to the proposed garage site, while another preferred keeping it close to the main house. A third member advocated for a smaller guest house, and another was open to considering multiple location options.

Public Comment: Neighborhood concerns emphasized a preference for keeping the guest house closer to the main house to preserve the site's character. There were worries about increased visibility from the creek and Washington Avenue, and a strong desire to maintain the area's low-density feel.

Motion: Motion to hold for revisions (to explore alternative locations for the guest house, rather than approving a specific new location) made by Angus – Carried: Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten.

12	3 Pops Ln Holding Tr- 12895	3 Pops Lane	Garage	60.2.4/64.1	MCA+
----	-----------------------------	-------------	--------	-------------	------

Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul *Last heard 7/29/2025*

TRACK

13	3 Pops Ln Holding Tr- 12897	3 Pops Lane	Pool	60.2.4/64.1	MCA+
----	-----------------------------	-------------	------	-------------	------

TRACK

IV. NEW BUSINESS 07/29/2025

#	Property owner name	Street Address	Page 2 of 3 Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
---	---------------------	----------------	---------------------------	------------	-------

1	CNV Surf, LLC	68 Shawkemo	Hardscape	44/5	Jardins International
<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Paul, Thornewill, Patten.</i>					
Discussion: No Concerns					
Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Val – Carried: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod, Pohl					
2	Branden Scimone- 12944	4 Wood Hollow Road	Move off/demo dwelling	72/16	Robbie Newman
<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul; Recused: Oliver.</i>					
Discussion: No Concerns.					
Motion to approve with preference to reuse materials made by MacLeod. Carries unanimously.					
3	Branden Scimone- 12945	4 Wood Hollow Road	New dwelling	72/16	Robbie Newman
Discussion: The proposed house was considered too large and formal for the neighborhood, with board members expressing concern that its scale and design—particularly the white trim and windows—were out of place among the simpler, more compact surrounding homes.					
Motion: Motion to hold for modifications made by Ray – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten.					
4	Branden Scimone- 12943	4 Wood Hollow Road	Cabana	72/16	Robbie Newman
TRACK					
5	Branden Scimone- 12942	4 Wood Hollow Road	Pool	72/16	Robbie Newman
TRACK					
6	Surfside Realty Tr	16 Walsh Street	Relocate/partial demo/reno	42.4.1/50	Robbie Newman
<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Oliver</i>					
Discussion: The board reviewed the proposed building and expressed concerns about its boxy appearance, lack of fenestration on the front elevation, and blank walls on both floors. They noted the removal of one-story additive masses and potential crowding on Walsh Street. While Ray Pohl appreciated the effort to preserve the building, others suggested improvements to the front facade.					
Motion: Motion to hold for revisions made by Abby – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul.					
7	Marshall Taylor	6 Starbuck Road VIEW	Driveway material change	59.3/64	Self
<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul</i>					
Discussion: No Concerns					
Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Angus – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod					
8	170 Scarborough Tr 12937	20 Waquoit Road	Garage	90/5	CWA
<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul</i>					
Discussion: Board members expressed concerns about the design's complexity, height, and rooftop elements, with Stephen Welch recommending simplification and reduction. Val Oliver highlighted the lack of context regarding other proposed structures on the property. The board requested additional information, including full property elevations, context for all proposed buildings, and a simplified fenestration and overall design to better assess the project.					
Motion: Motion to hold for revisions made by Angus- Carried: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod.					
9	10 Marble Way NT 12930	10 Marble Way	Move/demo MH	66/104	Linda Williams
10	10 Marble Way NT 12933	10 Marble Way	Move/demo garage	66/104	Linda Williams
<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod.</i>					
Discussion: Noted the Main House and Garage are in poor condition.					
Motion: Motion to approve both as submitted – Carried Pohl, Welch, Oliver, MacLeod - Camp (nay)					
Camp made the motion to adjourn at 6.17 pm					
Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Oliver, Pohl, Patten, Paul and Thornewill					
Motion carries unanimously					