



MINUTES July 8, 2025

TOWN OF NANTUCKET

Committee/Board/s	Historic District Commission (HDC) – Old Business
Day, Date, and Time	Tuesday, July 8, 2025, at 4:00pm *HYBRID
Location / Address	COMMUNITY ROOM @ 4 FAIRGROUNDS ROAD & REMOTE PARTICIPATION VIA ZOOM

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Signature of Chair/Authorized Person: Stephen Welch, Chairman

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul
Staff: Cathy Flynn, Holly Backus, Nicky Sherriff, Fiona Johnson, Sara Johnson

AGENDA

Present: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten
Remote: Paul
 Oliver made a motion to approve the Agenda.
 Motion carries unanimously.

I. CONSENTS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	27 OSR, LLC- 12800	27 Old South Rd	New Dwelling- Building 7	68/2	Dreamline/Kris Megna RP
2.	60 Burnell LLC- 12806	60 Burnell St	New Dwelling	49.3.2/18	Botticelli & Pohl AC

Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten; **Alternates:** Paul; **Recused:** Pohl
 Oliver made a motion to approve Consents.
 Motion carries unanimously.

II. CONSENT WITH CONDITONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	27 OSR, LLC- 12801	27 Old South Rd	New Dwelling- Building 6	68/2	Dreamline/Kris Megna RP
	• The “F” windows to be vertically formatted				
2.	27 OSR, LLC- 12798	27 Old South Rd	New Dwelling- Building 3	68/2	Dreamline/Kris Megna RP
	• Drop the pent roof beam 8” and reduce pitch to 5/12				
3.	27 OSR, LLC- 12796	27 Old South Rd	New Dwelling- Building 2	68/2	Dreamline/Kris Megna RP
	• Roof pitch to be dropped to 5/12; straighten brackets				

Board: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten
 Oliver made a motion to approve Consents with Conditions.
 Motion carries unanimously.

III. 10 NEW WHALE ST- DEMO BUILDING – MOTION TO RECONSIDER THE FAILED MOTION FROM 6/10/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Nantucket Electr. Co. -11863	10 New Whale St	Demo building	42.3.1/37	Linda Williams
• Motion to deny demo (MacLeod): Camp/MacLeod- aye, Welch/Oliver-nay, Pohl- abstained; 2 in favor/2 opposed; motion fails • Motion to hold until the beginning of 6/17/25 meeting and clarification of vote with Town Counsel (Pohl) 5-0 • <i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Patten, Paul</i> <i>Last heard 6/10/2025</i> • Stephen Welch questioned the validity of the new preservation letter, citing concerns about the engineer's qualifications and inconclusive findings. He argued that the building's severe deterioration—especially crumbling bricks—made restoration impractical and equivalent to a “brick by brick” demolition. Noting the structure had been neglected for decades, he stressed the importance of following the original engineer's report and opposed extending the hearing. Welch ultimately supported and voted for demolition, believing the building was beyond feasible restoration. • Ray Pohl did not make extensive comments during the discussion. When he made the motion to approve demolition, he briefly stated: "I am going to put forward a motion to for an approval of a demolition of this building." After making the motion, he did not provide additional substantive comments about the specific property or its condition. • Val Oliver initially suggested having a “healthy discussion” about the demolition of 10 New Whale Street and noted that new information from preservation architectural conservator Glenn Boornazian had changed her perspective. After speaking with the Fire Chief, who said the building “needs to come down,” she reviewed the preservation letter and felt the building could potentially be saved. She expressed interest in hearing other board members' perspectives, questioned Boornazian's qualifications and how he came to submit the letter, and sought to understand the context of the new preservation assessment. Ultimately, despite showing openness to preservation, she voted in favor of demolition when the final motion was called. • Abby Camp believed the building at 10 New Whale Street could be restored and emphasized the importance of preserving industrial history. She noted that saving this structure, along with another on the corner of Washington, would help maintain the area's historical fabric and benefit the community. Highlighting the building's beautiful details and restoration potential, she stressed that once a building is demolished, it is gone forever, and expressed concern about losing a structure that contributes meaningfully to Nantucket's historic character. Ultimately, she voted against demolition, believing the building could and should be preserved. • Angus MacLeod, who had previously moved to deny the demolition of 10 New Whale Street, said the new preservation letter from Glenn Boornazian reaffirmed his belief that the building is restorable. Maintaining his original position, he voted against demolition, consistent with his stance that the building could be preserved.					

Oliver made a motion to reconsider the failed motion.

Motion carries unanimously.

Pohl made the motion to approve the demolition.

Welch, Pohl, Oliver voted Yes, Camp, MacLeod voted No (3-2 vote)

IV. OLD BUSINESS 06/24/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	George Metri- 9127	12 Angola St VIEW	Hardscape	54.4.4/78	KMLD
• <i>Commissioners: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Thornewill, Patten; Alternates: none</i> <i>Last heard 5/27/2025</i>					

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al suggested the lower wall could potentially be eliminated by re-sloping the grade and moving the wall further into the property.

Board members Carrie, Abby, and others suggested reducing to a single retaining wall and using more natural vegetation.

The board ultimately made a motion to hold the application for revisions, with a focus on: Potentially reducing to one wall, improving natural landscaping, considering a fence style similar to the “Garden of the Sea,” adding more vegetation to screen the walls.

Motion carries unanimously.

2.	M. Robert Sarkisian- 9409	8 N. Mill VIEW	Hardscape	54.4.4/78.2	KMLD
• <i>Commissioners: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Thornewill; Alternates: none</i> <i>Last heard 3/5/2024</i>					

Mickey Rowland, et al noted the proposed second retaining wall would be more visible than the applicant claimed, showing about 2-3 feet of the wall would be visible. Board members suggested: Reducing to a single wall, using more natural landscaping, considering a fence style similar to the Garden of the Sea, Adding vegetation to screen the walls.

Welch made a motion to hold the application for revisions, with specific requests: Explore reducing to one wall, Provide fence options, Show a cross-section of the grade, Add more natural vegetation.

Motion carries unanimously.

3.	Boulevard Prop Grp- 10839	20 Main St	Pool	73.3.1/50	Linda Williams
	• Commissioners: Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: none				Last heard 5/27/2025

Camp made a motion to hold for revisions, requesting explicit details on the fence, gate, and vegetation to be shown on the plan. Motion carries unanimously.

V. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

VI. OLD BUSINESS 07/08/2025

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Ten Straight Wharf LLC- 12355	10 Straight Whf VIEW	Rev. 10021; addition	42.3.1/137	LFW

- Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul Last heard 7/01/2025

Camp made a motion to hold for revisions, including adding a dormer option and making flush and top plate modifications with a slightly steeper angle.

Motion carries unanimously.

2.	Triple Stable -12445	14 Tripp Drive VIEW	New Dwelling	80/310.1	Cottage & Castle
	• Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul				Last heard 6/24/2025

Pohl made the motion to approve the application as submitted.

Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod voted Yes, Camp voted No. (4-1 vote)

3.	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12439	85 Vestal St	Main House	56/252	JB Studio
	• Commissioners: Pohl (Acting Chair), Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Welch				Last heard 6/10/2025

Abby Camp made a motion to hold both the main house and accessory structures (garage, shed, pool) for revisions. The board wanted a more holistic approach to grading and landscaping. Suggestion to reduce overall density and create a more natural transition.

Motion carries unanimously.

4.	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12442	85 Vestal St	Main House	56/252	JB Studio
5.	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12441	85 Vestal St	Main House	56/252	JB Studio
6.	Vestal Nantucket, LLC- 12440	85 Vestal St	Main House	56/252	JB Studio
	• Held to track				

7.	308 Madaket Holdings- 12570	308 Madaket Rd	Pool-hardscape	60.2.1/67	JT Newton
	• Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: Camp, Oliver				Last heard 6/10/2025

Paul made a motion to approve with the pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade changes from existing or as noted on the application.

Motion carries unanimously.

8.	308 Madaket Holdings- 12569	308 Madaket Rd	Pergola	60.2.1/67	JT Newton
	• Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: Camp, Oliver				Last heard 6/10/2025

No Concerns.

Paul made the motion to approve.

Motion carries unanimously.

9.	ACK 11 Pleasant St, LLC- 12257	11 Pleasant St	Addition	42.3.3/121	Studio Ppark
	• Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill				Last heard 6/24/2025

MacLeod made a motion to hold for revisions, Reconsider the bay window attachment, increase setback between shed and gable, Adjust fenestration.

Pohl, MacLeod, Camp voted Yes, Welch, Oliver voted No. (3-2 vote)

10.	ACK 11 Pleasant St, LLC- 12251	11 Pleasant St	Garage	42.3.3/121	Studio Ppark
	• Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill				Last heard 6/24/2025

Pohl made a motion to approve via Exhibit A, with specific modifications: Increase window size, Rebate hip roof by six inches on either side. Welch, Pohl, Oliver, voted Yes, Camp, MacLeod voted No (3-2 vote)

11.	David Sloan- 12740	34B Walsh St.	Addition	29/104	Studio Ppark/LFW
Commissioners: <i>Walsh, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul, Oliver</i> Last heard 7/1/2025					

Pohl made the motion to approve via Exhibit A, with specific modifications: Return to two bays; reduce width along the gable end to 8"; drop down the height of the railing on top of the roof walk to 3'; drop down to close of ridge as possible- floor joist should be resting on ridge.

Motion carries unanimously.

12.	NT Property Owner, LLC- 12398	22 Honeysuckle Dr	Hardscape	68/391	Linda Williams
Commissioners: <i>Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: None</i> Last heard 5/20/2025					

Camp made a motion to approve as submitted.

Welch, Camp, Oliver, Patten voted Yes, MacLeod voted No (4-1 vote)

13.	Third Time Trust- 12733	41A Cliff Rd	Garage	42.4.4/2	Emeritus, LTD
Commissioners: <i>Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul</i> Last heard 7/1/2025					

Oliver made the motion to approve via Exhibit A, with specific modifications: Drop the eave by at least a foot, set back the dormers, Verify dormer size. Make the roof over the doors tie into the main roof instead of having it separated.

Motion carries unanimously.

IX. NEW BUSINESS 6/17/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	33 Cliff Rd LLC 12741	33 Cliff Rd	Pool hardscape	42.4.4/5	AHERN LLC CT

Board: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Patten, Paul; Recused: Pohl

Thornewill made a motion to approve with cobble apron.

Motion carries unanimously.

1.	Phillip Hadley- 12774	4 Underhill Ln	Rev. 8485- hardscape	73.3.2/58.1	Ahern LLC CT
----	-----------------------	----------------	----------------------	-------------	--------------

Board: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill

Camp made a motion to Approve the application, Screen the staircase with vegetation.

Motion carries unanimously.

2.	27 OSR, LLC- 12799	27 Old South Rd	New Dwelling- Building 4	68/2	Dreamline/Kris Megna RP
----	--------------------	-----------------	--------------------------	------	-------------------------

Board: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul

Camp made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the projecting gable be removed and replaced with a plain facade similar to the one with the green shutters, with no shutters.

Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod voted Yes, Welch voted No. (4-1 vote)

3.	57 Somerset, LLC-12815	57 Somerset Rd	New Dwelling	66/91	Aprea Design, Inc. RP
----	------------------------	----------------	--------------	-------	-----------------------

Board: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: Camp, Oliver, Thornewill

Thornewill made the motion to approve via Exhibit A, subject to relocating the house a minimum of 10 feet further from the street, with the understanding that a separate hardscape plan would be submitted later.

Motion carries unanimously.

4.	Thedan Holdings- 12805	37 Milk St	Pool	41/528	Atlantic Landscaping VO
----	------------------------	------------	------	--------	-------------------------

Board: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Oliver, Paul, Patten

Thornewill made a motion to approve with the pool not visible time inspection or thereafter, no grade change from prior, existing design of application.

Motion carries unanimously.

Board: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Thornewill, Paul

Pohl made a motion to approve Minutes, June 10th and June 17th

Pohl, MacLeod, Camp- yes; Welch, Oliver- abstained (3-2 vote)

Motion to adjourn at 8:15pm (MacLeod)

Carries unanimously