



HDC Minutes June 24, 2025; adopted July 22, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

4 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Vallorie Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod,

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten, Joe Paul

~~ MINUTES ~~

DATE: June 24th, 2025

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM

Call to order at 4:00 pm, and announcements by Stephen Welch, Chair

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Fiona Johnson, Cathy Flynn

Members Present: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill, Patten

Remote Participants: N/A

Absent Members: N/A

Late Arrivals:

Early Departures:

Town Representative:

Adoption of Agenda:

Motion: Motion: to Approve made by Oliver

Vote: Carried 5-0, sitting (Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod)

I. COMMISSIONER Q&A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

The CLG agenda has been posted, the meeting is scheduled for this Friday at 1:00 PM via Zoom.

II. CONSENTS

NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
1. 27 OSR, LLC	27 Old South Rd	New dwelling	68/2	Dreamline/Kris Megna
2. Renard ACK, LLC	7 Thurston's Way	Egress and bsmnt stairs	66/34	Gashi Construction

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Macleod, Camp

Motion: Motion to approve (Oliver)

Vote: Motion was approved by a unanimous vote

III. 10 NEW WHALEST-DEMO BUILDING-HELD FROM 6/10/25 FOR CLARIFICATION OF VOTE FROM TOWN COUNSEL

NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
1. Nantucket Electr. Co	10 New Whale St	Demo building	42.3.1/37	Linda Williams

Hold until 7/1/2025 per applicant's request

IV. OLDBUSINESS FROM 6/10/25 REQUESTED BY THE COMMISSION

NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
1. Robert L. Roy	25 Hussey Street	Garage demo	42.3.4/54	BPC

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten

Alternates: N/A

Representative: Joe Paul

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: ultimately supported the board's unanimous decision to approve the deconstruction and reconstruction of the garage, with the intent to reuse the existing materials.

Holly Backus: comments about 25 Hussey Street garage project. Specifically, she recommended that the board annotate the Certificate of Approval (COA) to clearly indicate that this is a deconstruction project. She supported the applicant's plan to deconstruct and reuse materials and wanted to ensure this was explicitly documented in the approval. Her comment was brief but aimed at providing clarity about the nature of the project's approval.

Board Discussion: Materials will be deconstructed and reused. A new foundation will be installed. The structure will be rebuilt according to the previously approved design.

Motion: Motion to approve the building being "deconstructed and reconstructed, as per the previously approved new design." After a brief clarification about using the term "reused" instead of "reconstructed," the motion was put to a vote. Made by Pohl

Vote: Carried 5-0 - Pohl, Welch, Camp, Patten, MacLeod

V.OLD BUSINESS 6/24/2025

NAME	ADDRESS	SCOPE OF WORK	MAP/PARCEL	REPRESENTATIVE
1. Triple Stable, LLC	14 Tripp Dr	New Dwelling	80/310.1	Cottage & Castle

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul

Board Discussion: The board's main requests were to provide a master site plan, simplify design elements, and clarify material specs.

Motion: Motion to hold for revisions, additional information and view the fence made by Pohl.

Carried : Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod

2. Triple Stable, LLC	14 Tripp Dr	Garage	80/310.1	Cottage & Castle
-----------------------	-------------	--------	----------	------------------

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul

Board Discussion: having been sufficiently revised from its earlier version, gained support for approval despite some concerns about the unusual combination of white board and batten with bronze trim compared to natural weathering materials. It was noted that such materials already exist in the neighborhood. To address these concerns, a motion was made and unanimously approved to condition the COA on changing the whiteboard and batten to natural weathering material.

Motion: Motion to approve through Staff changing the whiteboard and batten to NTW made by Camp.

Carried: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, Macleod

3. Triple Stable, LLC	14 Tripp Dr	Shed	80/310.1	Cottage & Castle
-----------------------	-------------	------	----------	------------------

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten, Paul

Board Discussion: No concerns

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Pohl.

Carried: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod

4. George Metri	12 Angola St VIEW	Hardscape	54.4.4/78	KMLD
-----------------	--------------------------	-----------	-----------	------

Sitting: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Thornewill, Patten

AGENT NOT PRESENT

5. Robert Sarkisian	8 N. Mill	Hardscape	54.4.4/78.2	KMLD
---------------------	-----------	-----------	-------------	------

Sitting: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill

AGENT NOT PRESENT

6. Mark & Jamie Leiss	5 Coffin Rd	Driveway gate	91/9.2	KMLD
-----------------------	-------------	---------------	--------	------

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Paul

Board Discussion: The suggestion was made to use binding material (like vines) on the metal fence posts along roadsides because the metal posts stand out visually and covering them would help blend them into the surroundings. The metal posts are ideal for this since they won't cause rot and are small enough to cover quickly. Regarding the gate posts, it was noted that the decorative caps felt out of place, and instead, a simple 45-degree bevel cut at the top of the posts would be more fitting and cohesive with the design. A motion was made and approved to accept these modifications: removing the caps, adding the 45-degree bevel, limiting fence posts to a maximum height of 7 feet, and planting vines on metal posts visible from the road to help screen them.

Motion: A motion was made through Staff by Pohl to remove the caps, adding the 45-degree bevel, limiting fence posts to a maximum height of 7 feet, and planting vines on metal posts visible from the road to help screen them.

Carried: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod

7. John Mansfield 15 Fair St VIEW Alterations 42.3.2/129 Val Oliver

Sitting: Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: Welch; Agent: Oliver

Holly Backus: The Thomas and Anna Folder Coffin House, dating back to circa 1797 in the Fish Lots, is a typical Nantucket structure that evolved into a Federal Greek Revival style. Historically, white paint contained white lead, giving it a softer, slightly brownish-gray tone, unlike the brighter whites introduced in the 1920s with titanium dioxide. This historical context, shared by architectural historian Brian Feifer, supports using earth-toned or muted colors rather than high-gloss or stark white. The proposed garage door change to French doors without kick panels aligns with the existing style. The use of an Essex green color for the basement, reflecting historical contrasts seen in an 1880s photo, is appropriate.

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: on Fair Street, there are no other white-painted buildings, so a white facade appears too formal for the area. Mickey agrees with Holly that an off-white or softer color would be better. Additionally, the second set of French doors on the rear wing has too much fenestration and is an inappropriate style; a single door with a window would be more suitable.

Board Discussion: Concerns were raised about the white paint color, with preference toward a historic off-white shade. There was debate over the placement and design of shutters as well as the French doors on the side elevation. The proposed color for the shutters and front door is Essex green, aligning with historic color choices.

Motion: Motion to approve through staff with the applicant bringing in white color samples for Holly to approve the color, leave off the middle shutter for now and remaining shutters and door to be Essex green made by Camp.

Carried: Pohl, Camp, Macleod, Patten, Paul

8. Neverblue, LLC 4 Van Fleet Cir New Main House 91/111 CWA

Sitting: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill; Alternates: Paul; Recused Oliver

Board Discussion: The main concern was the building's rear elevation facing Tom Nevers Park, as its large second-floor windows could create significant night-time pollution visible from the park. The board agreed that further reducing fenestration on the second floor of this elevation was necessary. A specific suggestion was made to replace a large four-gang window with a combination of double-hung windows separated by shingles to break up the mass and reduce light impact. Given the building's distance from the road and natural scrubby vegetation at the rear, the board was comfortable approving these fenestration reductions as part of an "Exhibit A" amendment.

Motion: Motion to approve with an "Exhibit A" made by Thornewill.

Carried: Welch, Camp, Macleod, Patten, Thornewill

9. Neverblue, LLC 4 Van Fleet Cir Guest House 91/111 CWA

Sitting: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill; Alternates: Paul; Recused Oliver

Board Discussion: No Concerns

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Camp – Carried: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill

10. Neverblue, LLC 4 Van Fleet Cir Garage 91/111 CWA

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten; Recused: Oliver

Board Discussion: No Concerns

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Paul – Carried: Welch, Camp, Macleod, Pohl, Paul

11. ACK 11 Pleasant St LLC 11 Pleasant St Addition 42.3.3/121 Studio Ppark

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill

Holly Backus The 1750s typical Nantucket house previously retained its character-defining bay window from the 1920s in the last revision, but it is now proposed for removal. The recommendation is to retain the bay window as much as possible, as it is a long-standing feature important to the building's historic character. While interior changes are understandable, the exterior, especially this main block feature, should be preserved. Adjusting the rear French doors from triple to double may help accommodate keeping the bay window intact. The removal of an atypical second-floor balcony is appreciated, and the elevation is only partially visible from Pleasant Street.

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: Sanborn maps indicate the bay window was added between 1909 and 1923, and it was suggested that this feature be retained. There were also concerns raised about the triple French doors on the west elevation.

Board Discussion: Concerns were also raised about the location of stairs near the proposed garage, suggesting they be moved inboard. Two motions were made: one to approve the design with the bay window appended to the shed and stairs moved inboard, which failed; and a second motion to approve the simpler shed design without the bay window, also with the stairs relocated. The discussion highlighted differing opinions on preserving historic elements versus design simplicity, with the need for further revisions to proceed.

Motion: Motion to hold for revisions made by MacLeod – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Macleod, Camp, Oliver

12. ACK 11 Pleasant St, LLC 11 Pleasant St Garage 42.3.3/121 Studio Ppark

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill

Holly Backus: The historic bay window, added between 1909 and 1923, was recommended to be retained due to concerns about preserving this character-defining architectural element.

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: Structure still feels too large.

Board Discussion: The board wanted a garage design that better complemented the historic main architectural character of the house.

Motion: Motion to hold for revisions made by MacLeod- Carried: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Macleod, Oliver

13. Tigerlily Nom Trust 7 Barnabus Ln Rev 7689; garage 41/563 Studio Ppark

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill

Board Discussion: There was a question about whether the building could be moved deeper into the site, but it seems that decision was mostly finalized. Val noted that the design and materials are consistent with the neighborhood and didn't see an issue. The fascia was considered too wide compared to others nearby, so it was suggested to lower and reduce its size, dropping it by about 4 inches to allow room for gutters and to better fit the context. They agreed that this adjustment would make the building fit in better.

Motion: Motion to approve with an "Exhibit A" made by MacLeod – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, Macleod

14. Actually Ours, LLC 13 Mizzenmast Garage apt 66/378 Brook Meerbergen

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten

Board Discussion: No concerns

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Oliver – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp, Macleod

15. Michelle Kolb 27 N. Liberty St VIEW Garage 41/45 Self

Sitting: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: There is still concern that the building is too close to the road and could be moved back slightly, likely shifting to the left. The side door facing North Liberty feels awkward and would be less noticeable if changed to a baton-style door. Additionally, the French doors facing the lily pond have panes that are too horizontally oriented and need adjustment, as does a small basement window facing southeast.

Board Discussion: Concerns were raised about the rear French doors' pane configuration, suggesting they be changed from three to two doors with more vertical panes for better proportion and reduced visibility, especially in winter. The front entrance door was recommended to be a simple batten-style storm door for authenticity. Clarification was given that the building is set back about 12 feet from the street behind a picket fence along the sidewalk. It was noted that the basement doors provide essential light, so reducing doors too much might impact interior lighting. A motion was made and approved to accept these changes as an exhibit, with the door adjustments and more vertical windowpanes on the rear elevation. Some members noted the possibility of adding a window if doors are reduced, which would require further review.

Motion: Motion to approve as an "Exhibit A" with the front door being a batten door with a diamond in it; triple doors in basement rear reduced to 2 doors; windows in basement door to be vertical made by Camp – Carried: Welch, Camp, Macleod, Patten, Thornewill

16. Starboard and Port, LLC 12 Baltimore St New Dwelling-GH 60.2.4/75 Emeritus, LTD

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Patten, Paul

Board Discussion: No Significant concerns were raised by the board members.

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Oliver – Carried Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod

17. Scrambled, LLC 47 Hulbert Av Fenestration/trim 29/15 BPC

Sitting: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill; Agent: Paul

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: opposed the use of two-over-one windows, feeling the glazing was too extensive, particularly on the north side. He recommended switching to six-over-six windows and suggested adding more shingle interruptions around the glass areas for better visual balance.

Board Discussion: Suggestions included using pan windows for a more charming look, as the current design appeared hollow. Support was noted for the existing variety of window styles in the neighborhood. Recommendations also called for more shingle exposure, different window configurations, and a preference for six-over-one or six-over-six window styles.

Motion: Motion to approve as submitted made by Pohl – Carried: Welch, Pohl, Patten - Opposed: Camp, Macleod

18. 89 Easton Nom Tr**89 Easton St****Hardscape****42.4.4/21****BPC****Sitting:** Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill; Agent: Paul

Public Comment: Mickey Rowland, et al: The brick retaining wall around the underground garage is seen as awkward and unnecessary, as the original property featured a low stone berm without brick. While brick is appropriate for the foundation, natural stone would be better suited for the retaining wall, which doesn't need to project above grade and could be lowered significantly. The raised planting bed along the street should be eliminated or lowered to create a more natural, informal berm with stones rather than a formal, raised bed. There's ample space to remove the raised bed due to the building being moved over.

Board Discussion: The retaining wall height was reduced from 24 to 15 inches and extended in length. Vining material was added on the uphill side of the driveway. Additionally, a previously proposed shower and pergola were removed from the plans, also the board suggested the applicant create a mall two-square foot stone wall mock-up for visual review

Motion: Motion to approve through staff with the retaining wall on west side of the sloping driveway to garage to follow the grade and to be stone instead of brick through Exhibit A made by MacLeod – Carried: Welch, MacLeod, Camp – Opposed: Pattern – Abstention: Pohl

19. Boulevard Prop Grp**20 Main St****Pool****73.3.1/50****Linda Williams****Sitting:** Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates; none**AGENT NOT PRESENT****VI. VI. NEW BUSINESS 04/15/2025**

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Ten Straight Wharf LLC	10 Straight Wharf	Rev. 10021; Addition	42.3.1/137	LFW
2.	Kim Glowacki	5 Meader St.	New secondary dwelling	42.2.3/40	LFW

- Hold until 7/8/2025 per applicant

VII. VII. NEW BUSINESS 05/06/2025

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Mary Kay & Warner Peacock	6 Fargo Way	Renovation	14/61.1	CWA

- Hold until 7/1/2025 per applicant

VIII. VIII. NEW BUSINESS 05/20/2025

	<u>Na Name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Leslie Wyrzes	10R Academy Ln	Demo move off cottage	42.4.3/86.1	Thornewill Design
	• Hold until 7/15/2025				
2.	Leslie Wyrzes	10R Academy Ln	New cottage	42.4.3/86.1	Thornewill Design
	• Hold until 7/1/2025				
3.	West Ashored, LLC	62 Wanoma Way	MH color chg	92/16	Talissa Kungler
4.	West Ashored, LLC	62 Wanoma Way	Garage color chg	92/16	Talissa Kungler
5.	West Ashored, LLC	62 Wanoma Way	Cottage color chg	92/16	Talissa Kungler

AGENT NOT PRESENT

Approved Minutes	N/A
Motion Roll-call Vote	
Review Minutes	
Other Business	• Next HDC Meeting July 1 st , 2025 @ 4pm
Potential Items for Discussion	• Discussion on distinguishing between solid and veneer brick on chimneys and foundations. • Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings and historic dwellings. • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demos and options for house moves • Value of written submission and submission deadlines.

Adjournment: 7.06 pm**Motion: Motion to adjourn**

Vote: Motion was passed by a unanimous

et Old Historic District

Sconset Old Historic District

Madaket Old Village