



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes April 8, 2025

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Stephen Welch, Chairman called the meeting at 4:02 pm

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod (via zoom)

Associate Commissioners: Constance Patten, Joe Paul, Carrie Thornewill

Staff: Holly Backus, Cathy Flynn, Sara Johnson, Aleksandar Trifunovic

II. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION AND/OR VOTE

- HDC Meeting and Deadline Schedule 4/29/2025 – 7/22/2025

Board: Welch, Oliver, Macleod Camp and Pohl

Val Oliver made the motion to approve.

Motion carries unanimously.

III. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION

- Nantucket Fire Department: solar panel systems permitting.

Board: Welch, Oliver, Macleod Camp and Pohl

Val Oliver made the motion to approve.

Motion carries unanimously.

IV. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

V. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Shaylyn Maquire- 12171	10 Honeysuckle Dr	Shed	68/891	Self	SW
2.	Nancy/Brian Harris- 12312	7 Arkansas Ave	As-Built bumpout	59.4/217	Self	SW

Board: Welch, Oliver, Macleod Camp and Pohl

Ray Pohl made the motion to approve consent.

Motion carries unanimously.

VI. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Peshnachki, Vlatko- 12237	10 Lewis Ct	New shed	67/155	Sanne Payne	AM
2.	African Meeting House-	27/29 York Street	Rev. 72454; add cap to post	55.4.1/177&178	Marsha Fader	SW

- Shed doors and picture window not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity.

- "Federal style" cap to be used as shown in the drawing.

Board: Welch, Oliver, Macleod Camp and Pohl

Val Oliver made the motion to approve consent with conditions.

Motion carries unanimously.

VII. OLD BUSINESS 03/25/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Dukes Rd Tr/S. Cohen-11860	2 Dukes Rd	Revisions to move only	41/187	Levesque Builders	CP
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none; Recused: Pohl</i>				<i>Last heard 3/11/25</i>	

The house has been advertised extensively and met with 15-20 potential buyers, but were unable to find a suitable location to move it. The house posed challenges for relocation.

Holly Backus recommended preserving the house, a contributing structure from around 1940, either on-site or off-site.

The board voted unanimously to hold the application for additional information, with the hope of exploring more options for moving or preserving the house.

Motion to hold for additional information made by Joe Paul - carried with Welch, Connie, Abby, Angus, and Joe

2.	Smiley 15 N. Water, LLC- 11765	15 N. Water ST	Rev. 10399; Roof/trim clr	42.4.2/50	Normand Residential	
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten</i>				<i>Last Heard 2/4/2025</i>	

Holly Backus: This is the Hussey house, circa 1795. Recommended keeping the house natural and simple, suggested against adding too many decorative elements.

Mickey Rowland had concerns about the shutters, feeling they seemed to "dress up" the simple Quaker-style house.

Board discussion: Appreciating the color choice. Preferring a simpler approach. Suggesting fewer decorative elements.

Motion to approve with conditions: Winter Solstice gray color. Removing the shutters. Adding three vertical muntins to the skylight.

Made by Abby - carried Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul

3.	3 Pops Lane Trust- 11083	3 Pops Lane	New Dwelling	60.2.4/64.1	Mark Cutone Arch +	
	• <i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; Alternate: Patten</i>				<i>Last Heard 3/11/2025</i>	

Holly Backus critiqued the 3 Pops Lane application, emphasizing that key concerns remained unaddressed. She recommended using shingles instead of horizontal cedar boards, removing modern connectors, and further reducing the structure's ridge height to better preserve Old Madaket's historical character.

Public comment:

Bruce Mandel argued that the development is out of character for Old Madaket, criticizing the large scale and width of the structures, calling the design insensitive to the neighborhood's rural character, and claiming the buildings block important views.

Paul and Jean Moran expressed concern about the development's size, stated that the project doesn't belong in Old Madaket, and emphasized their long-term commitment to preserving the area's character.

Linda Williams raised concerns about title issues and potential conflicts of interest, argued that the development is too large and visible, claimed insufficient changes were made to previous designs, and suggested a site visit would reveal the project's inappropriate scale.

Sara Hendrickson recommended a site visit to properly evaluate the development, highlighted the project's massive scale of over 5,000 square feet, and emphasized the need to assess its impact from various viewpoints.

Mary Jane MacLean described the area as the last "laid-back, unpretentious" summer experience, argued that the project disregards the unique natural environment, and claimed the development would negatively impact the area's charm.

The board discussed the 3 Pops Lane application, with concerns primarily focused on the design's scale, gable configuration, and fenestration. Board members noted the structure's length, multiple gables, and window heights as potential issues for the Madaket neighborhood. They suggested modifications including reducing window and door heights, showing basement windows, modifying gable orientations, and addressing connector pieces. Despite these concerns, the board saw potential in the single-story design. Ultimately, they voted unanimously to hold the application for revisions, with Ray Pohl making the motion, seeking a design more consistent with the area's historical character.

The motion to hold for revisions was made by Ray – carried by Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod and Paul.

4.	3 Pops Lane Trust- 11084	3 Pops Lane	Guest House	60.2.4/64.1	Mark Cutone Arch +	
----	--------------------------	-------------	-------------	-------------	--------------------	--

- **Track**
- 5. **3 Pops Lane Trust- 11087** **3 Pops Lane** **Garage** **60.2.4/64.1** **Mark Cutone Arch +**
- **Track**
- 6. **3 Pops Lane Trust- 11085** **3 Pops Lane** **Pool** **60.2.4/64.1** **Mark Cutone Arch +**
- **Track**
- 7. **Blue Sunday - 11850** **3 Nobadeer Ave** **New Dwelling** **80/46** **George Berg**
 - **Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul** **Last Heard 2/18/2025**
 - The board reviewed the property, suggesting improvements to the design's symmetry, facade simplicity, and roof details, while appreciating some changes and recommending adjustments to enhance the elevation's appearance and alignment.
 - Pohl made the motion to approve through exhibit A
 - Motion carries unanimously
- 8. **Blue Sunday - 11847** **3 Nobadeer Ave** **Pool** **80/46** **George Berg**
 - **Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul**
 - The board was satisfied with the pool's location and design, and unanimously approved the application with the condition of maintaining the vegetative buffer and adding the Belgian block at the property line.
 - Pohl made the motion to approve through exhibit A
 - Motion carries unanimously
- 9. **88 Pocomo Trust - 11855** **88 Pocomo** **Guest House** **15/42** **Emeritus LTD**
 - **Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Paul; Alternates: Patten** **Last Heard 2/18/2025**
 - The board discussed a proposed guest house near an existing pool and cabana, noting its low visibility due to significant vegetation and a lowered plate height, while generally supporting the design but emphasizing the need for a visibility condition to ensure the below-grade portion remains hidden, especially in light of a proposed pergola intended to visually connect the structures.
 - Paul made the motion to approve the guest house with the condition that the below-grade portion of the structure must remain non-visible from the time of inspection onward.
 - Motion carries unanimously
- 10. **John Wise - 10309** **36 Tennessee** **New Dwelling** **59.4/79** **Emeritus LTD**
 - **Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Macleod, Paul; Alternates: none** **Last heard 3/11/2025**
 - The board reviewed recent design changes, including lowered ridge and eave heights, revised roof slopes, and reduced second-floor windows, but concerns remained about massing, particularly that the wings didn't appear subordinate and ridge lines lacked distinction; while visibility from Heather Creek was limited due to vegetation and angle, the board made additional suggestions regarding gable pitch, door alignment, window proportions, and the use of architectural details like the chimney to enhance differentiation.
 - Abby made the motion to approve through exhibit A
 - Motion carries unanimously
- 11. **Giles Gregory - 10745** **48 York St** **Add to Main Dwelling** **55.4.1/55** **LINK**
 - **Commissioners: Pohl, MacLeod, Patten; Mullin: Welch, Paul Alternates: none** **Last heard 3/04/2025**
 - The board discussed: To improve the roofline, it's recommended to drop the main gable eave to meet the porch roof for a continuous plane or lower the gable plate height by 6 inches for a broken-back roof, while addressing imbalanced proportions on the north elevation by reducing the top plate height of the new gable; additional suggestions include using appropriately scaled windows in the south elevation dormers, refining the roof transition, and adding a chimney for architectural appeal.
 - The motion to hold for revisions was made by Welch.
 - Motion carries unanimously
- 12. **30 Eel Point LLC - 11968** **30 Eel Point Rd** **New Dwelling** **40/44.1** **LINK**
 - **Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, Macleod; Alternates: Patten, Paul** **Last heard 3/18/2025**
 - The HDC reviewed a proposed new structure to replace an existing shed near Hill Point Road, close to the pool and cabana. Board members appreciated the reduction of windows on the second-floor gables and the minimal height of the structure, believing it would be barely visible from public ways. They also emphasized maintaining existing vegetation. Although the 900 sq ft limit for ADUs did not apply, the structure would be unobtrusive, and both the pool house and cat cabana are open-air.
 - Camp made the motion to approve the project subject to the submission of the April 8 site plan from Teddy King, with the specific requirement that the plan must include two-dimension lines indicating the distance from the proposed structure to the property line.
 - Motion carries unanimously

VIII. OLD BUSINESS 04/08/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Michele Kolb-10270	27 N Liberty- VIEW	Garage	41/453	Self
	<i>Commissioners: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Paul; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten</i> <i>Last heard 5/28/2024</i> The board discussed the proposed two-story garage with an apartment at 27 North Liberty Street, expressing concerns about its height, proximity to the street, window proportions, and ornate garage doors; board members suggested modifications such as moving the second-floor gable back, simplifying the design, reducing the structure's height, and reconsidering its proximity to the street, with additional recommendations to move the garage further back and possibly reduce it to a one-story structure. Abby made the motion to hold the application for revisions. Motion carries unanimously				
2.	85 Orange LLC-10613	85 Orange St	Addition	55.4.1/27	Christopher Anderson
	<i>Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none</i> <i>Last heard 3/25/2025</i> The board discussed design changes, including revised windows, modified front door and stoop, and roof adjustments, with a focus on ensuring architectural consistency; board members recommended replicating historic trim details, matching window and door trim to historic photos, and considering a small hip roof over the secondary door to maintain the structure's historical integrity. The motion to hold for revisions via Exhibit A was made by Paul. Motion carries unanimously				
3.	85 Orange LLC-10609	85 Orange St	Rear hardscape	55.4.1/27	Christopher Anderson
	<i>Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none</i> <i>Last heard 3/25/2025</i> The board discussed the rear hardscape at 85 Orange Street, focusing on reducing non-permeable surfaces, adding shell squares and a gate, and proposing brick details on the Cottage Street side, with concerns about the reflective appearance of proposed shell driveways and suggestions for more greenery, driveway material changes, and narrower driveways, ultimately approving the design with minor revisions. Joe Paul made the motion to hold for minor revisions. Motion carries unanimously				
4.	85 Orange LLC-10610	85 Orange St	Front hardscape	55.4.1/27	Christopher Anderson
	<i>Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Paul; Alternates: none</i> <i>Last heard 3/25/2025</i> The board discussed the proposed front hardscape at 85 Orange Street—including pea stone with brick trim, a brick walkway, antique curbing, and green-jointed pavers—offering feedback on design formality, suggesting more vegetation, a narrower driveway, climbing hydrangeas, and expressing concern about a utility piece intended for shaded bicycle storage. Abby made a motion to approve with the condition of adding climbing hydrangeas. Motion carries unanimously.				
5.	Bridges Family LLC-11892	6 Ishmael Rd	New dwelling	82/91	Val Oliver
	<i>Commissioners: Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Thornewill and Patten; Alternates: none; Mullin: Welch</i> <i>Last heard 3/4/2025</i> SKIPPED				
6.	Fourteen Tautemo Wy RT-12028	14 Tautemo Wy	Shed	83/13	Emeritus LTD
	<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Patten, MacLeod; Alternates: Paul</i> <i>Last heard 4/1/2025</i> The design for two structures with similar roof pitches includes a continuous eave design, vertical French doors, and simplified garage doors; the cupola was removed, and concerns about door height were raised, but overall, the structures are well-screened by vegetation and will not be visible from the road, with the final design maintaining the roof alignment and simplifications. Pohl made a motion to approve both structures as submitted, Motion carries unanimously.				
7.	Fourteen Tautemo Wy RT-12027	14 Tautemo Wy	Out building	83/13	Emeritus LTD
	<i>Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Patten, MacLeod; Alternates: Paul</i> <i>Last heard 4/1/2025</i> The design for two structures with similar roof pitches includes a continuous eave design, vertical French doors, and simplified garage doors; the cupola was removed, and concerns about door height were raised, but overall, the structures are well-screened by vegetation and will not be visible from the road, with the final design maintaining the roof alignment and simplifications. Pohl made a motion to approve both structures as submitted, Motion carries unanimously.				

8. Johnson, Brendan P Tr-11852 **2 Hamblin-VIEW** Boat barn 30/193 Emeritus LTD
 • *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Paul* *Last heard 3/25/2025*
 The board was discussing a revised building design, focusing on simplification and proportion. Key points included appreciation for the removal of the cupola, concerns about the dormer placement and spacing between windows, and suggestions to simplify garage doors to better fit a utilitarian aesthetic. There was general agreement that the previous design—with flush dormers and larger windows—was more successful. The board ultimately supported changes including returning to flush dormers, simplifying garage doors by removing glass, and lowering the roofline so the eave meets the top of the second-floor windows.
 Ray made the motion to approve through exhibit A, Motion carries unanimously.
9. O'Brien Peter- 12019 8 Newtown Ln Roof dormer addition 55/581.1 JB Studio
 • *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Paul, MacLeod; Alternates: Patten,* *Last heard 3/18/2025*
 The board discussed design modifications for a building's dormers. It was suggested to push the front dormer back to reduce visible shingle space and to reduce the roof pitch on the rear dormer to make it less visually heavy. There was also concern about the appropriateness of the front dormer, with some proposing it be removed or significantly modified. The need to simplify the front dormer by thinning trim and pushing it back was agreed upon. After further discussion, a motion was made to push the front dormer back one foot, eliminate the shadow board, and reduce the trim for a lighter appearance.
 Ray made the motion to approve through exhibit A, Motion carries unanimously.
10. 7 Brewster LLC-11959 7 Brewster Rd Garage 54/286 LFW
 • *Commissioners: Pohl, Camp, Patten, Welch* *Last heard 3/4/2025*
 The board unanimously approved the revised building plans, which included simplifying the driveway access, updating the retaining wall, reducing the front parking area, and changing the trim color to dove gray and windows to a 6-over-1 style.
 Welch made a motion to approve as submitted: Motion carries unanimously

IX. NEW BUSINESS 02/18/2025

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Georgi Dimov- 11906	3 Miles Court	Solar Roof	68/187.2	Georgi Dimov	RP
	NO SHOW					

X. NEW BUSINESS 3/4/25 - VIEW

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Kalin Rachel Lynn Tr 12109	11 Pine St.	Hardscape	42.3.3/24.1	Ahern LLC	SW
	• <i>Commissioners: Pohl, Camp, Paul, Welch, MacLeod</i>					

The board discussed a hardscape design featuring a town garden with pea stone, brick trim, a brick walkway, antique granite curbing, and a gravel patio, with feedback suggesting more vegetation, a narrower driveway, and a softer, less formal appearance, while also expressing concern over a utility piece for bicycle storage, which was explained to be in a shady area.

Abby made the motion to approve the hardscape with the condition of adding climbing hydrangeas to the fence on the north side of the driveway. Welch, Pohl, Camp, Paul voted Yes, MacLeod voted No.

Ray Pohl made the motion to approve the minutes: October 22, 2024, November 5, 2024, December 17, 2024 and February 18, 2025; 3-2 (Angus- abstained; Stephen- No)

Minutes for March 11, 2025 were held for review.

Motion to adjourn at 8:26PM made by Abby 5-0