



Approved HDC Minutes-May 27, 2025; adopted July 1, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

~~ MINUTES~~

Tuesday, May 27, 2025

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Stephen Welch called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

Staff in Attendance:	Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Fiona Johnson, Administrative Specialist
Attending Members:	Welch, Patten, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill
Remote Participants:	Pohl & Paul
Absent Members:	-
Late Arrivals:	Camp (4:08 PM)
Early Departures:	Paul

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Motion:	Motion to approve. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten, Oliver (Aye)

I. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

- **Election of Officers**
- **Appointment of CPC representative**

Discussion:	Abby Camp - Nominated Welch for Chair. - Nominated Connie Patten for CPC Representative. Val Oliver - Nominated Pohl for Vice Chair. The Commission - Unanimously re-elected Welch as Chair and Pohl as Vice Chair (5-0). - Unanimously appointed Connie Patten as CPC Representative.
Motion 1:	Motion to re-elect Stephen Welch as Chair. (Made By: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Pohl, Oliver (Aye)
Motion 2:	Motion to reelect Ray Pohl as Vice Chair. (Made By: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Pohl, Oliver (Aye)
Motion 3:	Motion to appoint Connie Patten as CPC Representative. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Pohl, Oliver (Aye)

II. COMMISSIONER Q & A WITH PRESERVATION PLANNER

Discussion:	Holly Backus - Reminded board CLG meeting needed before end of June.
-------------	--

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>	
1.	Chris Clark 12460	10 Milk St	Roof	42.3.3/163	Boris Braun	AC
	<i>Date of construction c.177 Zaccheus Macy House NAN.676 to be added to COA</i>					
2.	Peter Holmes 12475	22 Liberty	Roof change	42.3.4/114	Jim Lydon	AC
	<i>Date of construction c. 1800 Andrew Gardner House to be added to COA</i>					
3.	Hither Creek Boat Yard 12474	56 Washington Ave	Roof change	59.4/347	Jim Lydon	AC
	<i>Date of construction c. 1979 to be added to COA</i>					

Motion:	Motion to approve Consent with Conditions. (Made By: Patten)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten, Oliver (Aye)

IV. VIEWS REQUESTED FROM 5/20/2025 MEETING

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Georgi Dimov- 11906	3 Miles Court	Solar Roof	68/187.2	Georgi Dimov
Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver; ALT: Pohl, Paul				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.				
Representative:	None				
Discussion:	Val Oliver -Recommended removal of east-facing upper panels due to visibility.				
Motion:	Motion to approve through Exhibit A with condition to remove upper roof east panels and maintain vegetation. (Made by: Oliver)				
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)				
2.	Marty McGowan-12577	88 Somerset Rd	Roof top solar	66/405	ACK Smart
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver; ALT none				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.				
Representative:	Tobias Glidden				
Discussion:	Angus MacLeod -Requested additional planting where panel was visible.				
Motion:	Motion to approve with vegetative screening on 88 Somerset Rd due to extremely limited visibility. Planting location added to Exhibit A. (Made by: Oliver)				
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver, Pohl (Aye)				

V. OLD BUSINESS 04/29/25

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Boulevard Prop Grp- 10839	20 Main St	Pool	73.3.1/50	Linda Williams
Voting:	Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver; ALT- none				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.				
Representative:	Linda Williams				
Discussion:	The Commission -Stated that proposed fencing would negatively impact streetscape. -Request for additional vegetation detail and clarification on proposed gate. Public Comment -Rob Benchley, et al stated proposed pool and fencing contradicted property's advertised historic character.				
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions with clear plans showing fence/gate details, landscape layout, and plant placement. (Made by: Oliver)				

Approved HDC Minutes-May 27, 2025; adopted July 1, 2025

Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver, Pohl (Aye)
-------	---

VI. OLD BUSINESS 5/13/2025

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. George Metri 10334	12 Angola St	Retaining wall	54.4.4/78	KMLD
Voting:	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Thornewill, Patten; ALT- none			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Katie Mitchell			
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Cited 2024 approvals; noted current plans still show double walls despite prior board direction to simplify. Requested a full cross-section with grade changes and recommended naturalized design. The Commission - Requested visual stakes at final wall heights and confirmation of abutter coordination. - Supported natural materials; asked for wall separation near dwelling and potential safety fencing Public Comment -Mickey Rowland urged coordination with neighbor and consolidation to one wall. -Ann Duez representing 19 families and abutter Pam Clark; opposed 9' wall, called plan unchanged since 2024. -Fred Mueller stated that a smaller house would have negated need for walls. -Ann Davis found walls industrial and out of character; supported berming or natural slope.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for view with staked wall heights and confirmation of agreement with the neighbor. (Made by: Welch)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Thornewill, Patten, Welch, Pohl (Aye)			

VII. OLD BUSINESS 5/27/2025

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Ack Mid Island LLC- 12393	18-26- Sparks Ave	Hardscape	55/231.1	LFW
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; ALT- none; Recused: Oliver			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	George Berg			
Discussion:	Abby Camp -Opposed due to excessive hardscape. The Commission - Requested planting trees of 5" caliper in front, 4" in rear. -Requested 6' board fence with Type II cap (natural to weather), plantings every three sections.			
Motion:	Motion to approve with conditions: trees should be 5" caliper on front side, maybe 4" on back side. 6' cedar board fence with type 2 cap NTW, plant every 3 sections. Plants to be installed and maintained at time of inspection and thereafter, and dark sky-compliant lighting (Made by: Pohl)			
Vote:	Carried 4-1 // MacLeod, Patten, Welch, Pohl (Aye) Camp (Nay)			

2. Wolfram Family Tr- 12246	7 Folger Ln	Pergola	42.4.4/33.3	WAPD
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver ALT: Thornewill			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Michael Luft			
Discussion:	Abby Camp - Found pergola too modern for the structure and location.			

Approved HDC Minutes-May 27, 2025; adopted July 1, 2025

	Angus MacLeod -Concurs with Camp. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland, et al acknowledged improvements; still suggested more traditional detailing, particularly clearer column caps.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 3-2// Welch, Pohl, Oliver (Aye); Camp, MacLeod (Naye)

3. 11 Pleasant St ACK - 12251 11 Pleasant St. New garage 42.3.3/121 Studio Ppark				
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver; ALT: Thornewill			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	James Krapp			
Discussion:	The Commission -Felt massing remained too close to main house. -Suggested shifting garage further from house and placing stair inside. -Requested further height reduction and simplification of dormers. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland supported changes but requested further reduction in height and mass; suggested simplifying dormers.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions. (Made by: Pohl)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Oliver (Aye)			

4. 11 Pleasant St ACK 12257 11 Pleasant St. Addition 42.3.3/121 Studio Ppark				
Voting:	Camp, MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Oliver ALT: Thornewill			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	James Krapp			
Discussion:	The Commission -Felt the proposed addition was too formal and crowded the site. -Expressed concern that the second-floor deck was inappropriate -Stated Bay window should either be eliminated or better integrated, depending on age/originality. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland recommended removing second-floor deck, further setback from existing gable, and evaluating bay window age to determine compatibility.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions. Provide documentation/survey of bay windows history and condition. (Made by: MacLeod)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Oliver (Aye)			

5. JBL 34 Liberty St- 12161 34 Liberty St. Replace frnt dr/fnt windows 42.3.4/82 Sahkhrat Aziev				
Voting:	Welch, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod, Paul; ALT: Thornewill, Patten			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Sahkhrat Aziev			
Discussion:	The Commission -Restoration should be prioritized unless specific deterioration is documented. -Requested a full window survey keyed to the elevation, photos of existing sashes, and drawings of the door surround to evaluate the proposal properly. - Door surround needs to be documented. Suggests detailed drawing showing field measurements and a cross section thru this.			

Approved HDC Minutes-May 27, 2025; adopted July 1, 2025

	- Suggests ½” detail of the elevation section of the frontice. Show exterior and interior and sills. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland recommended restoration over replacement.
Motion:	Motion to hold for a ½” elevation and section detail of the frontice and if any windows are to be proposed to be removed that they are better documented with a window key on the elevation and imagery key to that reference. If the shutters are proposed to be removed or replaced provide documentation as part of the application. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, MacLeod, Welch, Paul, Oliver (Aye)

6. Robert L Roy Trust- 12386 25 Hussey St Guest Cottage 42.3.4/54 BPC				
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Patten; ALT: none; Agent- Paul			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Joe Paul			
Discussion:	The Commission -Expressed concerns regarding rear dormer visibility and overly contemporary garage doors -Requested vegetative screening and further simplification of fenestration Public Comment -Mickey Rowland supported garage preservation and suggested simpler fenestration and barn-like details. - Linda Williams, for abutters, opposed the length (61’), massing, and visibility from Crown Court and Lily Street; cited incompatibility with small-scale neighborhood structures.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions with demo to track. (Made by: Pohl)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Patten (Aye)			

7. Robert L Roy Trust- 12386 25 Hussey St Garage demo 42.3.4/54 BPC				
Held to Track				

8. Archer, John- 12381 14 Dukes Rd Gate – fence 41/60 Self				
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: none			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	John Archer			
Discussion:	The Commission -Found the application confusing and lacked clarity on exact proposed fence locations, visibility impacts, and materials. -Requested clearly labeled site plan with proposed fence lines, height, vegetation locations, and gate design. - Suggested moving fence inside property.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for revised plans and additional information. (Made by: Oliver)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)			

9. 37 Cliff Rd N.T.-12381 37 Cliff Rd Partial demo 42.4.4/42 Emeritus, LTD				
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Patten			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Matt MacEachern			
Discussion:	No Concerns			
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted (Made by: Oliver)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)			

X. NEW BUSINESS 05/06/2025

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Brad Guidi 12374	31 India St	Door replacement	42.3.4/135	Joan Guzman
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Joan Guzman			
Discussion:	The Commission - Requested the application be redirected as a like-kind replacement with accurate 1/2" or 1" scale elevation/section drawings showing TDLs and existing surround detail.			
Motion:	Motion to convert to like-kind application with required documentation. Providing a 1" or 1/2" scaled elevation and section with TDL windows. To be reviewed by the Preservation Planner. (Made by: MacLeod)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)			
2. Elizabeth Pagnam 12408	19 Lily St	Color change	42.4.3/42	Self
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Thornewill; Alternates: Oliver, Camp			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Cassie Pagnam			
Discussion:	The Commission - Agreed to assess color in real-world conditions - Requested final color patch (color 1634) applied to clapboards for site view next meeting. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland stated it was hard to assess color accurately online but noted the proposed "Nantucket Fog" appeared too blue; suggested choosing a version with more gray to remain compatible with the historic context.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for a view and painting the lower 3 clapboards, 2' long and 4 clapboards high #1634 sample, (Made by: MacLeod)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // MacLeod, Welch, Pohl, Patten, Thornewill (Aye)			
3. Carson Properties LLC 12420	12 New St	Hardscape wall apron	55/340	Studio Viburnum
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Camp			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Grayson Keller			
Discussion:	The Commission - Supported hardscape improvements but asked for sidewalk and apron to be running bond with no soldier course; requested fence be pulled back one panel from New Street and softened with vegetation; required climbing plants every third panel with half-moon cutouts at base.			
Motion:	Motion to approve with conditions: Eliminate border on the sidewalk and apron and eliminate one length of the 5/1 fence closest to New St. Add plantings every 3 sections thru Exhibit A.. (Made by: MacLeod)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)			
4. 60 Nobadeer Ave LLC 12418	60 Nobadeer Ave	Gates arbors	88/10	Studio Viburnum
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Thornewill; Alternates: Camp			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Representative:	Grayson Keller			
Discussion:	-			
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Pohl)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)			

Approved HDC Minutes-May 27, 2025; adopted July 1, 2025

5.	3 Pochick Surside LLC 12454	3 Pochick Ave	New MH	80/232	WAPD
Hold 3 Pochick applications until 6/3/25 per applicant					
6.	3 Pochick Surside LLC 12457	3 Pochick Ave	New Garage	80/232	WAPD
7.	3 Pochick Surside LLC 12471	3 Pochick Ave	Pool Hardscape	80/232	Ahern LLC
8.	3 Pochick Surside LLC 12472	3 Pochick Ave	Pergola	80/232	Ahern LLC
9.	3 Pochick Surfside LLC 12456	3 Pochick Ave	New shed	80/232	WAPD
10.	3 Pochick Surfside LLC 12455	3 Pochick Ave	Office structure 1	80/232	WAPD
11.	3 Pochick Surfside LLC 12453	3 Pochick Ave	Wellness structure 2	80/232	WAPD

12. VTT 4 Pocomo, LLC **12545** 4 Pocomo Rd Move on from 81 Pocomo 14/68.1 CWA

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten; Alternates: Thornewill, Camp
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Chip Webster
Discussion:	The Commission -Requested the structure slide west and set back further to reach 50 ft setback, increasing its distance from Pocomo Road by approximately 5 feet.
Motion:	Motion to approve with the structure to be relocated back to the 50-ft setback line moving West (Exhibit A). (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Patten, Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)

13. 20 Cliff Rd LLC **12463** 20 Cliff Rd Hardscape 42.4.4/52-53 Chuck Lenhart

APPLICATION HELD

14. Eight Sea St LLC **12436** 8 Sea St Rev alterations 42.4.2/51 Normand Residential

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ben Normand
Discussion:	The Commission -Requested revised cupola options with alternative size, roof pitch, and light configuration.
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions and additional information. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)

15. Tiple Stables LLC **12445** 14 Tripp Dr New dwelling 80/310 Cottage and Castle
 16. Tiple Stables LLC **12444** 14 Tripp Dr Garage 80/310 Cottage and Castle
 17. Tiple Stables LLC **12347** 14 Tripp Dr Shed 80/310 Cottage and Castle

APPLICATION(S) HELD

18. Aactually Ours LLC **12438** 13 Mizzenmast Garage apt 66/378 Brook Meerbergen

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod; Alternates: Thornewill, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ben Normand
Discussion:	The Commission -Found structure too large in scale and overwhelming compared to the main house; requested reduction in height, simplification of dormers and fenestration, and removal of cupola. -Suggested repositioning structure further back on lot or skewing to avoid setback issue.
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Camp, Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)

Approved HDC Minutes-May 27, 2025; adopted July 1, 2025

19.	7A New St Realty Tr 12452	7A New St	Fence & Gate	41/285.1	Waterscapes	AC
			APPLICATION HELD			
20.	Bernice Jitta BJ 12467	24 Arlington St	Plastic shed	76.1.3/285	Self	AC
			APPLICATION HELD			

XI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion:	Motion to approve 3/25/25, 4/29/25 and 5/13/25 as drafted. (Made By: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 3-1//, MacLeod, Camp, Pohl (Aye) Welch (Nay) Oliver (Abstained)

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion:	Motion to adjourn at 7:45PM . (Made By: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp (Aye)

YouTube Link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rd3NVlzGfvw>