



HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, March 18, 2025

**4 Fairgrounds Road and Remote Participation via Zoom Nantucket,
Massachusetts 02554**

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-chair), Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver, Angus McLeod
Associate Commissioners: Connie Patten, Carrie Thornewill

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Welch called the meeting to order at 4:03 pm

Staff in Attendance:	Fiona Johnson , Administrative Specialist, Cathy Flynn , Land Use Specialist, Holly Backus , Preservation Planner
Attending Members:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abbey Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Remote Participants:	Joe Paul
Absent Members:	Carrie Thornewill
Late Arrivals:	None
Early Departures:	None

I. CONSENT

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent	
1. Kara Driscoll- 12041	159A Main St	Window/repairs	41/288	Self	CP
2. Tripp Drive Stables- 12140	14 Tripp Dr	Rev.11501; shift house	80/310	Cottage Castle Inc	SW
3. Alessandra Soares- 12073	53A Essex Rd	Rev. 11682; shed-red	67/643.1	Self	AM
4. Town of Nantucket- 12217	6 Fairgrounds Rd	Rev. 6649; Fairgrounds A-win	67/918	Jeff Morgan	SW
5. Town of Nantucket- 12220	6 Fairgrounds Rd	Rev. 6647; Fairgrounds B- win	67/918	Jeff Morgan	SW
6. Town of Nantucket- 12221	6 Fairgrounds Rd/4 Waitt	Rev. 6643; Ticcoma A- wind	67/917-918	Jeff Morgan	SW
7. Town of Nantucket- 12223	6 Fairgrounds Rd	Rev. 6644; Ticoma B-wind/drm	67/918	Jeff Morgan	SW
8. Town of Nantucket- 12216	4 Waitt Drive	Rev. 6664; Shed 1- wind	67/917	Jeff Morgan	SW
9. Town of Nantucket- 12215	4 Waitt Drive	Rev 6663; Shed 3- wind	67/917	Jeff Morgan	SW
10. Town of Nantucket- 12218	4 Waitt Drive	Rev. 6646; maint shed win	67/917	Jeff Morgan	SW
11. Town of Nantucket- 12222	6 Fairgrounds Rd	Rev. 6645; Hardscape	67/917-918	Jeff Morgan	SW
12. Egidijus Meidus- 12147	12 Scotts Wy	Shed	67/487	LINK	SW
13. Deborah Windsor- 12193	29 Main St	Windows/replace garage door	73.3.1/9	Val Oliver	AC
14. Dan West- 12176	9 Towaddy Ln	Lift and addition	49.3.2/14.4	Thornewill Design	VO
15. Tom Donovan- 12182	104 Surfside	Shed	67/349	EMDA	VO
16. Steven Cohen Trust- 12184	36 Union St	Roof	42.3.2/144	EMDA	VO
17. Roman Catholic Bishop- 12183	46 Milestone Rd	New Dwelling	54/113.1	EMDA	VO
18. Carter Hill Jr Trust- 12178	6 Meetinghouse Ln	Additions	49/76.1	Thornewill Design	VO
19. 102 Old South Rd LLC- 12189	102 Old South Rd	Rooftop solar	68/436	Sun Wind LLC	AM
20. Holding. William- 12196	12 Blackfish Ln	Rev 11690 Pool eq enclosure	73/118	Ahern LLC	JP
21. Sunlight Dawn Holdings- 12208	183 Polpis Rd	Win/dr rep-retract awning	45/5	Shelter 7	JP
22. Hanson- 12210	7 Academy Ln	Roof walk NTW	42.4.3/108	Val Oliver	JP
23. ACK KODA LLC- 12206	42 Shimmo Pond Rd	Replace Dock Railing	43/126	Botticelli & Pohl	JP
24. NIR LLC -12204	15 S Beach	Replace seasonal Tent	42.4.2/57.1	William O'Brien	JP
25. M & K Crowe- 12153	3 Grey Lady Ln	Covered porch	66/713	Val Oliver	RP
26. Jackie Fey- 12162	19 Hawthorne Ln	Shed	56/267	Val Oliver	RP
27. Derek Taff- 12165	16 Paul Jones Rd	Gate and Fence	41/97.1	Waterscapes	RP
28. Valero, Gail & Richard- 12168	7 Waydale Rd	Cellar stairs move	55/84	Val Oliver	RP
29. Hendricks, John- 12169	1 Jefferson Ln	Fence	55.4.1/74.1	David Troast	RP
30. Neel Carlton- 12172	84 Pocomo Rd	Shed	15/40	EMDA	RP

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Paul
Recused:	Pohl, Oliver
Motion:	Motion to Approve (Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // carried unanimously

II. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent	
1. PASCON- 11970	4 MacLean Ln	Driveway/apron	55/44.1	LINK	SW
• Gate to be flanked by privet, privet planted parallel to property line along Larrabee Lane.					
2. Egidijus Meidus- 12146	12 Scotts Wy	Pool	67/487	LINK	SW
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
3. Egidijus Meidus- 12145	12 Scotts Wy	Spa	67/487	LINK	SW
• Spa not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
4. 25 N Pasture ACK LLC-12225	25 N Pasture Ln	Pool hardscape	44 75	LINK	CP
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
5. 25 N Pasture ACK LLC- 12226	25 N Pasture Ln	Cabana	44 75	LINK	CP
• Cabana not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity.					
6. Roman Catholic Bishop- 12181	46 Milestone Rd	New Garage	54/113.1	EMDA	VO
• Due to lack of visibility.					
7. Tom & Mary Jo McCann- 12167	35 Hummock Pond Rd	Rev. 10539; red 2'	56/6	Tom McCann	RP
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.					
8. Eagles Beach Nest LLC- 12194	14 Nonantum Ave	Sports Court	87/11	Matt Browley	AM
• Sports court must not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity.					
9. Richard Pietrafesa- 12071	42 York St	Shed	55.4.1/52.1	Self	AM
• Trim to be cottage red to match the house.					
Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod				
Alternates:	Patten, Paul				
Recused:	None				
Motion:	Motion to Approve (MacLeod)				
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // carried unanimously				

III. SIGNS

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Pepper Frazier	28 Center St	Master Sign Plan	2.3.1/164	Sign Here Nantucket
• Motion to approve through staff with the removal of Sign B (temporary sign), removal of menu box within 30 days and submission of updated image of Sign C with accurate dimensions.				
2. Pepper Frazier	28 Center St	Projecting Sign (Nantucket Events, CO)	42.3.1/164	Sign Here Nantucket
• Motion to approve as submitted.				
3. 21 Amelia Drive, LLC	21 Amelia Dr	Wall Sign (JC Nail Designer)	67/427	Josiane Silva
• Motion to approve with a border added to the sign.				

Voting:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abbey Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Alternates:	Patten, Paul
Recused:	
Motion:	Motion to approve per SAC recommendations. (Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abbey Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod

IV. COMMISSIONER Q&A W/ PRESERVATION PLANNER**V. COMMISSIONER REVIEW & VOTE**

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Town of Nantucket- 11598	43 Sherburne	OIH Hardscape	80/1	SMRT/Craig Piper
• Not anticipated by the Chair within 24 – 48 hours.				
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Joe Paul			
Alternates:	Connie Patten			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:	None			
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The board discussed several key points regarding 43 Sherburne. Joe Paul expressed concern about the proximity of the 8-foot-tall cedar enclosure around the generator to the road, suggesting it be pushed back further and that screening be added in front of it. The board agreed to approve the project as submitted, with the condition that the placement of the generator enclosure be adjusted and screening added. There was also a discussion about			

	using exposed aggregate concrete for the walkways, like the material used at Hayes Overlook, which the board supported. Overall, the board was generally supportive of the project, with minor design adjustments requested for the generator enclosure.
Motion:	Ray Pohl: motion to approve as submitted by adjusting the fencing around the enclosure and condition restriction to install exposed aggregate similar to what is at the Hayes property.
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod Joe Paul

VI. NEW BUSINESS 01/07/2025				
Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Browne & Clark- 11707	23 Ocean Ave	Addition pergola	73.3.1/19	Angus MacLeod
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Joe Paul, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Connie Patten			
Alternates:	None			
Recused:	Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl			
Representative:	Angus MacLeod			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:	Holly began by acknowledging the unique architectural style of the building being discussed, known as the "Double Decker," a Victorian Eclectic, which was built between 1856 and 1879 by Matthew Crosby. She noted that although the building predates Underhill's development, it was incorporated into the design of surrounding dwellings. While recognizing the presence of cross gables throughout the historic district, Holly expressed appreciation for the sensitive approach taken with the proposed addition, suggesting that it could remain subordinate in height to preserve the original character. She raised a specific architectural question about whether the character-defining chimney on the west side would remain unchanged, seeking clarification on the drawings provided.			
Public Comments:	Marsha Fader, A historical architect on the island, collaborating with historian Betsy Tyler, presented a comprehensive study regarding the history of the building at 23 Ocean. The study, based on old maps, photographs, and an examination of the structure itself, aimed to clarify misconceptions about the building's origins. The architect mentioned that the house was constructed between 1856 and 1879, long before Underhill's subdivision began, and highlighted its historical context, noting nearby structures such as a railroad station and a large hotel that showcase the architectural diversity of the area. The study also documented the evolution of the building, illustrating its original two-story design and various additions over the years, including the preservation of post-and-beam construction within its core. The architect emphasized the significance of maintaining the original style and form during discussions about any proposed changes to the structure. Linda Williams, representing an abutter, raised concerns about the lack of legal notice for the application, noting her client was omitted from the abutters' list, which constituted a defect. This prompted discussions about the inadequacy of the submitted list, which lacked certification from the town clerk. She supported previous comments, emphasizing that the building is approximately 170 years old. They argued that the proposed design overwhelms the historic character and that earlier revisions were inadequate. They requested a demolition plan due to the building's post-and-beam construction and urged the board to deny the application or require further revisions to maintain the structure's historical integrity. Sarah Alger, representing an abutter, agreed with previous comments made by Holly and Linda Williams regarding the application. She noted that while the building may not have been originally constructed by Underhill, it was purchased by him and served as inspiration for other Underhill Cottages. Sarah emphasized its historical significance and urged the commission to uphold its earlier decisions to send the application back for revisions.			
Commissioner Comments:	The board had a mixed discussion regarding the proposed addition to a historic structure. Some members felt the			

HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

	design was appropriate and aligned with existing architectural elements, citing that the gable mass did not overwhelm the original structure and appreciated the proposed trellis work. Others voiced concerns about the height and scale of the addition, stating it changed the essential nature of the building, which could disrupt its historic character. They expressed the need for a simpler, more harmonious design, and suggestions were made to lower the roofline to better match the original architecture. After deliberation, a motion to approve the application as submitted was voted on, resulting in a split decision (3-2.)
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted – Val Oliver
Vote:	Carried 3-2 // Oliver(aye),Paul(aye),Patten(aye),Camp(no),Welch(no)

VII. NEW BUSINESS 01/21/2025

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. NT Electric Co- 11863	10 New Whale	Demo Structure	42.3.1/37	LFW
Voting:	Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			
Alternates:				
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:	Holly addressed the board regarding the application for the demolition of 10 New Whale Street, a contributing industrial building constructed in 1927 for the Citizens Gas and Electric Power Company. She noted that the board previously expressed a desire to preserve and restore the building rather than demolish it. Holly emphasized its historical significance and suggested that the owners consider rehabilitating the structure, which could qualify for historic tax credits. She referenced a similar successfully restored building, the 1923 Sea Street Pump Station, as an example. Holly recommended that the structure be stabilized to eliminate hazards and urged the commission to consult a preservation engineer for further evaluation, reinforcing its importance within the historic district.			
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The board discussed the application for the demolition of the industrial building at 10 New Whale Street, highlighting its historical significance as a circa 1927 structure. Several members expressed concerns about the building's condition and whether it could be rehabilitated. One member noted the structural issues visible in the photographs, suggesting that the building may need to be taken down entirely due to safety hazards. Others emphasized the importance of preserving the cultural heritage represented by such utilitarian buildings and the need for any new construction to emulate the original structure's style. There was a consensus that if the building were to be demolished, plans should be made for a replacement building that replicates the original design to maintain the area's historical character. Discussions also acknowledged the challenges posed by the current state of the structure and the necessity for a preservation engineer to provide insights on possible restoration methods. Ultimately, some members expressed a willingness to support demolition only if it was linked to a commitment to construct a new building that reflects the historical significance of the original. The board continued discussing the application for the demolition of 10 New Whale Street, with various members expressing concerns about the building's historical significance and its deteriorating condition. Some members acknowledged that while the engineer provided insightful information regarding the structure's issues, they desired input from a preservation expert with specific expertise in masonry work. A motion was proposed to hold the application for more information regarding potential restoration options and to consult a preservation engineer. Members emphasized the need for clarity in the motion, suggesting that the applicant provide names of potential engineers to ensure that their qualifications are satisfactory before any further analysis. The discussion highlighted the importance of maintaining the integrity of historic structures while balancing safety concerns and the potential for future development in the area.			
Motion:	Motion is to hold the application for a report on its structural integrity and potential for restoration from an engineer or architect certified on a list from Preservation Mass or MHC – Angus MacLeod			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver,			

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 02/04/2025

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Georgi Dimov- 11906 3 Miles Court	Solar Roof	68/187.2	Georgi Dimov	RP
Voting:	Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver,			
Commissioner Comments:				
Motion:	Hold to the representative			
Vote:	N/A			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
2. The Whole Spread, LLC- 11947	332 Madaket Road	MH- Add Deck/guardrails	60/100	Emeritus, LTD

HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

Voting:	Ray Pohl(chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten
Alternates:	Joe Paul
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	The board reviewed the proposed crossbuck rails, with one member expressing appreciation for their aesthetic value but noting a disconnect with the design, particularly where the rails meet the stairway and what appeared to be bench seats. Given their height, a member questioned the lack of any glass or backing behind the rails and emphasized the importance of creating a cohesive design that integrates the rails with the surrounding elements. The board discussed the proposed crossbuck rails, with one member expressing support for retaining them on the north porch but suggesting their removal from the area where the benches and the stairs are. The member recommended a simpler horizontal handrail for the stairway instead, as it would be more appropriate for that setting. The board agreed that this adjustment would create a more cohesive design.
Motion:	Motion to allow the crossbucks on the front porch while eliminating them from the stairs with Exhibit A – Val Oliver
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Ray Pohl (chair) Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver, Connie Patten

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
3. Osprey Way RE Trust- 11945	One Osprey Way	Cottage- Addition	65/19	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Connie Patten, Joe Paul			
Alternates:	None			
Recused:	Ray Pohl			
Representative:	Ray Pohl			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The board discussed the proposal for the Osprey Way cottage addition, which aimed to convert a one-bedroom cottage into a three-bedroom cottage while maintaining the existing roofline and adding a front porch. Val Oliver suggested altering the front door to a diamond style for a quirkier appearance. Board members appreciated the overall design for its effort to preserve the cottage's character but discussed lowering the dormers by about six inches to minimize their modern look. Ultimately, the board approved the proposal with the two requested modifications, emphasizing the importance of maintaining the original character while accommodating the necessary updates and expense			
Motion:	Motion to approve with changing door on South elevation to match existing diamond and corners down 6” with Exhibit A: Val Oliver			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Connie Patten, Joe Paul			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
4. Susan B McCollum Trust- 11934	35 Eel Point Road	New pool house	32/63	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Connie Patten, Joe Paul			
Alternates:				
Recused:	Ray Pohl			
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The board reviewed the application for a pool house at 35 Point Road. Suggestions included adding kick panels to the bottom of the French doors, while overall, the design was deemed appropriate, with no significant concerns raised. It was noted that the pool house would be minimally visible.			
Motion:	Motion to approve is submitted – Val Oliver			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Joe Paul, Connie Patten			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
5. 2 Spearhead, LLC- 11954	2 Spearhead Road	New Storage Fac- Building A	69/307	Emeritus, LTD
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				

HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	The board discussed the design for the industrial buildings at 2 Spearhead Road, with suggestions to enhance verticality by adding a cupola, as the current design appeared flat. There were concerns about the unusual windows on the North elevation, and a proposal was made to increase the cupola's glass area and incorporate vertical panes. The board also inquired about landscaping options to mitigate the view of the windows. While acknowledging the industrial nature of the area and the need for functional storage buildings, the members expressed general support for the basic design but requested refinements, particularly regarding the cupola and window placement. Overall, the discussion was constructive, focusing on improving aesthetics while maintaining functionality.
Motion:	Motion to approve Exhibit A with the change the cupola
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
6. 2 Spearhead, LLC- 11952	2 Spearhead Road	New Storage Fac- Building B	69/307	Emeritus, LTD
Voting:	Stephen Welch(char), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	No concerns			
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted – Ray Pohl			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

IX. NEW BUSINESS 02/18/2025 - VIEW

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Holding, Christopher Meghan- 12010	25A Clifton St	Fenestration	73.4.1/3.1	Emeritus, LTD
Voting:	Stephen Welch(char), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The commissioners reviewed the application for 25A Clifton Street, with concerns raised about the garage's placement in front of the house and the overall design's appropriateness for the neighborhood. There was unanimous support for retaining the kick panels on the south-facing French doors, with emphasis on their importance for maintaining light while still being visually appealing. Some members suggested discretion regarding the visibility of the doors across the lawn and recommended waiting to see the landscape plan.			
Motion:	Motion to approve the application as submitted with Exhibit A, specifying that the kick panels on the south elevation French doors must be retained – Abby Camp			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
2. Nashaquisset Coop P. Obrien- 12019	8 Netowa Ln	Dormer fenestration	55/581.1	JB Studio
Voting:	Stephen Welch(char), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The applicant presented plans for a dormer addition, but board members felt the proposed dormers did not adhere to guidelines and would be visible from Polliwog Pond. The second floor's "broken back" design was considered atypical.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions – Ray Pohl			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
3. Carmine Giardini- 12007	7A Clifford St	Pickle Ball Sports Court	79/19	Reid Yenor
Voting:	Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver,			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	During the board's review of the pickleball court application for 7A Clifford Street, the applicant explained that the property owner had purchased a 20-foot portion of the footpath and noted that the court would be minimally visible from the street, with a 5-6-foot private buffer along the property line. Concerns were raised regarding the amount of hardscaping and its impact on the character and setting of Surfside. Suggestions included adding a condition to ensure the court would not be visible from the street. The board focused on the potential visual impact of the court and sought to maintain the area's character, agreeing on the importance of mitigating its visibility.			
Motion:	The motion was to approve with the pickleball court to not be visible at the time of inspection or thereafter – Angus MacLeod			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
4. Starboard and Port LLC- 12011	12 Baltimore Ave	New Dwelling GH	60.2.4/75	Emeritus LTD
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver,			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	During the review of the application for 12 Baltimore Avenue, commissioners expressed concerns about the design of the new house. While one member found it lovely, they noted it appeared too contemporary for the area, suggesting the need for more intersecting gables and massing that relates to the existing cottage. Another commissioner felt the new structure overwhelmed the existing house, highlighting differences in roof pitch and plate elevation, and recommended making the new building subordinate in design. Additional comments included the design's lack of a distinct local character, the overwhelming nature of the French doors, and the need for more additive massing to alleviate the boxy appearance. There was a consensus that significant design revisions were necessary to ensure the new building complements the historic structure. Suggestions for providing 3D views of both buildings together were also made to better visualize their relationship.			
Motion:	A motion was to hold for revisions and a view - Ray Pohl			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
5. 30 Eel Point LLC- 11968	30 Eel Point Rd	New Dwelling	40/44.1	LINK
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	The board discussed a proposed one-and-a-half-story Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) and raised concerns about its size exceeding zoning regulations. There was a concern that ganged windows should be one window.			
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions. (MacLeod)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
6. Geoffry Smith-11933	22 Coffin Sias.	Roof Windows	73.4.1/36	Self
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Joe Paul			
Alternates:	Patten			
Recused:	Oliver			
Representative:				

HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Anderson windows have a flange and not used in OHD. Appreciate saving the building. Suggested installing an insulated window, wood window like LaPage- insulated glass widow that wouldn't require a storm window. Inquired if SDL's were approved in prior new building approval. Should have historic mutton profile like a Boston Sash or Marvin. Concerned was made regarding visibility on corner lot.
Motion:	Motion to approve with the use of insulated glass window with an historic mutton profile with no flange thru Exhibit A as a restricted condition (Pohl).
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Joe Paul

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
7. Geoffry Smith-11931	22 Coffin Sias.	Hardscape Driveway	73.4.1/36	Self
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Joe Paul			
Alternates:	Patten			
Recused:	Oliver			
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	Design is appreciated. Inquired if room for vegetation from the property line to turnout. Needs dimension detail.			
Motion:	A motion to approve through Exhibit A. (MacLeod)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
8. Gottwald, Mark- 11935	4R Jefferson Ave	Window revs	29/48.1	Topham Design
Voting:				
Representative:	Hold per applicant			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Motion:				
Vote:	N/A			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
9. The Flagship Club- 11963	1 Cherry St	New Building	55/377	EMDA
Incomplete in the sense that approval of this structure requires required parking and therefore as a practical matter, the removal of at least a large portion of John McLaughlin's childhood home—to create a parking lot.				
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten			
Alternates:	Paul			
Recused:	Val Oliver			
Representative:	Ethan McMorro- 117 Orange St demo/move of was held for this application.			
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:	Kristine Morgansen- 4 Cherry Street, abutter. Drafted overlay for site plan. Concerned that new building goes over the street. Would like to see elevation showing relationship to 3 Cherry Street in context. Space is too tight.			
Commissioner Comments:	Suggested reviewing move off/ demo of 117 Orange Street then 1 Cherry St New Dwelling followed by hard-scaping for both properties, in that order.			
Motion:	Motion to hold until the beginning of the 4/1/25 HDC meeting. (Pohl)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(char), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Connie Patten			

Property Owner	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
10. Callen Miller INC- 12051	117 Orange St	Hardscape	55/377	Ridgevale Develop
Voting:				

HDC Minutes March 18, 2025; adopted May 13, 2025

Motion:	Held to Track			
Vote:	None			
Property Owner 11. Callen Miller INC- 12050	Street Address 1 Cherry St	Scope of Work Hardscaping	Map/Parcel 55/377.1	Agent Ridgevale Develop
Voting:	None			
Motion:	Held to Track			
Vote:	None			

X. NEW BUSINESS 02/18/2025

Property Owner 1. Reid Family Trust- 11961	Street Address 16 King St	Scope of Work Rotate house add found	Map/Parcel 73.4.2/64	Agent EMDA
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	Appropriate with white sash. Suggested clearly identifying the square footage by writing on plans.			
Motion:	Motion to approve as a restricted condition by correcting the application to reflect the addition, no black sash; white instead (Oliver)			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

Property Owner 2. Christina Clancy- 11962	Street Address 25 India St	Scope of Work Dormer window	Map/Parcel 42.3.4/106	Agent EMDA
Voting:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Val Oliver			
Alternates:	Patten, Paul			
Recused:				
Representative:				
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.			
Staff Comments:				
Public Comments:				
Commissioner Comments:	No concerns			
Motion:	Motion to approve (Oliver).			
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Ray Pohl, Val Oliver			

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approve Minutes-	Motion to approve minutes of: July 30, 2024; January 28, 2025; February 4, 2025 (Camp) Carried 3-2 //Ray Pohl, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod- aye; Abstained- Stephen Welch, Val Oliver
Adjourned	Motion to adjourn at 8:19pm (MacLeod) Carried unanimously