



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes February 4, 2025

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554)

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Stephen Welch, Chairman called the meeting at 4:02 pm

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

Staff: Cathy Flynn, Holly Backus, Nicky Sheriff, Fiona Johnson, Sara Johnson

Val Oliver: motion to approve agenda. Approved Stephen Welch, Val Oliver, Connie Patten. In person, Welch, Oliver and Patten. Zoom, Angus MacLeod and Joe Paul.

Abby Camp Joined Via zoom at 4:06.

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Fiona Johnson, Administrative Specialist

I. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION

- **Vote to appoint Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist, as an HDC Enforcement Officer**
- **Oliver made the Motion to appoint Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist, as an HDC Enforcement Officer. Welch and Patten in favor**
- **Motion carries unanimously**

II. CONSENTS

1.	K22S LLC	126 Main St	Rev Shed	42.3.3/98	LFW	JP
2.	RIT 26 Somerset ACK LLC	26 Somerset Ln	Move cottage off	66/10	LFW	JP
3.	DED LLC	57 Bartlett Rd	Move on cottage	66/99.2	LFW	JP
4.	Norris Feare	20 Nanina Dr	Extend Driveway	67/513.1	LFW	JP
5.	NT Property Owner	17 Honeysuckle Dr	Front door color	68/398	LFW	JP
6.	Christopher Schumacher	7 Falcon Ct	Addition Egress window	68/538	LFW	JP
7.	Cynthia Renshaw	1 Pheasant Dr	Cottage Fenestration	67/2	LFW	JP
8.	Cynthia Renshaw	1 Pheasant Dr	Shed	67/2	LFW	JP
9.	John Buttrick	26 Warrens Landing Rd	Rev. 10502; chimney	38/44	LFW	JP
10.	NIR The Tavern	1 Harbor Square	Rain Panels	42.2.4/1	LFW	JP
11.	DXD SS Fund II Nant Prop, LLC	10-12 DavKim Lane	Rev. 11423; overhead doors	68/62	Emeritus, LTD	AM
12.	Starboard & Port, LLC	12 Baltimore Street	Move off/demo -GH	60.2.4/75	Emertius, LTD	AM
13.	Susan B McCollum Trust	35 Eel Point Road	Move off/demo pool house	32/63	Botticelli & Pohl	AM
14.	Charles Sapmaro	23 Pond View	Window rev	81/28	NAG	VO
15.	Steven Cohen Trustee Area 51	51 Miacomet Rd	Shed rev 9797	81/52	WAPD	VO
16.	Cohen Steven L Trust	7 Primrose Ln	Demo pool cabana	40/65	CWA	VO
17.	Cohen Steven L Trust	7 Primrose Ln	Door/window change MH	40/65	CWA	VO
18.	XXII Years LLC	3 Maxey Pond Rd	Fenestration changes	40/106	CWA	VO
19.	Colby & Caskie Collet	5 Maxey Pond Rd	Fenestration rev	40/105	MCA+	VO
20.	ACK KODA LLC	42 Shimmo Pond Rd	Pool hardscape	43/126	Botticelli & Pohl	VO
21.	Bridges Family Trust LLC	6 Ishmael Rd	Move off demo house	82/91	Val Oliver	RP
22.	Bridges Family Trust LLC	6 Ishmael Rd	shed	82/91	Val Oliver	RP

23.	Greenstick LLC	18 Williams St	Solar roof	55/371	Ack Smart	RP
24.	Marty McGowan	25 Millbrook Rd	Solar roof	56/67.2	Ack Smart	RP
25.	Kenney, Tricia	65 N Liberty	Shed	41/143	Thornewill Design	RP
26.	Madron Lake LLC	26 Monomoy Rd	Doors windows	54/146	Thornewill Design	RP
27.	Passanante, Erik	41 Long Pond Dr	Window change	59.4/109.1	Devin Murphy	SW
28.	Randy Sharp	59 Polpis Rd	Add door/ reduce windows	54/26	Thornewill Design	SW
29.	Keep on Trucking LLC	57 Surfside Rd	Demo move off warehouse	67/218	E Martinez	SW
30.	Kim Glowacki	5 Meader Street	Move off to 14C Macy Ln	42.2.3/40	Structures Unltd	AC
31.	Joan Bunting	14C Macy Lane	Move on/reno frm 5 Meader St	68/107	Structures Unltd	AC
32.	Keep on Trucking LLC	57 Surfside Rd	Demo move off front bldg	67/218	E Martinez	SW
33.	Keep on Trucking LLC	57 Surfside Rd	Demo move off house barn	67/218	E Martinez	SW

Welch made the motion to amend the agenda number 15, 51 Miacomet Rd shed revision, to 51 W. Miacomet Rd, noting the typo.

Patten and Oliver in favor. Motion carries unanimously

Patten made the motion to approve the Consents. Welch, Paul MacLeod and Patten in favor and carries unanimously.

Oliver Recused

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITONS

1.	Michael Pearlstein	20 Derrymore	Rev pool	41/112	LFW	JP
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.						
2.	William & Pamela Holding	12 Blackfish Lane	Roof top solar	73/118	ACK Smart	CP
• Due to lack of visibility						
3.	Little Lyon, LLC	8B Lyon Street	As-Built- HVAC/color chg	55.4.1/71	Liz Konetchy	AC
• AC unit must be screened with lattice and vegetation. Balance of as-built fee (\$450.00) to be paid. Must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity.						
4.	Edward & Jennifer Porter	60 Squam Road	Solar ground array	13/34	ACK Smart	CP
• Ground solar array must be screened with plantings. Must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity.						
5.	Kim Christenson	59 Meadow View Drive	Add crawl space/repl frnt deck	56/169.3	WCBC	JP
• Include floor plan with dimensions of proposed additions.						
6.	Polly Harvey	124 Wauwinet Road	Window/skylight	11/16	Thornewill Design	AM
• Raise skylight to upper 1/3 of the roof and box with natural wood per BWNIM.						
7.	AMVestal Ventures, LLC	67 Vestal Street	Pool/hardscape	41/59	Atlantic Landscap	AM
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.						
8.	St Paul's Episcopal	16 Fair St	Mod Existing stair enclose.	43.3.3/5	Emeritus LTD	VO
• Add HDC survey (NAN. 3127) to the COA and architect/builder: Joseph W. Northrop; an individually significant structure.						
9.	3 Waydale LLC	3 Waydale Rd	Demo	55/85	Reid Yenor	RP
• Add Move Off to application.						
10.	Klemens Meyer Tr Etal	3 Red Barn Rd	Rooftop solar	59.3/44	Cotuit Solar	SW
• Submit legible digital version of the COA application.						
11.	Alexander, Pamela	4 Mayhew Rd	New dwelling	92.4/221	SMRD	SW
• No increase in grade height (vs. current EXG), 2 nd floor decks no deeper than 8'.						
12.	Alexander, Pamela	4 Mayhew Rd	Sports court	92.4/221	SMRD	SW
• No increase in height of grade (vs. current EXG); dark green (vs. black) mesh.						
13.	Peter & Lila Steinle	2 Ishmael Road	Rev 11779; perg chg/hardscape	82/93	Shelter 7	AC
• Add additional natural vegetation along Hellers Way to prevent view of outside kitchen.						
14.	VTT 4 Pocomo LLC	4 Pocomo Rd	House move on	14/68.1	CWA	SW
• Maintain minimum 10' of the vegetative buffer forward of the structure towards Pocomo Rd. Include approved COA and supporting documents.						
15.	Stephen Maury	18 Boynton Ln	Solar Roof	67/117.1	Ack Smar	SW
• As a "test case" due to hyper-local character and setting.						
16.	Fridland, Jennifer	7A New Ln	Spa/hardscape	41/285.1	Waterscapes	
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.						
17.	Cynthia Renshaw	1 Pheasant Dr	Hardscape	67/2	LFW	JP
• Fence to be moved back 8' (1 fence section).						
18.	16 Quaker Project LLC	16 Quaker Rd	Driveway alteration	41/176.1	KMLD	SW

- Per Exhibit A, to be drawn by Chair: plant and maintain yew hedges (vs EXG deciduous) between brick on the right side (entering from Quaker Rd) and Quaker Rd including area labeled within the application as "extend privet"; apron throat increases limited to ½ depth proposed (from existing brick edge towards Quaker Rd); stop brick at building setback line. Include revision number on COA

Paul made the motion to approve consents with conditions. Welch MacLeod Oliver and Patten are in favor and carries unanimously.

IV. SIGNS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Type of Sign</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. NIR RETAIL LLC	ZERO MAIN ST	MASTER SIGN PLAN	42.3.1/181	SIGN HERE
• Hold for Revisions.				
2. 44 CENTER HOLDINGS LLC	44 CENTER ST	PROJECTING SIGN *RR*	42.3.1/63	SIGN HERE
• Approved as submitted.				
3.FP 66 CENTER LLC	66 CENTER ST	PROJECTING SIGN *THE ANCHOR*	42.4.3/73	GARISON BEALE
• Approved with projected frame white outline.				
Oliver made the Motion to accept the recommendations of the sign committee: Welch, MacLeod and Patten				
All in favor of motion. Camp could not be heard on zoom				

V. NEW BUSINESS 01/07/2025

1. Browne & Clark	23 Ocean Ave	Addition pergola	73.3.1/19	Angus MacLeod	RP
• HOLD PER APPLICANT to March 18th					
2. Ellegance LLC - 11736	75 Pocomo Rd	New Guest House	15/7	Emeritus LTD	VO

Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod Camp and Paul; Alternate- Patten

(4:13pm)

In summary, the discussion focused on addressing the concerns about the visibility, height, and screening of the proposed guest house structure, with the board requesting revisions to the application before further consideration.

Oliver: Motion to hold for minor revisions, including a potential height adjustment and cross-section. Additionally, vegetative screening must be included and approved as part of the application. 5-0

3. James Broder- 11729	300 Madaket	Main House relocate onsite	60.2.1/70	Emeritus LTD	VO
------------------------	-------------	----------------------------	-----------	--------------	----

Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Camp and Patten; Alternate- Paul

(4:25pm)

Oliver and Patten concerned with roof walk. MacLeod-railing atypical. Heavy shingle and trim detail. Prefer shingled. Camp- agrees with what's been said. Welch- doesn't mind shingle with open balustrade.

Oliver: Motion to Approve thru Exhibit A with NW elevation second floor balcony all shingled. Remove middle post out of roof walk. 5-0

4. 6A Marble Way LLC- 11728	10 Marble Wy Lot 2	New Garage	66/104	K Megna	AM
-----------------------------	--------------------	------------	--------	---------	----

Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod Oliver and Paul; Alternate- Patten

(4:29pm)

In summary, the discussion focused on the overall development and the need to ensure appropriate screening and landscaping to mitigate the visual impact of the new garage structure. Deck no more than 8' deep.

Oliver: Motion to Approve with rear deck depth to 8 feet. 4-1 (Camp-nay).

5. 6A Marble Way LLC- 11733	6A Marble Wy Lot 5	New Garage	66/103.1	K Megna	AM
-----------------------------	--------------------	------------	----------	---------	----

Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Paul; Alternate- Patten

(Motion made by Oliver to amend the Agenda Noting 6A Marble Way Lot 5) 5-0

(4:40pm)

In summary, the discussion for Lot 5 mirrored the discussion for Lot 2, with the board focusing on the overall development, visibility, and landscaping. Welch- concerned with siting with abutting properties on Bartlett Road.

Oliver: Motion to Approve as submitted. 5-0

6. Booms, Jeff- 11744	14 Woodland Dr	Addition	79/203	JB Studio	AM
-----------------------	----------------	----------	--------	-----------	----

Board: Welch, Paul, MacLeod, Camp and Patten; Alternates- none

(5:47pm)

The board expressed concerns about the proportions and height of the proposed addition, suggesting improvements through a reduced ridge height and a shallower pitch. There was also a recommendation to make the windows more vertical, meeting rails line with eave and adjust the dormer plate height for better proportions. The mix of architectural styles was considered problematic, and a more cohesive design was suggested. Overall, the addition was seen as overwhelming the existing structure and requiring substantial revisions. Focus on reducing the height and adjusting the dormers to better integrate with the existing building.

MacLeod: Motion to Hold for Revisions. 5-0

7. Brescher, Jessie M Tr- 11745	6 Sleepy Hollow Rd	Move on addition	66/453.2	JB Studio	AM
---------------------------------	--------------------	------------------	----------	-----------	----

Board: Welch, Paul, MacLeod, Camp and Patten; Alternates- none

(5:53pm)

The board raised concerns about the outdoor second-floor shower enclosure, recommending it be replaced with a deck. They also suggested replacing the shingled columns on the front porch with simple wood columns.

Oliver: Motion to Approve thru Exhibit A with post change and moving outdoor shower to first floor deck; vertical boards. 5-0

8.	Martha Carr- 11749	16 Walsh St	New dwelling	42.4.1/50	R Newman	AM
----	--------------------	-------------	--------------	-----------	----------	----

Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Camp and Patten; Alternate- Paul
(4:54pm)

The design adjustments were emphasized to prevent the structure from overwhelming the neighborhood due to its scale and foundation adjustments. Suggested streetscape. A chimney appropriate for the design. Reducing the overall height by one foot was deemed appropriate. Suggested to remove skirt from roof walk. Instead of a porch, the end of the dormer could be modified to feature a hip rather than a shed. Windows in connectors too concentrated.

MacLeod: Motion to Hold for revisions. 5-0

9.	Two Pilgrim LLC- 11753	15 Pilgrim Rd	New dwelling	41/214	S Metz	AM
----	------------------------	---------------	--------------	--------	--------	----

Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Paul; Alternate- Patten
(5:05pm)

The board discussed the site plan and elevations, expressing concerns about the overall scale and height of the structure. Concerned large corner; filled lot line to lot line. Main mass needs to come down 9" to 1'; secondary mass should come down proportionately.

Oliver: Motion to hold for Revisions including reducing the height and adjusting the dormers and a view. 5-0.

10.	Two Pilgrim LLC- 11752	15 Pilgrim Rd	New guest house	41/214	S Metz	AM
-----	------------------------	---------------	-----------------	--------	--------	----

Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Paul; Alternate- Patten
(5:19pm)

The board is reviewing the structures individually, but they are also considering the overall compositional presentation and streetscape. The board is requesting a streetscape view to better understand how the proposed structures will fit into the context of the surrounding buildings and neighborhood environment. Concerns about the height of the structure, suggesting it was too tall for the size of the guest house. Concerns were raised regarding the dormers' proximity to the gable ends, with the setback pushing the limits of acceptable proximity, though there may be some flexibility with the rake overhang. Additionally, the west elevation, which faces the road, could be perceived as the "front" of the building, as the south elevation faces Pilgrim. It was suggested to add a small porch roof or feature to highlight the door on the west elevation. The main comments focused on reducing the overall height, particularly over the dormers, to match the main house, with a suggested reduction of 1 foot to 9 inches. From a site composition perspective, it was recommended to maintain a vegetated screen along Pilgrim rather than presenting the second dwelling as a standalone structure. Creating an entryway on Pilgrim was seen as introducing unnecessary confusion.

Oliver: Hold the application for minor revisions, including reducing the height and providing more details on the approved landscaping plan to address the visibility concerns and a view. 5-0

11.	Two Pilgrim LLC- 11751	15 Pilgrim Rd	New garage	41/214	S Metz	AM
-----	------------------------	---------------	------------	--------	--------	----

Board: Welch, Oliver, Camp, MacLeod and Paul; Alternate- Patten
(5:27pm)

The height and massing of the structure, concerns that it was too tall, and overwhelming compared to the surrounding buildings. The dormers on the front facing the street, with the board suggesting they should be moved to the rear instead. The overall composition and how the different masses of the building relate to each other, with suggestions to lower the roof pitch and break up the massing. Visibility of the structure from the street, with the board discussing ways to better screen it through landscaping.

Oliver: Motion to hold for revision to address these concerns about the height, massing, and visibility and added to be viewed. 5-0

12.	Hanson Family- 11754	7 Academy Ln	Window replacement	42.4.3/108	Val Oliver	AM
-----	----------------------	--------------	--------------------	------------	------------	----

Board: Welch, Camp Patten MacLeod and Paul; Alternate- Patten
(6:00pm)

No concerns.

Camp: Motion to Approve as submitted. 5-0

13.	Zero India St LLC- 11758	1 Cambridge St	Rev 10149	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus LTD AM
-----	--------------------------	----------------	-----------	--------------	--------------------

Board: Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver and Patten; Alternate- Paul
(6:06pm)

The suggestion was made to ensure the back door on the east elevation aligns with the building's historic style. It was agreed that the east elevation should return to the previously approved design, which featured a panelized version.

Camp: Motion to Approve subject to the east elevation being reverted to the previously approved design. 5-0

14. Michelle Kalman-11772 63 Hinsdale Rd New duplex 68/963.1 LINK JP
Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Camp and Paul; Alternate- Patten
 (6:17pm)

The view of the board is the overall height and massing of the proposed structure are considered too large for the small lot and should be scaled down. The front-facing dormers are seen as top-heavy and should either be reduced or moved to the rear. To help soften the third-floor presence, adding a porch or similar grounding element on the first floor is recommended. Drop additive massing; 6/6 windows appropriate The continuous eave between the two masses makes the building appear as one large structure rather than two separate ones, so stepping back the flanking masses is suggested to break up the massing more effectively..

Oliver: Motion to Hold for Revisions. 5-0

15. 11 Pine St Realty -11778 11 Pine St MH Reno 42.3.3/24.1 WAPD JP
Board: Welch, MacLeod, Camp Oliver and Patten; Alternate- Paul
 (6:29pm)

Appreciate the change to the front door. The mulled windows on the south elevation and the double stacked French doors on the north elevation were deemed inappropriate. Windows on East elevation crowded. Suggested 8” shingle between.

Camp: Motion to Hold for Minor Revisions. 5-0

16. 11 Pine St Realty- 11775 11 Pine St Demo Garage 42.3.3/24.1 WAPD JP
Board: Welch, MacLeod, Camp Oliver and Patten; Alternate- Paul
 (6:41pm)

The board had concerns about the condition of the existing garage and wanted more information and images to demonstrate whether it was viable to save or not. The board wanted to see more evidence of the garage's condition before deciding whether it could be saved or should be demolished.

Camp: Motion for more information and images; 3-2 (Oliver and Patten-nay)

17. 11 Pine St Realty-11777 11 Pine St New garage 42.3.3/24.1 WAPD JP
Board: Welch, MacLeod, Camp Oliver and Patten; Alternate- Paul

Oliver: Motion to have the new garage Track the Demo Garage. 5-0

18. 11 Pine St Realty- 11776 11 Pine St New shed 42.3.3/24.1 WAPD JP
Board: Welch, MacLeod, Camp Oliver and Patten; Alternate- Paul
 (6:50pm)

The main concern raised was the French doors facing the street, which were considered inappropriate despite being set back. The suggestion was made to move the French doors to the west elevation, where they would not be visible from the street. There was also a proposal to introduce a living fence (such as a lattice with climbing plants) to maintain privacy and screen the French doors from the street. Some concerns about the pergola's contemporary design were noted, but it was acknowledged that it is located behind the house. Overall, the focus was on ensuring the design blends with the surrounding area while maintaining privacy.

Camp: Motion to Hold for Revisions.5-0

19. Smiley 15 N. Water LLC- 11765 15 N. Water St Rev Roof, trim change 42.4.2/50 Normand JP
Board: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Oliver and Paul; Alternate: Patten

The board expressed concerns about the proposed change from the existing gray trim color to a white trim color. Several members felt that the white trim would be too much of a departure from the existing character of the building and the surrounding area. The board suggested that a lighter gray color would be more appropriate and better match the existing shingle siding. They felt the white trim would add too much formality to the building. Overall, the board was open to the other proposed changes, such as the addition of Essex green shutters and the replacement of the roof with fire-treated cedar shingles. However, the focus of the discussion was on the trim color, with the consensus being that white was not the right choice and a lighter gray would be preferred.

Oliver: Motion to Hold for Revisions. Note that is would be approved subject to resolution of the exterior paint color. The applicant will bring back revised color options for the trim. 5-0

20. Mark P Chioffi- 11764 5 Crow's Nest Wy Pool and hardscape 12/22.2 Jardins Intl JP
Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod Camp and Patten; Alternate- Paul
 (7:10pm)

Patten: Motion to Approve. 5-0

21. 32 Hulbert Rear lot Trust 27 Willard St New dwelling 29/72.2 Botticelli & Pohl JP
Board: Welch, Oliver, MacLeod Patten and Paul; Alternate- none; Stepped away- Camp

(7:11pm)

Anne Breckenridge, 30 Willard Street- concerned with driveway near bend.

The board requested that the applicant provide a streetscape view showing the proposed building in context with the surrounding structures on Willard Street. This was requested to help the board better understand the appropriateness of the design in relation to the existing homes in the neighborhood.

Oliver: Motion to Hold for a view at the beginning of 2/11/25 meeting. 5-0

22. Valero /LLC- 11780	60 & 62 Old South Rd	New gym	68/85.2-85.3	Val Oliver	AC
-------------------------------	---------------------------------	----------------	---------------------	-------------------	-----------

Board: Welch, MacLeod Patten, Paul and Camp
(7:19pm)

The board appreciated the scale and layered design of the proposed building, with the side elevation being noted for its agrarian feel. The board raised concerns about the baluster railing and French doors, suggesting they be replaced with more proportionate windows. The siting of the building was discussed, the visibility of the parking area in front of this setback building was a concern. Overall, the board found the design appropriate but recommended minor revisions, including adjustments to the windows, railing, and siting.

Paul: Motion to hold for minor revisions. 5-0

23. Beach Bucket LLC- 11784	14 Silver St	Alteration addition move	55.4.1/182	Emeritus LTD	AC
------------------------------------	---------------------	---------------------------------	-------------------	---------------------	-----------

Board: Welch, Oliver MacLeod, Camp and Patten
(7:36pm)

Concerns about the height, scale and massing of the proposed addition, as well as the design elements like the French doors on South elevation. Reading as a different style. Suggested lowering second floor plate height on addition.

Camp: Motion to hold for revisions. 5-0

24. Heide Leslie- 11786	47 Center St	Demo roof walk	42.4.3/29	Hristo Savov	AC
--------------------------------	---------------------	-----------------------	------------------	---------------------	-----------

No representation

25. Heide Leslie- 11785	47 Center St	Roof Replacement	42.4.3/29	Hristo Savov	AC
--------------------------------	---------------------	-------------------------	------------------	---------------------	-----------

No representation.

26. CBR ACK holdings LLC-11788	6 W Dover St	Fenestration	55.4.1/191	LFW	CP
---------------------------------------	---------------------	---------------------	-------------------	------------	-----------

HELD by applicant

VI. NEW BUSINESS 01/21/2025 - VIEW

1. NIR Retail LLC- 11798	137 Old South Rd	Rooftop Solar	69/50	Ack Smart	SW
---------------------------------	-------------------------	----------------------	--------------	------------------	-----------

No Show

MacLeod made the motion to approve the minutes from October 29, 2024

Camp, MacLeod, Oliver and Paul are in favor Welch abstained

Motion carries

MacLeod made the motion to Adjourn at 7:49PM Camp MacLeod Paul Oliver and Welch approved unanimously