



HDC Minutes-January 14, 2025; adopted April 15, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, January 14, 2025

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Stephen Welch called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

Staff in Attendance:	Cathy Flynn, Holly Backus, & Fiona Johnson
Attending Members:	Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver
Remote Participants:	-Pohl
Absent Members:	Thornewill
Late Arrivals:	-None
Early Departures:	Camp (7:23pm)

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Motion:	Motion to approve. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0//Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Paul, Oliver (Aye)

I. COMMISSION DISCUSSION & VOTE

1. 10 New Whale Street – Minimum Maintenance Ch. 124-13

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver; Alt: Paul, Patten – Last heard November 19, 2024*
- Motion was made for owner to come back to address minimum maintenance concerns at the December 17, 2024, meeting with a letter sent to the owner's representatives (was continued from December 17th meeting to this meeting)

Discussion:	Peter Reynolds (Engineer) - Confirmed that the building was unsafe due to poor-quality brick, foundation settlement, and structural instability. Holly Backus - Highlighted the previous demolition application in October 2023, which was withdrawn. Linda Williams (Agent) - Provided historical context, explaining the building's deterioration since 1998 and its uncertain ownership history. The Board - Requested an expert evaluation of the building's structural integrity under the minimum maintenance standards. - Agreed to seek legal clarification from Town Counsel on HDC's authority over a structure deemed unsafe by the Fire Department and whether the minimum maintenance bylaw provided enforcement mechanisms or allowed for an automatic demolition approval.
Motion:	Motion to hold the commission discussion subject to legal input from Town Counsel regarding HDC's authority and options under the minimum maintenance standard. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0//Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

2. 5 Candle Street – Minimum Maintenance Ch. 124-13

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod, Oliver; Alt: Paul, Patten – Last heard November 19, 2024*
- Same as above

Discussion:	Attorney Arthur Reade -Confirmed that the building is structurally sound and eligible for restoration. Holly Backus -Noted that the building had undergone prior maintenance, including a new roof and painting in 2021. Linda Williams (Agent) -Stated that ongoing maintenance had been conducted, including structural reinforcement and glass block replacements. The Board - Agreed to seek legal counsel regarding the applicants’ intended restoration to determine whether any necessary legal steps to protect the HDC’s oversight and authority.
Motion:	Motion to defer determination pending legal input from Town Counsel on HDC’s authority and options under the minimum maintenance standard. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0//Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

II. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

1. Dream North LLC 28 Shimmo Pond Rd Addition 43/167 BPC

RP

- *Add the date of construction to the COA (NHL Data = c.1997)*

Motion:	Motion to approve Consent with Conditions. (Made By: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 4-1// Welch, Camp, Pohl, Oliver (Aye) MacLeod (Nay)

III. OLD BUSINESS 1/7/2025 (IN BY NOON)

1. Almodobar Beau & Liz 4 Atlantic Ave Window replacement 55.4.1/46 Val Oliver

JP

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, MacLeod and Paul; Alt: Patten—Last heard January 7, 2025*

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Val Oliver
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Noted that historically appropriate simulated divided lite (SDL) windows are required in the OHD. -Emphasized that the entire house should have consistent historically appropriate windows due to its visibility from multiple angles. The Board -Debated whether the windows throughout the house should be historically appropriate for consistency or if a different manufacturer could be used for the less visible rear portion. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland (Historic Structures Advisory Group) concurred with Backus.
Motion:	Motion to approve the application as revised, with historically appropriate windows from an approved manufacturer for the main mass, while allowing Anderson windows for the rear portion as proposed. (Made by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 4-1 // Welch, Camp, Pohl, Paul (Aye) MacLeod (Nay)

IV. OLD BUSINESS 12/17/2024

1. 3 Pops Ln Holding Trust 3 Pops Lane Main House 60.2.4/64.1 MCA+

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Paul, Oliver; Alt: Patten, Thornewill--Last heard October 15, 2024*

2. 3 Pops Ln Holding Trust 3 Pops Lane Guest House 60.2.4/64.1 MCA+

• TRACK

3. 3 Pops Ln Holding Trust 3 Pops Lane Garage 60.2.4/64.1 MCA+

• TRACK

4. 3 Pops Ln Holding Trust 3 Pops Lane Pool 60.2.4/64.1 MCA+

• TRACK

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Oliver Paul, Pohl
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Mark Cutone
Discussion:	Mark Cutone -Noted minor fenestration changes, including removing oversized windows, adding muntins to entry and rear doors, reducing the chimney mass for a more traditional look, and relocating the pool from the water side to a more internal location. Holly Backus -Acknowledged the lowered massing but noted that the revisions did not fully address previous Board concerns. The Board -Expressed appreciation for the lower height, however found the overall massing, fenestration, grading increase, and design elements inconsistent with the historic character of Madaket -Requested revisions to reduce massing, refine fenestration, clarify grading changes, and provide site sections to assess visibility from the water. Public Comment -Linda Williams (Agent for Abutter Paul Moran): Argued the application contained errors, the design was oversized and inconsistent with Madaket's character, and the grading increase would create an unnatural wall along the Creeks. Sarah Hendrickson (Abutter): Stated the project's scale would overwhelm their small lane and block open harbor views.
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions and additional information on grading and site sections. (Made by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Oliver Paul, Pohl

V. OLD BUSINESS 1/14/2025

1. Tilroe 75 Main St Buttress detail

42.3.1/56

Thornewill

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Patten, Paul – Last heard September 24, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Patten, Pohl, Paul, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Luke Thornewill
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Confirmed the historic significance of the Henry Coffin House (c.1834) and the attached brick wall built by Mason Christopher Capen. -Suggested that, if approved, the COA should reflect all proposed work, including the

	shed-to-cottage conversion since the structures are structurally connected.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, Patten, Pohl, Paul, Oliver (Aye)

2. Nancy Holmes 3 Eagles Wy Solar 80/229 Empower Energy

• *Commissioners: Welch, Oliver; Alt: Thornewill, Paul, Patten – Last heard September 24, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Patten, Pohl, Paul, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	JayR (Empower Energy)
Discussion:	The Board -Agreed that a black roof would help integrate the panels, adjustments were needed to position panels below the skylight, and future applications should include clearer presentation materials.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted, subject to the roof color changing to black and the solar panels on the south elevation being positioned below the skylight. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, Patten, Pohl, Paul, Oliver (Aye)

3. Hart Pine R.T. 38 Pine St Addition 55.4.1/69 Normand

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Camp, Patten – Last heard December 17, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Camp, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ben Normand
Discussion:	Ben Normand -Presented the revisions to the Board including the reduction of dormer widths and heights, window size and adjusting porch roof pitch. Holly Backus - Acknowledged improvements but noted dormers were still too wide and should align more closely with window frames. The Board - Suggested lowering dormer roof assembly to embed windows in the header for a more historic appearance. - Agreed that the South elevation dormer was improved but recommended further reduction of the visible shingle space.
Motion:	Motion to approve with Exhibit A, adjusting dormer roof assembly so second-floor windows are embedded in the header. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 4-1 // Welch, Pohl, Camp, Patten (Aye) MacLeod (Nay)

4. ACK Koda LLC 42 Shimmo Pond RD New guest house 43/126 Botticelli & Pohl

• *Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Paul, Patten (Pohl recused) – Last heard December 17, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Paul, MacLeod, Camp, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Lisa Botticelli

Discussion:	Lisa Botticelli -Presented revisions, including adjusting the second-floor fenestration to match the main house, updating porch railing details, and modifying doors for consistency. Holly Backus - Acknowledged improvements but noted dormers were still too wide and should align more closely with window frames. The Board -Noted the first floor sliding doors were too large for the structure's scale. -Recommended reducing door height to 7'6" and removing lower panels to maintain proportion. -Suggested removing corner boards on dormers for a more historically appropriate appearance.
Motion:	Motion to approve with Exhibit A, reducing door height to 7'6", removing door panels, and eliminating corner boards on dormers in favor of woven shingle corners. (Made by: MacLeod) (Seconded by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, Paul, MacLeod, Camp, Patten (Aye)

5. 85 Orange LLC 85 Orange Addition Front House 55.4.1/27 **Self**

• *Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill: Alt: Patten – Last heard November 5, 2024*

6. 85 Orange LLC 85 Orange Hardscape front 55.4.1/27 **Self**

• TRACK

7. 85 Orange LLC 85 Orange Hardscape Rear 55.4.1/27 **Self**

• TRACK

Voting:	Welch, Paul, MacLeod, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Chris Anderson
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that the house is Circa 1834. - Recommended retaining the original ridge, using additive massing, and including clearer demolition indicators. The Board -Requested a roof plan, a revised site plan, updated elevations that accurately reflect proposed changes, and the inclusion of historic photos for reference. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland suggested corrections to the west addition's roof intersection and refinements to window details based on historic photographs.
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, Paul, MacLeod, Camp, Patten (Aye)

8. Katherine Potter 14 Berkley Renovation 76.1.3/233 **JN Design**

• *Commissioners: Welch, Oliver, Patten, Paul and Coombs—Last heard August 29, 2023*

Voting:	Welch, Paul, Patten, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Josiah Newman

Discussion:	The Board - Requested the front door to be clearly added to the drawings.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted, with the condition that the front door be added to the drawings. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, Paul, Patten, Oliver (Aye)

9. Margaret Mignosa 1 Wyers Ln Hardscape 42.4.3/14 Garden Group

• Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod – Alt: Paul and Patten Last heard January 7, 2025

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Greyson Keller
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Acknowledged that bluestone exists in the OHD but suggested that brick would be more appropriate. The Board - Requested the front door to be clearly added to the drawings. Abby Camp -Suggested the addition of infill grass to soften the layout. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland stated that the design appeared too formal, suggested simplification, and questioned the detailing of the retaining wall.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted, subject to adding infill grass to hardscape. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)

10. 21 Pleasant St LLC 21 Pleasant St Main House 55.4.1/1

Link/Glidden

• Commissioners: Pohl, Camp, Welch – Last heard December 17, 2024

Voting:	Pohl, Camp, Welch
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Victoria Ewing
Discussion:	Victoria Ewing -Stated that the application is as-built and the submitted drawings reflect existing site conditions. Holly Backus - Noted that the structure is a 1920s Four Square home with multiple pending applications. -Explained that prior approvals required cinder block foundation replication, no extension of foundation walls under the deck, and additional screening, which were not fully addressed in the submission. The Board - Requested removal of the privet hedge along Candle House Lane, scoring the foundation to resemble original cinder block, reducing the brick driveway size or introducing softer materials, and modifying the fence to meet Type II specifications with a cap.

	Public Comment -Mickey Rowland concurred with Backus.
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions, including modifications to the driveway, foundation scoring, privet removal, and proper Type II fencing. (Made by: Welch)
Vote:	Carried 3-0 // Pohl, Camp, Welch (Aye)

11. 21 Pleasant St LLC 21 Pleasant St Hardscape 55.4.1/1

[Link/Glidden](#)

- *Commissioners: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Patten; Alt: Paul, Thornewill – Last heard April 2, 2024*
- TRACK - Not opened December 17, 2024

Voting:	Welch, Camp, Oliver, Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Victoria Ewing
Discussion:	The Board - Agreed that the picket fence should be painted white with a cap - Requested the reduction of the driveway to one parking space with a cobble middle
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions (Made by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, Camp, Oliver, Patten, Paul (Aye)

12. Cheese and Crackers LLC 39 Cliff Rd New dwelling 42.4.4/3 MCA+

- *Commissioners: Welch, MacLeod, Camp, Thornewill, Paul; Alt: Patten (Pohl recused) – Last heard December 3, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Mark Cutone
Discussion:	Mark Cutone - Presented revisions the Board including restoring the landscape wall, adding sill trim, refining fenestration, and enhancing shingle-style details. Holly Backus - Acknowledged the improvements in detailing but noted the design still lacks additive massing while aligning better with the streetscape and abutters' concerns. Public Comment - Mickey Rowland stated that proposed massing does not successfully relate to the historic Sea Cliff Inn.
Motion:	Motion to approve as revised. (Made by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Paul (Aye)

13. Hampton S Lynch Jr Trust 2 Green Ln Fenestration changes 42.3.3/130 Gryphon Architects

- *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Oliver, Camp; Alt: Patten – Last heard December 10, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Pohl
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ethan McMorrow
Discussion:	Ethan McMorrow - Presented revisions including fenestration adjustments, updated muntin configurations, and reduced glazing.

	Holly Backus - Noted the structure is Circa 1915 and was part of the Milk Street complex -Suggested adding kick panels to the French doors for consistency. Public Comment - Mickey Rowland recommended simplifying the upper transom windows above the French doors into a single transom for a cleaner design.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Pohl (Aye)

14. 1 N Swift Rock Rd Trust 1 N Swift Rock Guest House 40/2 Emeritus LTD

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Pohl, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Matthew MacEachern
Discussion:	Matthew MacEachern -Presented revisions, including a height reduction of 1'11", adjustments to deck depth, and maintaining architectural consistency with existing structures The Board - Requested lowering dormer roof pitches to a 4/12 slope to further reduce ridge height. Public Comment - Lisa Berger expressed concerns about the number of buildings on the site, the total ground coverage, and the overall impact on the neighborhood
Motion:	Motion to approve with Exhibit A, reducing dormer pitch to 4/12. (Made by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Pohl, Paul (Aye)

15. Doran, Jefferey & Colleen 14 Ellens Way Garage 81/176 Sanne Payne

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, Camp and MacLeod; Last heard December 10, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Sanne Payne
Discussion:	-
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Paul)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod (Aye)

16. Richmond Great Point 2 Honeysuckle Dr Hardscape 68/886 LFW

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod and Patten; Alt: Thornewill and Paul; Last heard December 3, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Linda Williams
Discussion:	-Discussed the proposed changes.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten (Aye)

17. Richmond Great Point 4 Honeysuckle Dr Hardscape 68/887 LFW

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod and Patten; Alt: Thornewill and Paul; Last heard December 3, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Linda Williams
Discussion:	-Discussed the proposed changes.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried -0 // Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten (Aye)

18. Richmond Great Point 6 Honeysuckle Dr Hardscape 68/888 LFW

• *Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, Oliver, MacLeod and Patten; Alt: Thornewill and Paul; Last heard December 3, 2024*

Voting:	Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Linda Williams
Discussion:	-Discussed the proposed changes.
Motion:	Motion to approve with Exhibit A, adding honey locust trees near the light pole to soften the transition. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 4-0 // Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver (Aye)

VI. NEW BUSINESS 12/03/2024

1. Elegance LLC 75 Pocomo Rd Rev COA 2024-10-11391 15/7 Emeritus LTD CT

Voting:	Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Matthew MacEachern
Discussion:	The Board - Noted that while the structure is set back from the road, the dormer on the south elevation appeared too large and suggested reducing its plate height. -Suggested removing the front gable pediment over the porch for a cleaner aesthetic
Motion:	Motion to approve with Exhibit A, which includes removing the steep-pitched pediment over the porch and downsizing the dormer height. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 4-1 // Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Paul (Aye) Welch (Nay)

VII. MINUTES FOR APPROVAL

- July 12, 2024
- July 16, 2024 (special meeting)
- October 1, 2024

Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made By: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// MacLeod, Patten, Paul (Aye) Welch & Oliver (Abstained)

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion:	Motion to adjourn @ 8:26pm. (Made By: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, Oliver, MacLeod, Patten, Paul (Aye)

YouTube Link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q8aJM392-0w>