



Minutes for Month, Day, Year; Adopted Month, Day, Year

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

December 3, 2024

4 Fairgrounds Road and Remote Participation via Zoom

Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-chair), Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver, Angus McLeod

Associate Commissioners: Connie Patten, Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Welch called the meeting to order on Tuesday, December 3, 2024, at 4:02 pm

Staff in Attendance:	Fiona Johnson, Sara Johnson, Jule Hall Administrative Specialists, Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
Commissioners:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abbey Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Associate Commissioners:	Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul
Absent Members:	
Late Arrivals:	
Early Departures:	

16 Main Street

Ralph Lauren

Store Glassless streetlight

Alternates:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abbey Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod
Recused:	Carrie Thornewill
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Ray- currently doesn't have a lid – dark skies Angus – Miss seems glass -light is important Abby- concern that the design might strangely obscure the light source, making it feel incomplete. Ray- I never thought that Main Street seemed to have a very warm. Carrie – Looock incomplete -option for glass?
Motion:	
Vote:	

Debra & Robert Bechtold

3 Manatook Way

Move Off / Demo Bldg. 1

73/82

LFW

Associate Board:	Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Paul, Thornewill; Alt: Pohl (Oliver recused)
Alternate:	Ray, Bell
Documentation:	

Commissioner Comments:	Carrie- I think, hearing the history of it and the lack of sort of historical significance. I'm okay with it. I hope somebody takes it. Joe- I agree with Carrie, and I also appreciate the information. Quick turnaround from the applicant. 1st time I've seen a notarized affidavit regarding oh, yes, I forgot about historic integrity or the history, so I thought that was an interesting thing to add in here, and for me it made a difference, so I have no concerns.
------------------------	---

	Abby- I would go along with that. I just want to remember what was here before. There they were, you know, smaller houses. So, when it comes time to building. I'd like to see some sort of interest in keeping that low, low buildings on the beginning of that street. Angus- I don't have anything to add. I pretty much agree with everything that's been said. Thank you.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted.
Vote:	Angus (Aye), Abby(aye), and Aman (Aye)

. Knight, Mark **60 Nobadeer Ave** **Hardscape deer fence** **88/10** **Greyson Keller**

Voting:	Welch, Ray, Abby, Angus, and Joe Connie and Carrie.
Alternates:	
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Angus- deer fences see ext. to opening Joe – opening and material Abby-fence looking simply Ray – visible from Nobadeer ave. Stephen – invisible green 4”-6” center
Motion:	Motion 6 tall and 6 on center, we need to do an exhibit A match fence material with naturalized planning versus soldier forces.
Vote:	4 in favor. One opposed. Abby was opposed Welch(aye), Ray(aye), Abby(aye), Angus(aye), Joe(aye), Connie(aye) and Carrie(aye)

25 N Pasture LLC **25 N Pasture** **Rev new dwelling** **44/75** **P+**

Alternates:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl, Connie Patten, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Carri Thornewill, Mark
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Carri - possibly discussing the aesthetic balance and functionality of the structure. She mentions that the lack of a chimney makes the design feel “static,” implying that the building could benefit from some form of vertical accent or variation in the roofline. She also comments on the dormers on the east and west sides, noting their interaction with the rest of the building feels a bit off, especially due to the lack of windows. Angus - design feel more balanced, though she also notes that if these sides aren’t visible from key angles, it might not matter as much. It sounds like she’s encouraging a more traditional approach to dormer design, with the understanding that it may be a minor point if the view isn’t critical.

	Conney - concern about the fenestration primarily on the rear. Primarily the set the 1st floor. I do think it's over fenestrated in the sense of visibility from a publicly traveled path. However, I don't believe that you were going to see the 1st floor. Stephen - My only concern is the infinity pool. If the edge is facing the public lands that this at night is going to be a beacon of light, and that's the one of the valid discussions we've had. And that's a i think, a legitimate concern.
Motion:	Motion has to say there will be no visibility, and then anything beyond that we would review more screening.
Vote:	Stephen Welch(aye), Ray Pohl(aye), Connie Pattern(no), Angus Maclead(aye), Carri Thornewill(aye)

Kyle Snell 5 Pine Crest Drive Fence Rev to add wall 68/427 Thornewill

Alternates:	Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl, Connie Patten, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	Ray - I'm okay with it
Public Comments:	Connie - I'm okay with it Abby - - I'm okay with it
Commissioner Comments:	
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted
Vote:	Stephen Welch(aye), , Ray Pohl(aye), Abby Camp(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye), Connie Patten(aye)

Cheese & Crackers LLC	39 Cliff Road	New Dwelling	42.4.4/3	MCA+
-----------------------	---------------	--------------	----------	------

Alternates:	Connie Patten
Recused:	Ray Pohl,
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	Mag Callahan reiterates concerns about the setback, emphasizing that the houses are very close together, and any encroachment into the setback would be a significant issue. Additionally, Mag is worried about the staging of the home's construction due to the shared drive. With seven grandchildren under the age of five spending a lot of time there, there's concern about potential wear and tear on the brick driveway, which was fully redone during the 41A renovation a few years ago
Commissioner Comments:	☐ Joe: Appreciates the shingle detail, especially for the southwest elevation, and suggests incorporating it across all four gables. He also recommends enhancing the front entry to tie it into the design for a more cohesive look. ☐ Carri: Expresses concern about the house being built within the setback and its alignment with the windows. She suggests lowering the structure slightly and shifting

	the right roof mass to improve window alignment and reduce setback issues. She acknowledges the roof massing change but finds the window positioning off-kilter. □ Angus: Finds the massing of the building problematic, particularly the lack of proper setbacks between the first and second floors and the infilled dormer. He suggests the design could follow a more typical or guideline-compliant approach, particularly for fenestration. He also critiques the oversized dormer and too much glass in the entry door, along with an inappropriate basement entrance in the front. □ Abby: Focuses on the potential for creative additions, such as adding a "flare" to bridge the gap between the ground and first-floor windows. She suggests incorporating traditional materials like stone to provide historical context and references Sea Cliff as an inspiration for unique architectural details. She encourages a more dynamic, creative approach to the design. □ Stephen: Reflects on the original structure having three full stories, with the new design using up much of that height in two stories. He suggests better representation of the original building's height and massing and emphasizes the need for a section of the building showing the finished floor height relative to grade. He also proposes incorporating one or two chimneys to improve the design.
Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(aye), Abby Camp(aye), Angus MacLeod (aye), Carri Thornewill (aye), Joe Paul(aye)

Riverview Crossing LLC

12.5 Pequot St

Garage

80/20

Michael McKay

Alternates:	Val Oliver (Chair), Stephen Welch, Connie Patten, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten, Joe Paul, Carrie Thornewill,
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Joe: Suggests reducing the size of the cheek wall on the dormer for a better overall look. Angus: Agrees with Joe and Paul's feedback about adjusting the dormer's position and pitch for better balance in the design. They specifically recommend offsetting the face of the dormer by at least a foot, as Joe suggested, to maintain proper proportion and alignment. Angus notes this is a small detail that can be easily addressed in further revisions. They express general satisfaction with the revisions and appreciate the changes made in line with earlier feedback. "Exhibit A" may refer to a specific reference for the design changes. Carri: Agrees with everyone and thanks the team for their input. Connie: Appreciates the changes and agrees with the feedback provided, without adding anything new. Val: Thanks, the team for the changes and comments on the setback from the front wall, suggesting that it doesn't need to be a full foot but could be reduced to six

	inches. They believe this small change will be indistinguishable, especially given the specific lot where the house is located. The overall sentiment is one of appreciation for the revisions made so far, with a few additional small tweaks suggested, particularly around the dormer and setback adjustments.
Motion:	Motion to approve, as submitted with the exhibit A for the Dormer revision that we discussed 6 inches or 12 inches, moving it back 12 inches
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Val Oliver (Chair)(aye), Stephen Welch(aye), Connie Patten(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye), Connie Patten(aye), Joe Paul(aye), Carrie Thornewill(aye),

Big Patch LLC 69 Hummock Pond Rd Pool Hardscape 56/320 LFW

Alternates:	Carrie Thornewill, Joel Paul
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Ray: Expresses concern about the dramatic grade change in the landscape design, particularly as it results in a platform facing Hummock Pond Road. While understanding the cut and fill process, Ray feels the grade changes appear unnatural, with the contours running roughly parallel to the road. They suggest that the contours could be more naturalized. However, Ray acknowledges that the house is already approved, and the current discussion is focused on approving the landscaping. Connie: Agrees with Ray's point but emphasizes that their primary concern is the driveway material. Angus: Shares Ray's concerns about the grading, preferring the grading to stay closer to its natural state. They point out that the proposed fill (5 feet 2 inches) seems excessive and would require significant adjustments. Angus suggests the grading should follow the natural contours more closely, aligning with the existing site conditions. Stephen: Also mentions grading concerns but expresses a positive view on simplifying the walkway steps, particularly in terms of layout and materials. They note that the driveway, if visible, feels too formal and may need to be reconsidered for a more fitting look. In summary, the main concerns revolve around the grading and the materials for the driveway and walkway, with suggestions to make the grading feel more natural and to reconsider the formal appearance of the driveway.
Motion:	Motion hold for revisions all in favor
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stphen Welch (Chair)(aye), Connie Patten(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye), Abby Camp(aye), Connie Patten(aye), Joe Paul(aye)

Hightide Homes LLC 45B Vestal Street Pool Hardscape 41/591 LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod
--------------------	--

Recused:	Carrie Thornewill, Joe Paul, Connie Patten
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	Carrie Thornewill: Lives at the end of Vestal and raises concerns about the visibility of the pool in the yard, which is directly in front of the house and visible from Vestal Street. She notes that while there are some visible pools on Vestal, she believes a fence should be added around the retaining wall to hide the pool and prevent further encroachment of visibility. She is worried about the "creep" of visibility and suggests that a fence would address this issue. Bill Bogle: Expresses concerns about the tightness of the shared driveway and parking lots. He mentions that a new drawing shows the parking lot with a couple of cars in it, but it is smaller than the current setup. His concern is whether the reduced space will allow for comfortable and safe movement in and out of the area. In summary, Carrie is advocating for a fence to obscure the pool and prevent it from being visible from the street, while Bill is concerned about the reduced space in the shared parking area, making it harder to maneuver safely.
Commissioner Comments:	Ray: Agrees with Carrie's suggestion of adding a fence to help screen the pool. He feels the fence doesn't need to be very tall, given the grade change between the road and the pool. The fence would ensure an opaque screen, as privet hedges tend to lose their leaves, making it less reliable as a barrier over time. Ray supports the idea of a fence to guarantee privacy and screening. Vall: Suggests that if the pool were oriented differently, it might create more space before addressing concerns about parking. Vall notes that there is a cut-through hedge in the area, which may be closing, but doesn't elaborate further. Abby: Expresses concern about the amount of hardscaping in the design, specifically the driveway and pool being located right in front of the house. She feels the hardscaping might dominate the space. Angus: Acknowledges that there are many pools in the neighborhood but raises concerns about this being the first pool on Vestal Street. He shares worries about hedges losing leaves or dying over time, reducing their effectiveness as a screen. Angus would be more comfortable if the pool were scaled down, rotated, or partially obstructed by a building or fence, especially on the evergreen side of the pool. He is not in favor of a fence on the street side of the house, as it would block the view, which is not typical in the neighborhood. Stephen: Also shares concerns about the pool's layout and its lack of connection with the house. He suggests rotating the pool or moving the shed to create more space between the pool and the house, which would allow the yard to communicate better with the house. Stephen's primary concern is minimizing the pool's visibility in the front yard, and he suggests shifting the design to make the pool feel more like it belongs in a side yard rather than the front yard. In summary, the main points are concerns about the pool's visibility from the street, the amount of hardscaping, and how the pool fits within the overall layout of the property. Suggestions include adding a fence, rotating or relocating the pool, and creating more space to improve the connection with the house and the surrounding landscape.

Motion:	Motion to hold for revisions plus view
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Abby Camp(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)

Richmond Great PT

6 Honeysuckle Dr

New Garage

68/888

KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus MacLeod, Connie Patten
Recused:	Ray Pohl,
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	☐ Dinah Klamert: Provides details about the materials and design choices for the house, including modular construction, 6-over-6 white window sash, chrome green front door with white trim, bluestone hardscaping, and black shingles for the roof.
Commissioner Comments:	Val: Points out that the houses have not been approved yet and raises a concern about the proximity of the house to the road. The drop in grade makes the house more visible, and while Val understands the desire not to push the house closer to the road, they emphasize that visibility is an issue. Angus: Expresses a preference for a more naturalistic approach to the north elevation of the house. They are in favor of making the design feel more integrated with the landscape. Abby: Suggests adding a porch at the back or making design adjustments so that the house does not feel like it's turning its back on the yard or the street. This could help make the rear of the house feel more welcoming or cohesive. Stephen: Emphasizes that landscaping is likely the most important aspect of the design and should be carefully considered. In summary, the main concerns focus on the visibility of the house due to its proximity to the road, the desire for a more naturalistic design, and the importance of landscaping to make the house feel integrated into its surroundings. Suggestions include adjusting the rear of the house with a porch or other design elements and ensuring that the landscaping enhances the overall design.
Motion:	Motion to approve is submitted
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Abby Camp(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye) Connie Patten (aye)

Richmond Great PT

6 Honeysuckle Dr

Pool Hardscape

68/888

KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Ray: Agrees with the proposed size of the pool (37x14) and mentions using Leyland Cypress in the buffer area.

	Stephen: Suggests that the plant materials visible from Old South Road should be naturalized, especially in areas not on this lot. He finds the proposed Leyland Cypress to be inappropriate and recommends using Green Giant Arborvitae instead. Stephen emphasizes the need for the plant materials' density and location to better blend with the surroundings. Val: Suggests moving the pool closer to the house and adding plants along the pool and patio to improve the design. In summary, the feedback highlights concern about the plant choice and its suitability for the site, with suggestions to use a more naturalized plant selection and reposition the pool closer to the house with added plantings around it.
Motion:	Motion is to hold the landscape for revisions
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Abby Camp(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye)

Richmond Great PT 4 Honeysuckle Dr New Dwelling 68/887 KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Connie – ok Angus – ok Vall – ok Ray - ok
Motion:	Health on mountain
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye)

Richmond Great PT 4 Honeysuckle Dr New Garage 68/887 KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Ray – ok Connie - ok
Motion:	Motion to approve
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye)

Richmond Great PT 4 Honeysuckle Dr Pool Hardscape 68/887 KOH/LFW

Minutes for Month, Day, Year; Adopted Month, Day, Year

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Ray – ok Connie – ok
Motion:	Motion to approve
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye)

Richmond Great PT 2 Honeysuckle Dr New Dwelling 68/886 KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	
Motion:	Motion for an exhibit, a showing the west elevation porch roof lower slightly.
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye)

Richmond Great PT 2 Honeysuckle Dr New Garage 68/886 KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten, Carrie Thornewill
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Val – best one Connie – ok Angus – ok Carrie - ok
Motion:	Motion with Georgetown gray roof to match
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye), Carrie Thornewill (aye)

Richmond Great PT 2 Honeysuckle Dr Pool Hardscape 68/886 KOH/LFW

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten, Carrie Thornewill
Recused:	
Representative:	

Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Val – ok Connie – ok Angus – ok Carrie - ok
Motion:	Motion with Georgetown gray roof to match
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye), Carrie Thornewill (aye)

7 Brewster Rd LLC**7 Brewster Rd****New Dwelling****54/286****LFW**

Alternates:	Ray Pohl, Val Oliver, Angus Macleod, Connie Patten, Joe Paul
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Val: Points out that the fireplace on the second floor seems out of proportion with the rest of the design. Joe: Suggests paying more attention to the trim around the door, as it might need re-finement. He also proposes that the door could potentially be a bit taller, and there could be a more appropriate treatment of the shingle and rail details. Connie: Agrees with the feedback so far but expresses uncertainty about the bifold door, suggesting that it might need further consideration. Angus: Finds the design of the top chord awkwardly high for how wide it is. He mentions that the top chord is 5/12 in both the original and the new design, and he recommends increasing it to at least 6/12 to improve the proportions. In summary, the concerns revolve around the proportions of the fireplace, the details around the door (particularly its height and trim), the bifold door, and the top chord's design on the structure. The general feedback suggests making adjustments to improve balance and visual harmony in the design.
Motion:	Move to hold for revisions
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Ray Pohl(chair)(aye), Ray Phool(aye), Val Oliver(aye), Angus MacLeod(aye)Connie Patten (aye),

85 Orange St LLC**85 Orange St****Reno garage****85R 55.4.1/27****Christopher Andersor**

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Joe Pohl, Angus Macleod, Carrie Thornewill
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	

Commissioner Comments:	Angus: Expresses concern that the gable is too small in relation to the facade, with too many details (door, windows, gable window) for such a small structure. He suggests the front door should be more formal, with less glass (or none) and a more prominent door casing. He also feels that the windows are too small and out of proportion with the door. Ray: Agrees with Mickey's points, particularly about the accuracy of the drawings and the window sizes, especially for the double-hung windows. He recommends resizing them to better match the proportions of the building. He also supports addressing the eaves on the east and west elevations. Joe: Concur with the concerns about window proportions, especially on the north elevation. He suggests making the windows wider to match the proportion of the 6-light window in the gable end. He also agrees that the front door should have fewer lights and more detailed trim, with a more prominent head casing. Regarding the gable, he suggests reducing the surface area and adding more windows to balance the design. Carrie: Emphasizes the importance of consistent window sizes throughout the design, particularly advocating for vertical panes of glass to maintain uniformity. Stephen: Supports the idea of consistency in window sizes and mentions that the dimensions are still problematic. He suggests creating an updated drawing ("Exhibit A") to clearly show all windows matching across elevations, with specific details on the windows, front door, and eaves. In summary, the feedback revolves around improving the proportions and consistency of the windows and door, especially ensuring the design elements are balanced and uniform across elevations. The front door should be formal with less glass, the gable needs to be adjusted in size, and the window sizes need to be consistent throughout the design.
Motion:	Motion to approve the creation of Exhibit A point one through 8.4
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Ray Pohl, Joe Pohl, Angus Macleod, Carrie Thornewill

FP \$ N Water **4 N Water** **Lift addition** **42.4.2/90** **Emeritus**

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Carrie Thornewill
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	☐ Holly: Expresses that the ADA lift addition feels somewhat out of place, even after reducing the trim as requested. She acknowledges the purpose of the addition but suggests it still doesn't blend well with the original building. Specifically, she notes the north elevation and how the addition disrupts the rhythm of the building's third bay. Holly also suggests adding windows or other architectural details to better integrate the addition with the original structure. She recommends a visual rendering of the final design to better understand how the completed building will look, especially once new construction is in place.
Public Comments:	

Commissioner Comments:	Carrie: Suggests that the addition could be lowered and that the missing corner board should be added, which may help improve the overall look. Angus: States that his concerns have already been addressed by other commissioners, so he doesn't have any additional comments. Overall, the discussion centers on making the ADA lift addition more cohesive with the historic structure. The focus is on refining architectural details, such as trim and fenestration, and using visual renderings to ensure the new construction complements the existing building. The goal is to balance functionality with the aesthetic integrity of the historic design.
Motion:	Motion through. Exhibit - to lower the eaves. 6 to 9 inches overall, and to add a faux window.
Vote:	Stephen Welch(chair), Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Carrie Thornewill

1 NSWR Road Trust

1 N Swift Rock

Garage

40/2

Emeritus

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Carrie Thornewill
Recused:	
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	
Public Comments:	Lisa - I'm very concerned about the overall mass of the additional buildings in addition to this one that they're proposing to put.
Commissioner Comments:	Abby suggests that on the north elevation, specifically on the second floor, the shingled walls could be brought in a little closer to the French doors. This adjustment would help make the balustrade less prominent, likely improving the overall aesthetic and flow of the design. Val: Expresses appreciation for the downsizing of the structure, noting that a reduction is always a positive move. Angus: Reflects on Bill's feedback, emphasizing the importance of proportions and visual balance in relation to the porch area and second-floor balcony. He suggests tweaking these elements to create a more harmonious design that aligns with the historical character of the Joy House while incorporating new additions. Angus also highlights the need to follow guidelines for dormer edges and recommends adjusting the width of the balcony to improve the overall aesthetic. Stephen: Suggests a small adjustment to the second-floor deck space, proposing that it be brought in about a foot on each side to improve its visibility and integration with the rest of the design. In summary, the feedback revolves around fine-tuning the proportions and ensuring that the new additions blend well with the historical design, focusing on visual balance, particularly around the second-floor balcony and porch areas.
Motion:	Motion to approve with those minor changes as an exhibit
Vote:	Stephen Welch(chair), Val Oliver, Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Carrie Thornewill

ACK Koda LLC

42 Shimmo Pond Rd

New Garage

43/126

Botticelli & Pohl

Alternates:	Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Joe Paul, Connie Patten,
Recused:	Carrie Thornville
Representative:	
Documentation:	
Staff Comments:	Holly - the chimney width, I think, should not be altered, understanding the need wanting to have a second story appreciate bringing back.
Public Comments:	
Commissioner Comments:	Abby: Suggests simplifying the design by having only one balcony, either in the main mass or in the secondary mass, instead of having two balconies in both areas. Joe: Prefers Option A, feeling it is the most appropriate and calmest. He also highlights the importance of chimneys in the design, emphasizing their iconic status and their relationship to the central masses. Connie: Doesn't have much to add regarding options B and C, but agrees with the suggestion about making changes to the second-floor fenestration. Angus: Also agrees that Option A is likely the most appropriate, particularly due to the picture window. Stephen: Agrees with Joe's points, noting that the color and trim color will play a key role in the final look of the design. In summary, the feedback leans toward Option A, which simplifies the design with fewer balconies and enhances the relationship between the chimneys and the central masses. The importance of trim color and fenestration changes is also noted as critical for the design's success.
Motion:	Motion to hope for revisions
Vote:	Carried 5-0 // Stephen Welch(chair), Abby Camp, Angus Macleod, Joe Paul, Connie Patten,