



Approved HDC Minutes-October 29, 2024, adopted February 4, 2025

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Stephen Welch (Chair), Ray Pohl (Vice-Chair), Abby Camp, Val Oliver, Angus MacLeod

Associate Commissioners: Carrie Thornewill, Constance Patten, Joe Paul

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, October 29, 2024

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

CALL TO ORDER

Stephen Welch called the meeting to order at 4:01 p.m.

Staff in Attendance:	Holly Backus, Sara Johnson, Fiona Johnson
Attending Members:	Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver
Remote Participants:	-Paul
Absent Members:	-
Late Arrivals:	-
Early Departures:	Thornewill

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Motion:	Motion to approve. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0//Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver(Aye)

I. COMMISSION DISCUSSION

1. 41 81L ATM Article (Emily Molden, Nantucket Water & Land Council)

Discussion:	Emily Molden, the Executive Director of the Nantucket Water & Land Council, presented a concept for a Citizens' Warrant article to address issues arising from properties subdivided under Section 4181 L of the state subdivision control law. This provision has allowed properties with historic structures to be subdivided into smaller lots, which has led to inappropriate redevelopment in Nantucket's historic districts, often resulting in odd, out-of-place configurations that compromise the area's character. The Historic District Commission (HDC) expressed strong support for Molden's initiative, with several members highlighting the challenges posed by these developments, such as increased density and poorly integrated new structures. They recommended further work on the proposal, including specific restrictions like limiting additional ground cover and exploring special permits, and suggested a follow-up meeting once more concrete details were available. The commission looks forward to continuing to support Molden's efforts to better regulate these subdivisions and protect the island's historic integrity.
-------------	--

II. VIEW ONLY- NO DISCUSSION

1. 29 Fair Street – Citizen Complaint regarding Minimum Maintenance (Ch.124-13)

The Commission addressed a citizen complaint regarding minimum maintenance at 29 Fair Street,

clarifying that a site visit would occur before any open discussion. Public comments were not taken at that time, but letters could be submitted for future consideration. The issue was set to be formally discussed at a meeting, likely on either the 12th or 19th, with no meeting scheduled for Thanksgiving week.

III. CONSENTS

1. 16 Quaker LLC 16 Quaker Rd	Window as built revisions	41/176.1	J Murray	SW
2. Lampe Dean 15 Aurora Wy New Shed 56/447 Self SW				
3. 2538970 Ontario Inc 5 Coffin St Sia Main Dw - Hist Determination		73.1.4/21	Emeritus LTD	SW
4. Mike & Marcia Kane 38 Vestal St	Shed addition	41/50	Val Oliver	SW
5. Cristner, Luci & Shawn 11 Bayberry Ln Add roof over garage doors		67/63	Val Oliver	SW
6. RMM Lemonade LLC 23 Masaquet	Pool & new Shed	80/139	EMDA	SW
7. Craig Harnishfeger 10 Dennis Dr	New Shed	67/361	Self	SW
8. O'Callahan 8 Second Way	New Cottage	55/664	Val Oliver	JP
9. NT Property Owner 14 Honeysuckle	New Dwelling	68/870	LFW	JP
10. NT Property Owner 3 Goldenrod	New Dwelling	68/866	LFW	JP
11. NT Property Owner 4 Goldenrod	New Dwelling	68/868	LFW	JP
12. NT Property Owner 5 Goldenrod	New Dwelling	68/867	LFW	JP
13. NT Property Owner 12 Beach Grass	Hardscape	68/856	LFW	JP
14. 6A Marble Way LLC 8 Marble Way	New Duplex	66/103.1	K Megna	VO
15. 6A Marble Way LLC 8 Marble Way	New garage	66/103.1	K Megna	VO
16. Cheney realty Trust 28 Equator Dr	Addition	56/342	BPC	VO
17. Terreri Steve 1 Dovekie Ct	Rooftop Solar	68/559	Cotuit Solar(Karen)	VO
18. Yellow Dog Nom Trust 224 Polpis Rd	New Garage Apt	26/22.3	Emeritus LTD	AC
19. Vigil Terry Anne Trust 26 Somerset Ln	New Cabana	66/10	JB Studio	AM
20. William VanHesdale Living Tr 6 Red Mill Ln Cabana addition fen changes		55/919.2	DTA/Anton	AM
21. 3 Pochick Surfside LLC 3 Pochick Ave Move Off Dwelling		80/323	WAPD	AM
22. HFR 19R Ack LLC 19R Hooper Farm Rd Move on from 2 Dukes Rd		55/220	LINK	CP
23. 3 Masaquet LLC 3 Masaquet Ave Move Demo dwelling		80/145	WAPD	CT
24. 3 Masaquet LLC 3 Masaquet Ave Move On (3 Pochick) reno dw		80/145	WAPD	CT
25. 3 Masaquet LLC 3 Masaquet Ave New garage		80/145	WAPD	CT
26. 3 Masaquet LLC 3 Masaquet Ave New shed		80/145	WAPD	CT
27. A Sandy Ack LLC 6 Sandy Dr Rev brick piers		29/76	NAG	RP
28. Jonathan Featherstone-Witty 8 Micheme Ln Add Overhang Garage		67/162.3	Self	RP
29. Oreo Trust 7 Kimball Ave New Shed		30/32.1	Ann Oliver	RP
30. J Cotto 3 Shawkemo Ln Color change roof		27/41	Val Oliver	RP
31. 46 W Miacomet LLC 46 W Miacomet Rd Move dwelling on lot		86/6	MCA+	RP
32. 46 W Miacomet LLC 46 W Miacomet Rd Move shed on lot		86/6	MCA+	RP
33. 1 Back St LLC 1 Back St Rev 10328 glazing change		55.1.4/427	Thornewill	RP
34. 3 Back St LLC 3 Back St Rev 10332 glazing change		55 348	Thornewill	RP

Motion:	Motion to approve. (Made By: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Camp, Patten(Aye)

IV. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

- Smith Matt & Alison TR 232 Madaket Rd Rev to #9537 Windows doors 59.4/120.1 Brook M RP
 - Add date of construction to COA (NHL Data = c.1986)
- Steven Davis Trust 7 Davis Ln Pool Hardscape 82/173 KMLD RP
 - Pool not to be seen at the time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.

3. St Mary's Church 6 Orange St Alterations 42.3.1/148.1 Hollister Consulting CP
 - Front door to be White
4. Gottwald, Mark Trust 4R Jefferson Ave Revs cottage 29/48.1 Topham RP
 - Correct the Northeast elevation to show the correct previously approved elevation; and no change to fenestration on the South East elevation – retaining its character defining elevation.
5. Trottier, Jeremy & Sarah 7 Moors End Ln Move off demo 43/218 Thornewill AM
 - Move off only

Pulled from Consent with Conditions
6. Muccia, Katherine 21 Pequot St Move off demo 80/132 Gryphon AM
 - Move off only

Pulled from Consent with Conditions
7. Lynch, Jeff 79 N Liberty St Roof Replacement 41/138 J Lydon AM
 - Add the date of construction to the COA (HDC Survey NAN.1856 =c.1927 Colonial Revival)
8. Butnell Corp 127 Orange St Roof Replacement 55/146 J Lydon AM
 - Add the date of construction to the COA (NHL Data = c.2010)
9. Volman, Dana 51 Ridge Ln Add and replace window/door 38/60 NAG CT
 - Approve due to limited visibility.
10. Barbara & Gerald Hamelberg 9 Davis Ln Pool hardscape 82/74 Atlantic CT
 - Pool not to be seen at the time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.
11. Ack 33.5 Vesper Ln LLC 33.5 Vesper Ln Pool change 55/908 Atlantic VO
 - Pool, fire pit, and outdoor grill not to be visible at the time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.
12. Damashek Jonathan 77 Vestal St New Spa 56/473 SMRD JP
 - Spa not to be visible at the time of inspection and in perpetuity. No grade change from existing or as noted on the application.
13. Thomas & Kerry Donovan 104 Surfside Rd Garage Revs 67/349 EMDA JP
 - Approve due to limited visibility.
14. Mary Heller Trust 37 Ocean Ave Roof Replacement 73.3.2/49 J Lydon JP
 - Add the date of construction to the COA (HDC Survey NAN.2104 = c.1882 Burbank & Richards House)
15. Thomas Thomas 48 Nobadeer Ave Roof Replacement 88/6 J Lydon SW
 - Add the date of construction to the COA (NHL Data = c.1960)
16. 156 Cliff Rd Nom Trust 156 Cliff Rd New Cabana 41/836 S Metz SW
 - Lower top plate and roof assembly by 6"
17. 156 Cliff Rd Nom Trust 156 Cliff Rd New Pavilion 41/836 S Metz SW
 - Lower top plate and roof assembly by 6"

Motion:	Motion to approve the consent with conditions, excluding items five and six. (Made By:Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

5. Trottier, Jeremy & Sarah 7 Moors End Ln Move off demo 43/218 Thornewill AM

Voting:	Welch, Camp, Patten, Thornewill, MacLeod
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Carrie Thornewill
Discussion:	Holly Backus - Stated that the structure was built in 1994 and was non-contributing
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (made by: Camp)

Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)
-------	--

6. Muccia, Katherine 21 Pequot St Move off demo 80/132 Gryphon AM

Voting:	Welch, Camp, Patten, Thornewill, MacLeod
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ethan Gryphon
Discussion:	Holly Backus - Stated that the structure was built in 1997, is a non-contributing building, and she would like to see it moved rather than demolished.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

V. SIGNS-NEW BUSINESS

1. Cape Cod 5 Savings Bank 112 Pleasant St Wall Sign (Hours) Rev 55/149 Poyant Signs
 - Recommend for approval.
2. NIR Retail LLC (CCS) ZERO Main St Wall Sign Rev 42.3.1/181 Poyant Signs
 - Recommend for approval
3. NIR Retail LLC (CCS) ZERO Main St Window Sign (Hours) 42.3.1/181 Poyant Signs
 - Recommend for approval

Motion:	Motion to approve the sign applications as recommended by the sign committee. (Made By:Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

VI. OLD BUSINESS 10/15/24

1. Wallace 65 Polpis Road Move on (from 19 Nobadeer Farm) 43/13 LINK AC
 - Approved on consent agenda 9/24/24 & opened back up 10/15/24 – HELD for abutters notification
 - Commissioners: Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Paul, Patten (VO & CT recused)

Discussion:	-
Motion:	Motion to approve the application as per the consent agenda. (made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 4-0// Welch, Pohl, MacLeod, Patten (Aye)

VII. NEW BUSINESS 9/03/24

1. Robert Jepson 32 Hinsdale Rd As-Built Shed	68/19.2 Ryan Jepson	VO
Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Alternates: Patten & Thornewill)	
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.	
Representative:	Ryan Jepson	
Discussion:	Chair Welch -Suggested proceeding with the discussion despite the applicant's absence. Val Oliver -Noted the application lacked clear material specifications. -Suggested that the application be further clarified before proceeding.	

	Chair Welch -Proposed that Oliver forward any concerns or comments to Staff for follow-up with the applicant. -Suggested the application be held until the applicant responded to the questions raised.
--	---

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 10/01/24

1. 3 Pochick Surfside LLC 3 Pochick Ave Demo Cabana 80/323 WAPD AM
2. 3 Pochick Surfside LLC 3 Pochick Ave Demo Shed 80/323 WAPD AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Andrew Kotchen
Discussion:	The Board - Showed a preference for moving the cabana and shed rather than demolishing them, as smaller structures are often easier to move and repurpose. Holly Backus - Clarified that the cabana was not a dwelling or winterized structure, but rather an open-screen structure with a bathroom and a bar, and noted that according to NHL records, it was built in 2003. Chair Welch -Advised the applicant to review the article's language with the Building Commissioner and proposed posting a notice as a precaution.
Motion:	Motion to approve the move demo. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

3. Golden Pond LLC 64 & 66 Baxter Rd New Primary Dwelling 49/188&51 WAPD CT

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Andrew Kotchen
Discussion:	Holly Backus - Mentioned that the inspiration for the design came from a historic shingle-style house, the Mayflower (Circa 1893), located across from the property at 61 Baxter Road. The Board -Expressed concern about the use of black sash, suggesting a darker gray or a traditional green as a more fitting alternative for the Sconset context. Public Comment - Rob Bentley, chair of the Sconset Advisory Group, praised the applicant for their thorough work on the application and expressed no major concerns. The only comment was about the presence of multiple second-floor decks, which were spread out and not seen as a significant issue.
Motion:	Motion to approve the application subject to the condition that the trim and sash be a platinum gray, with a darker gray to be determined from a reference chip, and the color approved by the Vice Chair. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

4. Golden Pond LLC 64 & 66 Baxter Rd New Secondary Dwelling 49/188&51 WAPD CT

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Andrew
Discussion:	Holly Backus - Stated that the height of the secondary dwelling should be reduced and that the covered breezeway and garage doors should be more typical of the neighborhood The Board -Expressed concerns about the height of the secondary dwelling, the design of the garage doors, and the amount of glass in the garage, suggesting adjustments to better align with the neighborhood's character.
Motion:	Motion to approve the application with the condition to reduce the height by one foot and use gray-gray trim to match the main house. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

5. Susan & Tim Grell 21 Field Ave Rev to COA pool & add spa 80/41 LINK CP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Victoria Ewing
Discussion:	The Board -Raised concern regarding the visibility of the proposed fence around the perimeter of the property, given the topography and vegetation, and how it would impact the streetscape.
Motion:	Motion to hold the application for a site visit and follow up through Staff. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

IX. NEW BUSINESS 10/15/2024

1. Gandhi, Balaji & Allison 9 New Jersey Remove Chimney 60.3.1/408 Shelter 7 RP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternate:	Patten, Thornewill
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Jason Olbres

Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that chimneys are typically characteristic of vernacular architecture, and while she believed it would be a shame to lose the chimney, the 1989 HDC survey indicated that the original 1938 structure did not have a chimney, suggesting it was added later. She expressed concern about losing the chimney as a character-defining feature but acknowledged that it was not part of the original design.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 4-1// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Oliver (Aye) Camp (Nay)

2. MA Carr Trustee 16 Walsh St Move Off / Demo 42.4.1/50 Sandcastle Rob N RP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Rob Newman
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that the structure in question was a 1960s contributing infill, and while she understood the need to move it, she expressed concern about losing the building, especially given its period of significance. She also recommended that more information, such as photographs, tax information, and dimensions, be provided. The Board -Expressed concern about the potential demolition of the structure and preferred exploring options for moving and modifying it, rather than removing it entirely Public Comment -Mickey Rowland, representing the Historic Structure Advisory Group, commented that they agreed with Holly's concerns, stating that the building should be saved in some form rather than demolished. They emphasized that parts of the building could potentially be preserved in some configuration on one of the two lots.
Motion:	Motion to hold the application for additional information, with the purpose of further discussion regarding the potential move and modifications to the structure. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

3. Robinson West Trust 23 New St Demo Chimney 73.4.2/77

Normand

RP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ben Normand

Discussion:	Holly Backus -Noted that the chimney is a character-defining feature and, although it could have been a later addition, demolishing it may be inappropriate, as it contributes to the building's overall historical significance. The Board -Discussed concern about losing a character-defining feature of the building by demolishing the rear chimney, which contributes to the quirkiness of the structure.
Motion:	Motion to approve the demolition of the chimney with the condition that the bricks be reused and a 180-day wait period be observed. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 3-2// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye) MacLeod & Camp (Nay)

4.Wagner Richard 12 Plover Ln Deck addition LR add 12/54 NAG

RP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Steve Theroux
Discussion:	-
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

5. Casabelles Dos LLC 5 Shawkemo Hills Fenestration change rev 10161 27/40 Jennifer Smith RP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Chris Smith
Discussion:	Holly Backus - Highlighted the importance of preserving the existing vegetation to maintain screening and noted that the proposed alterations could result in a departure from the intended Nantucket architectural style if visible. The Board -Expressed concerns regarding the potential visibility of the proposed modifications and their impact on the building's architectural style, particularly if the changes became visible due to inadequate vegetative screening
Motion:	Motion to approve the application, contingent upon the continued maintenance of the existing vegetation that screens the structure from view, to be preserved in perpetuity. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

6. McCollum, Susan B 35 Eel Point Rd Move Off / Demo Garage 32/63 Botticelli & Pohl SW

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Lisa Botticelli
Discussion:	-
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

7. Nelson, Carl E & Karen L 21 Wigwam Rd Building Move-on 77/15.9 Chip Webster SW

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Lucas Velle
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Recommended that the approval explicitly mention that the building is being relocated from the previously approved 30 Russell Way move-off project. The Board -Raised concerns regarding the lack of clear elevations indicating the building's orientation, specifically with respect to the side facing the street.
Motion:	Motion to approve with the following conditions: the existing North elevation will be reoriented to face East following the removal of the jog, and the resulting blank facade will require a subsequent review by the HDC for approval of modifications. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

8. 18 Bishops Rise LLC 18 Bishops Rise Pickleball Court 40/126 Atlantic SW

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Motion:	Motion to allow the application to be withdrawn without prejudice. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

9. Kyle Snell 5 Pine Crest Dr Hardscape 68/427 Thornewill SW

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Carrie Thornewill
Discussion:	The Board - Raised concerns about the grade change along the property line where the fence is proposed and inquired whether the plan should address retainage.

Motion:	Motion to hold the application for additional information, including a plan addressing the retainage and a proposal for vining materials on the fence. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

10. Campbell, Steve 6 Howard St Color change to Quaker Gray 42.3.3/10 Self JP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Heather Mchold
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that proposed structure is an individually significant 1840 structure within the Old Historic District. -Noted that the proposed color change may be too dark. The Board - Discussed whether the proposed shift from Nantucket gray to Quaker gray on the clapboard front was appropriate and harmonious with the historic district, noting potential contrast with the white trim.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

11. Higgins Carolyn, M 6 Fair St Rev 10363 dormer 42.3.1/151 Botticelli & Pohl JP

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Lisa Botticelli
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Noted the building's historical significance as a 1930s bungalow and expressed that the revised dormer design did not align with building with Nantucket in mind, emphasizing that exterior features should not be dictated by interior challenges. The Board - Discussed whether the proposed revisions to the rear dormers compromised the historical appropriateness and symmetry of the structure, noting concerns about visibility and alignment with guidelines. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland concurred with Backus.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

12. Brandon Eldridge 26 Arlington St New Pool 76.1.3/281 Self VO

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Brandon Eldridge

Discussion:	The Board - Expressed reservations about approving the pool without a clear plan for the future shed/office and emphasized the need to ensure the pool is not visible from the street.
Motion:	Motion to approve the application with the condition that a 4-foot board fence be installed parallel to the street side of the pool to block visibility, with the option to amend the COA if a shed is built in the future. Not visible at time inspection or thereafter in perpetuity. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 4-1// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Oliver (Aye) Camp (Nay)

13.Henderson Barbara 6A Silver St New shed 55.4.1/187.1 JB Studio VO

APPLICATION NOT HEARD

14. National Grid 10 New Whale Demo (Commercial Structure) 42.3.1/37 Marisa L Pizzi VO

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Marissa Pizzi
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Expressed opposition to the demolition, citing the building's historical significance dating back to 1927 and its inclusion as a contributing structure in the National Historic District. She suggested stabilizing and restoring the structure instead of demolition. Colin Grimes (National Grid Representative) -Explained that the process of restoring the building had been reviewed but would be extremely costly and challenging, particularly due to the environmental contamination on the site. He emphasized that stabilizing the structure through strategic demolition was necessary to avoid further safety hazards, as parts of the building were deteriorating and posing risks to pedestrians. Colin also mentioned the difficulty of leasing the remaining parking lot because of these safety concerns. He further noted that restoring the building could hinder National Grid's ability to meet sustainability goals and comply with state and federal initiatives. The Board -Expressed concerns about the demolition and recommended exploring options for stabilizing or restoring the building, given its historical and architectural significance. Public Comment -Mickey Rowland echoed Holly's concerns, highlighting the building's importance to Nantucket's industrial history and suggesting that the roof deterioration was the result of neglect. -David Fredericks, a former employee of Nantucket Electric (now National Grid), shared historical context regarding the structure's demolition permissions from the 1990s. He acknowledged the deteriorated state but noted that the company had been committed to preserving some elements of the power plant. - Mary Bergman of the Nantucket Preservation Trust emphasized the importance of restoring the building, pointing out the demolition delay complaint and questioning why the structure had been allowed to deteriorate when Nantucket has a minimum maintenance bylaw.
Motion:	Motion to hold for additional information. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

15. Orange Swordfish 28 Orange St Parapet 42.3.2/175 Emeritus LTD VO

• **HOLD PER APPLICANT**

16. FP 4 N Water 4 N Water St Add ADA Lift addition 42.4.2/90 Emeritus LTD VO

• **HOLD PER APPLICANT**

17. Ed & Brook Garden 15 Lily St Color change front 42.3.4/10 W Freed VO

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	William Freed
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Noted that the structure is a circa 1820 Federal style, and the use of white-on-white may not be appropriate for this style, suggesting some contrast The Board - Discussed concern regarding the proposed color change Public Comment -Mickey Rowland concurred with Backus
Motion 1:	Motion to approve Lancaster White for the clapboard with all other trim in white as proposed. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 3-2// Welch, Pohl, Oliver (Aye) Camp, MacLeod (Nay)
Motion 2:	Supplemental motion to approve prior motion with the addition of a Platinum Gray foundation. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 3-2// Welch, Pohl, Oliver (Aye) Camp, MacLeod (Nay)

18. Elihu Tuttle 103A Old South Rd Hardscape 68/164.1 LFW AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Linda Williams
Discussion:	The Board - Expressed a concern about the lack of dimensional information on the plan, which was clarified to be 10 ft deep and 15 ft wide for the apron
Motion:	Motion to approve the curb cut for a 10 ft deep by 15 ft wide asphalt apron at the current location, as scaled off the drawing. (Made by: Thornewill)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

19. Lamb Nassif 38 Wauwinet Rd Rev to COA 2024-08-6979 20/21 Val Oliver AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Camp, Patten
Alternates:	Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Val Oliver
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Expressed concern about the use of Anderson windows, noting that while SDL was not an issue, the mutton profiles of Anderson windows were not considered historically

	appropriate.
Motion:	Motion to approve the proposed window changes with the condition that all windows be replaced with SDL (true divided light) windows, using Boston Sash windows for the four front windows. (Made by: Welch)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Thornewill, Patten (Aye) Camp (Abstained)

20. 108 Cliff Family Trust 108 Cliff Rd New Garage 41/89 BPC AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Joe Paul
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Expressed appreciation for the gambrel design, which mimicked the main house, but suggested pushing the garage back to better align with the main structure's mass.
Motion:	Motion to approve the garage as submitted, with the condition that the garage be moved 3 feet behind the southeast corner of the main house, aligning it better with the house's massing. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Oliver (Aye) Camp (Abstained)

21. Harry + Marsha Ryan 29 Longwood Dr New windows door 76/19 Sanne Payne AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Sanne Payne
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: Oliver)
Vote:	Carried 3-2// Welch, Oliver, Pohl(Aye) Camp, MacLeod (Nay)

22. Hightide Homes LLC 45B Vestal St Pool hardscape 41/591 Atlantic AM

APPLICATION NOT HEARD

23. Lee John A & Kelly C 1 Ridge Ln New Garage 38/91 Gryphon Architect AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ethan Gryphon
Discussion:	The Board -Expressed concern about the garage being positioned too far forward, its angled placement, and the unnecessary pent roof design.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted, with the modification to eliminate the small pent roof design. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 3-2// Welch, Oliver, Pohl(Aye) Camp, MacLeod (Nay)

24. Drake & Steele 3 Primose Ln New gate 40/47.1 Gryphon Architect AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Patten, Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Ethan Gryphon
Discussion:	The Board -Raised concerns about whether the existing lamp posts had been previously approved, as this is a key element of the application.
Motion:	Motion to hold the application until confirmation of the approval of the existing lamp posts was provided, with the information to be submitted by Thursday at noon for review at the next Tuesday meeting. (Made by: Pohl)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Pohl, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

25. Ack Koda LLC 42 Shimmo Pond Rd MH Move & reno 43/126 Botticelli & Pohl AM

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Lisa Botticelli
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that the Shimo Boathouse, a 1928 contributing structure with historical ties to the Jewish community, should be relocated outside the floodway, with verified FEMA data, clarified elevation and flood-proofing measures, and preservation of the character-defining chimneys; additionally, a detailed plan distinguishing existing and proposed elements would enhance clarity regarding the proposed changes. The Board -Expressed concern about the proposed alterations to the contributing structure.
Motion:	Motion to hold the application for revisions, including the submission of a plan from the surveyor indicating the design flood elevation and the proposed house location. (Made by: Patten)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

26. Ack Koda LLC 42 Shimmo Pond Rd New Guest House 43/126 Botticelli & Pohl AM

27. Ack Koda LLC 42 Shimmo Pond Rd New Garage 43/126 Botticelli & Pohl AM

TRACKING WITH MOVE/RENO APPLICATION

Motion:	Motion to track the new guest house and garage (items 26 and 27) for further review (Made by: Patten)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

28. 41 Hulbert LLC 41 Hulbert Ave Fenestration Revs 10586 29/18 Botticelli & Pohl CT

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Lisa Botticelli

Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that while the proposed window style is reminiscent of some houses along Herbert Avenue, it is not suitable for existing structure. Mickey Rowland -Concurred with Backus The Board -Discussed concern regarding the proposed window style.
Motion:	Motion to hold the application for revisions. (Made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

29. Richmond Great PT 5 Sandplain Dr New Dwelling 68/349 KOH CT

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill, Paul
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Linda Williams
Discussion:	Holly Backus -Stated that while the proposed window style is reminiscent of some houses along Herbert Avenue, it is not suitable for existing structure. The Board -Expressed a preference for the house to be a foot shorter if it were built with stick construction.
Motion:	Motion to approve as submitted. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

30. Richmond Great PT 6 Honeysuckle Dr New Dwelling 68/888 KOH CT

Voting:	Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver
Alternates:	Thornewill
Documentation:	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, advisory comments.
Representative:	Linda Williams
Discussion:	Linda Williams -Presented a site plan for the three structures at 2, 4, and 6 Honeysuckle Drive, which were digitally submitted. The Board -Expressed concern about the visibility of the back of the houses.
Motion:	Motion to hold the application for more information and to track additional information for the three properties at 2, 4, and 6 Honeysuckle Drive. (Made by: MacLeod)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, MacLeod, Patten, Camp, Oliver (Aye)

X. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

-September 10, 2024; June 11, 2024

Motion:	Motion to approve as drafted. (made by: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 3-0// Camp, MacLeod, Patten (Aye) Oliver, Welch (Abstained)

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Motion:	Motion to adjourn. (Made By: Camp)
Vote:	Carried 5-0// Welch, Camp, MacLeod, Patten, Oliver (Aye)

YouTube Link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sKCVVPexko8>