



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday December 13, 2022

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 4:03 pm. and announcements by Mr. Welch

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist; Adrian Rodriguez, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra, Thornewill, Patten

Remote participant: None

Absent Members: Pohl

Late Arrivals: Thornewill, 4:07 pm

Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda:

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

1. None

II. COMMISSION COMMENTS

1. Coombs – On next Tuesday's agenda, she wants HDC to discuss her letter about reinstating the advisory boards; it's not on the Select Board agenda, as well as a discussion about the Staff letter.

III. DISCUSSION & VOTE

January-March 2023 HDC Schedule

Motion **No action at this time.**

Vote N/A

IV. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. ARI Real Estate 11-7372	10 Delaney Lot 130	Rev. 1882: hardscape	41/120	John Lampe
2. ARI Real Estate 11-7392	10 Delaney Lot 130	Rev. 11-2228: add shutter	41/120	John Lampe
3. Clay St. Development 11-7454	44 Skyline Drive	Move on studio	79/990	Structures Ultd
4. Clay St. Development 11-7455	44 Skyline Drive	Move on cottage	79/990	Structures Ultd
5. Ted Shure 12-7576	334 Skyline Drive	Roof replacement	24/11	Richard Purnier
6. Ted Shure 12-7577	334 Skyline Drive	Roof replacement	24/11	Richard Purnier
7. Stephany Hunter 12-7561	19 Golfview Drive	Rev. 04-6099: trim color	66/173	JGGA
8. Marc Silver 12-7561	9 Lyons Lane	Fenestration change	76/25	NAG
9. Maggie Kelly 11-7470	7a New Lane	Window wells	41/285.1	SCI
10. Gary Stahl 11-7423	12 Somerset Lane	Hardscape	56/55	Linda Williams
11. Peder Gulbrandsen 11-7383	18 Milk Street	MH roof replacement-cedar	42.3/34	Alvaro Castro
12. Peder Gulbrandsen 11-7381	18 Milk Street	GH roof replacement-cedar	42.3/34	Alvaro Castro
13. William Waldorf 12-7573	50 Madequecham Vly Rd	Repair & replace foundation	88/74	EMDA
14. Richard Prunier 11-7407	49 Goldfinch Drive	Rear addition	68/552	Richard Prunier
15. White Elephant 10-7342	50 Easton Street	Stair alterations	42.4.1/23	Dennis Patnaude
16. NIR Retail, LLC 11-7366	9 South Beach Street	Roof replacement	42.4.2/58	T & T roofing
17. NIR Retail, LLC 11-7367	4 Federal Street	Roof replacement	42.3.1/173	T & T Roofing
18. Perennial Properties, LLC 10-7312	11 Rhode Island Avenue	Roof replacement	60.3.1/351	J. Featherstone-Witty
19. Joshua Dalton 11-7384	2 Mikes Drive	New garage	66/75	LINK
20. 11 India Street LLC 11-7413	31 Center Street	ADA entrance	42.3.1/68	Emeritus LTD
21. Nigel Goss 11-7378	8R Blueberry	New Dwelling	80/302.1	Thornewill Design
22. Nigel Goss 11-7379	8R Blueberry	New cottage	80/302.1	Thornewill Design
23. Mike Romano 11-7368	55 Easton Street	Historic determination	42.4.1/186	Shelter 7

Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten

Alternates Dutra

Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns No concerns.
 Motion **Motion to Approve. (Coombs)**
 Vote Carried 4-1//Camp opposed

Certificate # **HDC2022-(as noted)**

V. CONSENTS WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Dimov Georgi 11-7369	3 Miles Court	New 2 nd Dwelling	68/187.2	Dimov Georgi
• Run eave with overhang below dormer each side of the building				
2. Gorin Puljic 12-7563	14 Almanack Pnd Rd	Solar roof array	25/12	ACKSmart
• Due to lack of visibility				
3. Ashelee Fredrickson 12-7545	48 Skyline Drive	Solar roof array	79/45	ACKSmart
• Due to lack of visibility				
4. Carrie Wofford 12-7564	20 Madaquecham Vly Rd	Solar roof array	89/16	ACKSmart
• Due to lack of visibility				
5. Joshua Morash 11-7508	8 Bayberry Lane	Solar roof array	67/72	ACKSmart
• Due to lack of visibility				
6. Two Stroke Holdings 11-7439	66 Madaket Road	New pool	41/200.3	SCI
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter and to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				
7. Michael Brenner 12-7554	33 Norwood Street	Rev. 10-7270: Resite spa	76.4.3/1	NAG
• Spa not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter and to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				

Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten, Oliver

Alternates Dutra

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No additional concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate # **HDC2022-(as noted)**

VI. NEW BUSINESS 10/11/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Campana Ltd Prtnr 10-7319	4 Cabot Lane	Addition & new foundation	30/254	Workshop APD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornehill			
Alternates	Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:07)	Kotchen – Presented project; the windows will be true-divided lights (TDL) not simulated-divide light (SDL). Will come back with a landscape plan; will have a cap over the extended basement. Asked if they could dismantle all plains of the building for excavation of the new foundation and reassemble it. Backus – This was a shop in 1930s. Appreciated retention of the building and utilization of basement. It seems much of the rear exterior walls are being demolished. Rear addition could be done without that loss. French doors should be reduced to one 12-light with kick panel and possibly visible from the other street. West same. Dutch batten front door not appropriate. Overall scale is good. How it will be done should be documented and submitted into the file Read advisory group comments: Batten door feels out of place. Oliver – Nothing but the foundation is circled. Appreciates the scale. Asked the material over the extended basement. Not in favor of dismantling this. Coombs – No concerns with TDL windows and a 6-panel front door. Camp – No comments. Suggested a stake pole (sic) to ensure it doesn't go up in height. Thornehill – Appreciates the proposal. The batten door isn't great but okay; would also be okay with a 6-light door. Welch – Agree with Ms. Thornehill and Ms. Backus. It seems the on-line plans were not the updated version. The complete application was submitted. Agrees about having a benchmark. It's a small enough structure Discussion about issues with lifting the building for basement excavation and possible alternatives that are less destructive to the building.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted the full application through staff with drawings showing the penalization, a narrative on how it will be done, a benchmark, and photos. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-2//Oliver & Coombs opposed			

Certificate # **HDC2022-10-7319**

VII. NEW BUSINESS 10/25/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Tyler Hammond 10-7290	8 Sparks Avenue	Window replacement	55/201	Tyler Hammond
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:25)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No action at this time.			
Vote	N/A		Certificate #	
2. 27 Fair St, LLC 11-7457	29 Fair Street	Historic Renovation	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop/APD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten			
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:39)	Kotchen – Presented project; will reuse elsewhere any windows being removed. No change to the rear structure. Front clapboard should be light grey. In the 1890 photos, there is a “white line” on the front between the buildings so feel the gutter is okay. Backus – This is an individually significant structure within the Fish Lot, The Woodbox; circa 1707-1740. The structural engineer noted theirs was a cursory review of the windows; suggest consulting Brian Pfeiffer. The application states white and natural clapboard; the photo indicates white clapboard with white trim; trim and clapboard should contrast, and clapboard should be duller. Appreciate keeping existing fenestration while restoring. The existing plank frames should also be kept. Asked if using same openings within historic west wall. The dimensions of the extension of the shed addition on west aren’t clear. Concerned about removal of the interior rear windy stairs to the 3rd-floor but still a character-defining element. Recommend seeking historic tax credit; HDC will review the historic determination application when the tax request is submitted. Read advisory group comments: The proposed mulled window on the North elevation should be separated into 2 individual windows. Reuse existing windows that are being removed. Camp – Regarding the gutter separating the 2 sections, thinks it detracts from the historic status. No other concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with platinum grey clapboard and complete window survey standards. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-1//Camp opposed		Certificate #	HDC2022-11-7457
3. 27 Fair St, LLC 11-7458	27 Fair Street	Historic Renovation (front)	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop/APD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra			
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:26)	Kotchen – Presented project; white trim & sash and black doors. Backus – Within the Fish Lots per the updated HDC survey; circa 1837 Fair Gardens Greek Revival. Okay with removal of south elevation door; overall, no concerns. Appreciate the window survey. Encouraged they follow the expert recommendations as laid out in the engineer’s letter. Read advisory group comments: No concerns as long as existing windows are restored and not replaced. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-11-7458

4.	27 Fair St, LLC 11-7459	27 Fair Street	Historic Renovation (back)	42.3.2/193.1	Workshop/APD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:35)	Kotchen – Presented project. The windows on this are not historic; all were recently replaced. Backus – Circa 1981-1994 per updated HDC survey. No concerns. Read advisory group comments: No concerns as long as existing windows are restored and not replaced. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-11-7459
5.	27 Fair St, LLC 10-7258	27 Fair Street	Hardscape	42.3.2/193.1	Ahern
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:56)	Ahern – Presented project. The 3-car parking was shell but must be a hard surface to comply with Americans with Disabilities Administration (ADA); can use cobblestone for the non-ADA spots. Backus – Concerned about the amount of impervious surface and the brick drop-off which increases the amount of curbing; the 2nd curb cut doesn't conform with zoning and should go to the Planning Board. Read advisory group comments: Asked if there is an outdoor lighting plan. Camp – There's too much hardscaping in the 3 parking spaces; would like to see more vegetation. The brick drop-off is a good idea but looks somewhat modern. The existing stone is larger than PA fieldstone; should replicate what's existing. Coombs – Thinks the drop-off will create too much activity for Hillers Lane. Concerned about the proposal being too formal compared to what it is now. Backus – Abutter asked that they don't use travelling ivy. Oliver – Would like the large parking area broken up. Dutra – Appreciates keeping the existing trees. Confirmed the height of the walls (18"). Asked if there's a lot of exposed foundation wall (no). We need to be more specific about the wall type. Welch – Asked the latitude on surface material between ADA and 3 other spots.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with stonewall material to match existing in type and dimensions and breaking up the other than ADA parking with cobble. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7258
6.	27 Fair St, LLC 10-7320	29 Fair Street	Hardscape	42.3.2/192	Ahern
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten				
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC				
Public	Bill Fordyce, 3 Darling Street				
Concerns (5:17)	Ahern – Presented project. Will take care of drainage. No firepit is proposed. Backus – Appreciate gravel walkways. The Town sidewalk in front is macadam; asked if they are proposing to make that brick (no). Read advisory group comments: If there is a fire pit, it is not appropriate. Asked if there is an outdoor lighting plan, the location of the air-conditioning units (A/C), and if there is a fence behind the utility area. Fordyce – Drainage has been going into his basement. Camp – Asked about the 6' fence and if it is a 5&1; she'd prefer a simple board. Oliver – She prefers what's there versus the board fence. Coombs – She prefers balusters rather than lattice. Patten – Nothing to add. Welch – Asked about the A/C; they need to be screened with a short-board fence or lattice with a plant. It looks like the fence is on the yard side of the A/C rather than the street side.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south and southwest retaining existing fence and 5&1 with baluster. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7320

7. Brian Herlihy 10-7260	3 Rudder Lane	Addition	66/361	JB Studio
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Dutra, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat, JB Studio			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:31)	Bencat – Presented project. Oliver – Appreciate moving the driveway. It's a good job. Agree about the porch; the existing seems higher. Thornewill – because the existing is miniscule and you're adding to it, it seems it could be rendered deeper; this building feels top-heavy and tall because of that. There are too many skylights; one per side is sufficient. Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill about the skylights; it should be in the upper 1/3 rd of the roof. Camp – Agrees with what's been said. Welch – He agrees about the porch being deeper; the roof should go to 4/12.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the porch roof to be 4/12 and the porch to be 6' deep on skylight per side and in the up 1/3rd of the roof. (Thornewill)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7260	
8. Rick Peterson 11-7414	30 Main Street Sias	Garage revisions	73/3/1/76	Jeff Morash
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat, JB Studio			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:41)	Welch – This is a garage replacement, not revisions.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7260	

BREAK

VIII. OLD BUSINESS 11/01/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. 1010 Wins, LLC 10-7316	10 Lincoln Avenue	Demo garage	30/184	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra			
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
	Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:59)	MacEachern – This has been changed to a move-off/demolition. Submitted documentation supporting our estimate that this was built in 1957. Historically, HDC has referenced the 1989 survey; using 50 years is a substantial change. Backus – Appreciates changing to a move-off/demo; both garage and house have HDC surveys; this is indicated as having been in this location in 1948; there are some 1938 aerials. This is a contributing structure. In 1989 when the 1 st survey was done, this did not meet the 50-year criteria; now anything built up to 1979 can be deemed contributing. Read advisory group comments: This garage is old enough to warrant being preserved, if not for the sake of history, then for the preservation of valuable resources; the condition appears to be in very good condition. It could easily be turned around to face Lincoln Avenue and located in the space on the attached site plan outlined in orange lines and labelled "Existing wood patio to be demolished." This location is near the back of the main dwelling and further removed from Lincoln Street making it preferable to the proposed location which is nearly level with the front of the house, and it will allow for the cars to be less visibly parked beside the house rather than in front. Reusing this garage also maintains the eave forward design which is much more traditional and appropriate compared to the gable forward design proposed for the new garage. The old and new garages are close enough in size that recycling the old just makes sense. Camp – She would prefer the drive to continue to be off Capaum Road. The garage placed left of the house looks like an extension of the main house; if it can't go in the back, it should come forward of the main house. Would prefer it be restored as is. Coombs – There are no other driveways off Lincoln Avenue immediately around this. From the photos, it's in great shape and spacious; she would prefer it be moved on the site and reused. Thinks there could be an agreement to keep the driveway off Capaum Road. Oliver – It's a shame they aren't reusing it; it's almost the same size and shape as the proposed cabana. Ms. Backus says it's contributing but Mr. MacEachern's paperwork says it isn't; asked for an explanation. Dutra – This is a solid structure; it would be really great to see it reused on the property. It would make sense to move it forward to the house and possibly convert it into the cabana.			

Welch – We don't have an updated survey or information that this meets criteria for contributing. He'd like to get back to the merits. He agrees with Mr. Dutra; it can be appropriate in the location for the new garage.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate #

2. 1010 Wins, LLC **10-7317** 10 Lincoln Avenue New garage 30/184 Emeritus LTD

Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra

Alternates Thornewill, Patten

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.

Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development

Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP

Public None

Concerns (5:18) **Welch** – Asked this be held in the event they can reuse the existing garage.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate #

3. 1010 Wins, LLC **10-7336** 10 Lincoln Avenue New cabana & o/d shwr 30/184 Emeritus LTD

Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra

Alternates Thornewill, Patten

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.

Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development

Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP

Public None

Concerns (6:35) **MacEachern** – Asked to move forward with this and the pool. Presented the project; can reduce the fenestration open to the pool. Pool equipment will go below the structure.

Backus – 5-unit bifold French door is inappropriate; should be a single French door with 12-light with kick panel.

Read advisory group comments: The 5 ganged French doors may be visible from Capaum Road and are not appropriate.

Oliver – Appreciates the size and massing; it looks like the existing garage. Agree about reducing the French doors to 3 with windows.

Consensus – Agrees.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation French doors to be 3 doors with 2 windows. (Oliver)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate #

HDC2022-10-7336

4. 1010 Wins, LLC **10-7337** 10 Lincoln Avenue Hardscap., gate, pool & spa 30/184 Jardins Intl.

Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra

Alternates Thornewill, Patten

Recused None

Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.

Representing Elisabeth O'Rourke, Jardins International

Public None

Concerns (6:23) **O'Rourke** – Presented project. The house was approved with a deck we are changing to a stone patio that would be surrounded by a garden. What's shown above the pool is a future pavilion.

Backus – Main house is The Barnacle. The proposed stone patio is proposed 3' above grade with a retaining wall; that is not appropriate. The space in front of the garage should not be all blocks. The patio around the pool is large with hard edges and should be reduced in size. Need a photo of the stone. Historically all these lots address Capaum Road with no driveways off Lincoln Avenue. You received comments from abutters.

Read advisory group comments: The rear stone patio may be visible from Capaum Road. Elevating a stone patio 2½' above grade surrounded by a 3' stone retaining wall is not appropriate. A wood deck would be more traditional. Prefer shell parking area. Asked where the pool equipment will go and if there is a pergola.

Coombs – Looking at the whole project, it's all a stone patio behind the house; that isn't typical Nantucket or Lincoln Avenue and not appropriate.

Oliver – Not so concerned as it probably won't be visible.

Camp – Agrees with Ms. Coombs. The garage as proposed is too close to the main house so doesn't feel she can comment on the driveway.

Dutra – Doesn't think any of it will be visible. Okay with the pool. There is some grass; there's not much can be reduced around the pool without impacting egress. If you shift the pool a little more toward the rear, that would provide more space between the pool and house for green. The walk to the front could be steppingstones.

Welch – We are requesting cross sections and color-coded pallet for grade changes greater than 2'. Driveway and garage are on hold. The A/C and driveway will have to come back.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate #

5.	K225, LLC 09-7073	126R Main Street	Garage demo	42.3.2/98	Linda Williams
6.	K225, LLC 03-5944	126 Main Street	Main house renovation	42.3.2/98	Linda Williams
7.	NT Properties Owner	12 Beach Grass Lot 93	New dwelling	68-856	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (time)	Williams – Asked that these 3 items be continued to next week for Mr. Pohl.				
Motion	Hold for next week.				
Vote	Carried //N/A			Certificate #	
8.	Steven Cohen L TR 08-6975	8 Sachem Road	New shed	30/239	Workshop/APD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten				
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Sam Titone, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:42)	Titone – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Oliver – The shed is fine; her concern is its placement next to the house. Now it's even closer to the house so it blocks the front door and façade. She'd prefer it where it was in the previous submission. Camp – She has the same concern. Patten – Asked if they thought about moving the driveway. Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Oliver. Welch – Asked the height of the vegetation along the road (about 8'). He understands the concerns, but the sense of entry doesn't occur until you're into the property.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the shed in the original location. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6975
9.	Brew Bean 01-5615	2 Candle House Lane	New dwelling	55.4.1/1	Concept design
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Welch, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	TJ Waterson, Concept Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:49)	Waterson – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; applicant prefers white trim. Backus – Appreciates some of the changes; at the last meeting, Ms. Oliver mentioned concerns about the west sun porch, but it hasn't been changed. She mentioned the chimney shouldn't be on the exterior and the east middle mass is under fenestrated. The only change she saw was the grade information. It seems the advisory group agrees. Read advisory group comments: None of the requested changes suggested have been made; previous comments were: the east wall of the middle section is under-fenestrated and could use another window on both floors; there is too much shingle area in the dormer; the west dormer should not run into the main mass; it should drop back down on the left side; the sunroom would work better as a hipped roof glassed-in porch with corner-to-corner windows. We are essentially looking at the exact same application as last time. This should be denied or skipped over due to lack of response from the applicant. Coombs – She doesn't see any indication of changes; she'd like to see the previous and current submissions. Oliver – Appreciates the front door change and the overhang above the west doors. Has concerns with the dormer bleeding into the front mass and lack of fenestration in the east dormer. Welch – His concern is the weight of the dormer on the side. He otherwise agrees with Ms. Oliver. Camp – The front door seems to lack details.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with adding another window in the east dormer or reduce that dormer's size and north front door trim detail to be more traditional. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 3-1//Coombs opposed.			Certificate #	HDC2020-01-5615

10. Doug Munn	09-7007	6 'Sconset Avenue	New dwelling	49.3.2/12	Topham Design
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Patten, Dutra				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Joe Topham, Topham Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:59)	Topham – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Backus – Appreciate reduction in size and removal of the roof walk and lowering ridge height of the ridge. In a subdivision of mostly 1-story Capes, this is out of style and scale. Going in the right direction. Read advisory group comments: appreciate drop in ridge; concerned about the triple-thick frieze over the front porch. Break the roof to bring it down. West elevation dormer could be set back. Unclear where the shadow line comes from. Oliver – Appreciates the changes. The heavy trim over the porch should be shingled instead. The overhang connector roof is not typical out there. Patten – Agrees with Ms. Oliver. Camp – It looks good; but those houses on that street are very small. Prefers the “A” windows on the 1 st floor of the front elevation. Dutra – Thinks if the front porch front aligned with the section on the right might be more complementary.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with all 1st-floor windows (except the “D”) to be “A” and bring the front porch front consistent with the right side. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-09-7007
11. Morgan family	08-6901	24A New Lane	New dwelling	41/305	Val Oliver
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Thornewill, Patten				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Val Oliver, V. Oliver Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:10)	Oliver – Reviewed changes made pre previous concerns. Backus – Infill within the old historic district (OHD). Appreciate the changes. Most houses in the area are Capes. The French doors are too modern and should be 12-lights with kick panels. Read advisory group comments: Appreciate the changes. The 6-light French doors are not historic and should be changed to 12-light with kick panel. Thornewill – Agree about the French doors. On the left elevation, the roof pitch, dormer, and long gambrel rake crash together; suggested shifting the front dormer back and up. Patten – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill. Coombs – Asked about the left elevation. Welch – It would be appropriate for the porch roof to be 4/12 and drop the plate on the fascia. The idea is to eliminate the complicated intersection of 3 roofs.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 12-light kick panel or 15-light French doors and the front porch changing to 4/12 and dormer moved back if necessary. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6901
Welch – It’s inappropriate for the heat to be turned off in the middle of our meeting. Our teeth are chattering. Asked for a motion to keep the meeting going to ensure it’s on the record. Motion to press onward despite the heat turned being off while the meeting is in progress. (Oliver) Carried unanimously					

12.	40 Old South Rd, LLC 09-7046	40 Old South Rd Lot 41	Mixed Use retail/residential	68/10	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:20)	MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Oliver – Doesn't understand how lowering the pitch changed the eave line; the space between the eave and window headers seems the same. Every eave line is almost the same height. The dormers all now meet the roof peak and should be pulled off the ridge. Suggested eliminating the board between the 2nd & 3rd floor on the main mass. Coombs – West elevation dormers should be narrower to match what's below them. South elevation left window should be larger to fill the shingle space. Camp – She's concerned with the perception of its height right on Old South Road. Agrees about dormers coming off the ridge. The height needs to come down. She wants to see revisions to height and the dormers. Dutra – It's a handsome building. If it weren't so tall, the cupola would look good. The water table helps. Welch – Asked if there's a rebate on the 2nd floor (trim); asked about that trim being a little deeper. It's similar to the Meat Market; asked if they are similar in height. Asked if they could drop the gable plate to break up the eaves all being the same height. The elevation looks broader than the perception view.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation dormers pulled back; lower the height 6"-9"; create the overhang shadow line at the east and south gables; and south elevation left gable window to be an "A". (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-09-7046	
13.	Marty McGowan 04-6162	42 Easton Street	Hardscape gate & paving	42.4.1/21	Marty McGowan
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Marty McGowan				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:41)	McGowan – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Backus – Circa 1973 in OHD of Brant Point, contributing. This site has a lot of brick; this area should be more permeable to be resilient with flooding. Curb cut should stay as is and conform with zoning. Using Orange Street as a precedent is good. HDC has had similar requests where elegant ropes or chains were used. Read advisory group comments: Gating off the front of any property in the Brant Point area is not appropriate; there is no precedent for it in the area; Orange Street is a completely different neighborhood and not a good example. A gate would be a very bad precedent, leading to other properties requesting a similar treatment; Brant Point should remain an informal welcoming neighborhood, not an area where tall fences and gates create a feeling of exclusivity. If intruders are a concern, a simple rope across the driveway would be effective enough. Thornewill – There are no gated properties on this street; that's part of the beauty. The houses are visible, and gates would create an unwelcoming atmosphere. There are other ways to indicate this is private property. Camp – Agrees. This is making a barrier between the pedestrian and owner. Coombs – There's no reason for a private house to have such a wide apron; it should be reduced and use two posts with a chain or rope across the drive. That would be in keeping with the simplicity of the house and keep people out. Welch – He agrees with Ms. Coombs about thinning up the neck of the apron; use a rope with a sign. This is too formal and affects the transition from public to private space.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to the width of the entry with posts. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

14. Horchow & Routman 06-6534	33 Cliff Road	MH fenst, ramp, dormer	42.4.4/5	CWA/LINK
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:54)	Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Backus – At the last meeting there were concerns about its age, circa 1982 not contributing. Agrees the roof walk placement is better. Appreciated front portico changes. Her concern is the amount of fenestration on the north. Doesn't think there will be visibility from North Beach Street; it would be helpful to have photos from North Beach Street. Read advisory group comments: The proposed flat-roofed portico is much too formal for this area; a front porch should have a hip or shed roof with simpler porch posts. The proposed ramp next to the front porch will be very visible from the street; it can easily be moved to one of the side entrances. Where are the photos of the back of the house or the drawings showing existing conditions; it is impossible to review the changes without that information. Th 3 large, shed dormers on the back create a massive looking 4-story structure; this could be reduced by eliminating the center dormer and moving the other two dormers closer to the middle; the center dormer conflicts with the roof walk and should be eliminated. Coombs – There are too many windows on all elevations. The north facing the harbor is all double-ganged windows. The east elevation right wing is all windows. South elevation front portico is not right. Okay with the west elevation; suggested the 4-over-4 be changed to 6-over-6. Thornewill – The palladium window supports the fancy portico; but it's still a bit much and should be simplified. The center post of the roof walk shouldn't come down on the ridge; suggested it being a little wider to 3 sections. Agrees with HSAB about eliminating the middle rear dormer. Oliver – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill about the front and making the roof walk a 3-bay. For the rear elevation, likes the idea of eliminating the middle dormer. She hesitates to say someone can't have a ramp on the front; we can condition that it's removed once it's no longer needed and is natural to weather. Camp – Okay with the portico but with a shallow roof. The 3 dormers should be reduced to 2. Likes the roof walk being broken up into 3s.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
15. Horchow & Routman 06-6540	33 Cliff Road	GH addition & renovation	42.4.4/5	CWA/LINK
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:06)	Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Backus – Circa 1980s. Appreciate the changes. The massing is still up on the road. Read advisory group comments: This creates a taller awkward mass very close to the street. The two existing ancillary buildings complement each other well in terms of height and massing and allow the main house to be the primary focus; this proposal detracts from that setting and due to its proximity to the road, competes with the main house creating a confusing collection of buildings. Any addition to this building should be subordinate in scale and set back farther from the street; there is plenty of room on the site for an appropriately sited addition. Oliver – It's almost 26' and should be scaled down; the existing is 22'. Likes the ell shape. The composition now works because the existing smaller buildings create an entry; you have to go back to that. Thornewill – The program is a bit much for a cottage. Suggested reducing the length to prevent a long building right on the road. Coombs – It shouldn't compete with the height of the main house. She'd prefer it be simpler and smaller. The ell shape is good. Camp – Agree with what's been said. This competes with the main house and takes away from its charm.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

16. Horchow & Routman 06-6541	33 Cliff Road	Garage revision	42.4.4/5	CWA/LINK
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:14)	Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; the owner wants a 4-bay garage. Backus – Circa 1980s. This east elevation configuration will be visible heading out of Town. The juxtaposition of doghouse and shed dormers will be odd. The 2nd-floor program should be more subordinate over the 4-bay garage. Read advisory group comments: The dormers on the roadside should all be the same sized, single window dormers; varying the sizes of the dormers presents a more complicated eye-catching structure; this should remain a simple-looking building. The 4-bay garage wing is so long, it will be visible through the driveway opening and should be reduced by at least one or two bays. Oliver – You can accomplish what you want but the addition's 2nd-floor program needs to be rethought. What's on the street needs to compliment what's next door. Thornewill – The east elevation is actually 5 bays; it could be shortened a lot. The east elevation dormers should be small. Coombs – This is not simple and too big for this location. 5 garage bays is ridiculous. Camp – Seeing it from Cliff Road, the fenestration should match.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #

IX. NEW BUSINESS 11/08/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Kim Glowacki	17 Nancy Ann Lane	New garage	68/139	Structures Unlimited
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (time)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No Action at this time.			
Vote	N/A			Certificate #
2. Eddie Coffin 11-7376	21 Allen's Lane	New dwelling	67/17	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp,			
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Val Oliver, V. Oliver Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:23)	Oliver – Presented project. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as Submitted. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate # HDC2022-11-7376
3. Chardonnay Grp, LLC 11-7400	54 Washington Street	Picket fence NTW	42.2.2/9	Val Oliver
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	Dutra			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver, V. Oliver Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:24)	Oliver – Presented project. Backus – The existing picket is natural to weather; her only concern is the placement within the edge of the coastal bank and coastal dune requiring ConCom review. Thornewill – Likes it better not being Type II. Patten – Agree Camp – Would accept a picket or split rail fence. Coombs – You find more split rails than pickets. Welch – He would go with picket given they are trying to differentiate between their property and the Land Bank.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as depicted in the photo natural to weather. (Thornewill)			
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate # HDC2022-11-7400

Rest held

4.	Edward Gilberth	51 Walsh Street	New roofwalk & stairs	29/61	Linda Williams
5.	SAWB Corp	24 Cliff Road	Move on-site building	42.4.4/49	SCI
6.	SAWB Corp	24 Cliff Road	Addition	42.4.4/49	SCI
7.	Betsy Bolst	8 Grand Avenue	Window replacement	73.3.1/118	NAG
8.	Gregory McDonald	35 Pine Street	Addition	55.4.1/67	EMDA
9.	John Megrue	36 Easton Street	New garage	42.1.4/19	EMDA
10.	Matthew & Caroline Manera	15 Morey Lane	New garage	73.3.1/38	EMDA
11.	EBWC, LLC	4 Lincoln Avenue	Hardscape	30/151	Julie Jordin
12.	Steven Cohen Trustee	46 Union Street	Apron, curbing, stepstones	42.2.3/28	Ben Champoux
13.	Susan Hostetler	42 Center Street	Roof replacement	42.3.1/63.3	Susan Hostetler
14.	West Holdings, LLC	9 Miller Lane	New dwelling	68/123	Emeritus LTD
15.	37 Starbuck, LLC	37 Starbuck Road	Demo/ Move off dwelling	60/37	NAG
16.	Pat McCarthy	1 Broadway	Window restore/roof replc	73.24/37	Nantucket Carpentry
17.	Jeff Marsh	10 Lowell Place	Remove 82sf from garage	41/166	Val Oliver
18.	Jeff Marsh	10 Lowell Place	Addition 90sf	41/166	Val Oliver
19.	Rhett Dupont	18 Nobadeer Avenue	New Dwelling	80/22	MCA+
20.	Rhett Dupont	18 Nobadeer Avenue	New garage	80/22	MCA+
21.	Rhett Dupont	18 Nobadeer Avenue	New shed	80/22	MCA+
22.	Rhett Dupont	18 Nobadeer Avenue	Pool	80/22	MCA+
23.	Rhett Dupont	18 Nobadeer Avenue	Pergola	80/22	MCA+
24.	Rhett Dupont	18 Nobadeer Avenue	Pool house	80/22	MCA+

X. OLD BUSINESS 11/15/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Maxwell House, LLC 02-6805	15 Cliff Road	Addition/renovation	42.4.4./56	MCA+
2. Petrillo & Ripley 09-7129	92 Washington St	Hardscape	42.4.1/2	Studio 2112
3. Berry Pleasant, LLC 09-7153	15 Pleasant st	Main house alterations	42.3.3/123	Patrick Ahern
4. Jason Mendelson 05-6328	7A Sherburne TP	New Dwelling	30/112	Studio Ppark
5. NIR 08-6885	7-8 Old South Wharf	Fenestration changes	42.4.2/3.4	Permit Plus
6. Jeannette & Bob, LLC 11-5037	43 Kendrick Ave	New guest house	76.4.3/31	CWA/LINK
7. Not So Easy, LLC 06-5679	26 Easy St	New mixed-use structure	42.4.2/23	Emeritus LTD
8. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6934	2 Mariner Way	New dwelling	55.1.4/72.4	Linda Williams
9. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6937	2 Mariner Way	New dwelling	55.1.4/72.4	Linda Williams
10. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6939	4 Mariner Way	New dwelling	55.1.4/72	Linda Williams
11. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6941	4 Mariner Way	New garage/apt	55.1.4/72	Linda Williams
12. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6943	4 Mariner Way	Hardscape	55.1.4/72	Linda Williams
13. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6930	6 Mariner Way	New dwelling	55.1.4/72.2	Linda Williams
14. Doherty Ack, LLC 08-6931	6 Mariner Way	Hardscape	55.1.4/72.2	Linda Williams

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	November 29, 2022
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)
Vote	Carried unanimously
Review Minutes	December 1, 2022
Next Meeting	Tuesday, December 20th @ 4:00 pm Hybrid – Zoom & 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room
Future action items	• Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of move/demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to adjourn at 8:33 pm. (Oliver)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Nantucket Old Historic District

Sconset Old Historic District

Madaket Village District