



Historic District Commission

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members: Micky Rowland, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Finger, Angus Macleod, Brook Meerbergen

Alternate Member: None

Planning and Land Use Services
2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

MINUTES

Monday June 21, 2021

I. Procedural Business

Call to order at 3:34 pm

Attending members: Angus Macleod, Lucy Dillon, Brook Meerbergen, Mickey Rowland (by phone)

Absent members: Jascin Leonardo-Finger

Late arrivals:

Early Departures:

Motion to Adopt Agenda as written made by Angus Macleod

Seconded by Lucy Dillon

Vote: carried unanimously

Approval of Minutes: N/A

Motion made by:

Vote:

II. Public Comment

None

III. Old Business – See attached Comments

Property owner	Street address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Thomas Rhodes II Trust 06-3932	125 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3/49	Gryphon Architects
2. Jennifer Khoury 05-3768	27 W Chester Street	Spa	42.3.4/2	David Troast
3. Zero India Street 03-3268	1 Cambridge Street	Addition	42.3.1/150.2	Emeritus

Motion made to approve comments for Old Business 1-3 by Lucy Dillon
Seconded by Angus Macleod

IV. Other Business

None.

V. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn meeting made at 4:25pm

Submitted by Kadeem McCarthy

Historic Structures Advisory Board Meeting Memorandum

Date: 6.21.21

Address: 125 MAIN

3:35

HDC/HSAB

Scope of Work: Addition to shed

Historic information/known history

() Non-Contributing () Contributing () Individually significant

There was a previous structure moved in 1996

STAFF COMMENTS

Name: _____

() Incomplete application () Historical information needed () No Concerns () Recommend View

() Does not meet guidelines

Visibility: Yes or No

() Not appropriate (As noted below)

MCR - Needs front door; In spite applicant narrative does not relate to main street onto existing "auxiliary" structure

Angus - Agrees w/ MCR but maybe stretch across main.

BPM - Relate it to 1/4 mile w/ covered entry; step mass into yard from 1/4 mile.

Ethan Representing

HSAB COMMENTS

() Incomplete application () Historical information needed () No Concerns () Recommend View

() Does not meet guidelines

Visibility: Yes or No

() Not appropriate (As noted below)

MCR - Prefers it addresses main

Michell will be finding in comments

() Angus MacLeod () Lucy Dillon () Jascin Leonardo Finger () Milton Rowland () Brook Meerbergen

Alternate: None

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

Lucy Dillon
BPM

HSAB Recommendations for HDC

June 21, 2021

125 Main – new dwelling

- Being so close to the street, this building should address Main Street with a front door and hedge opening – like every other house on Main St
- And look more like a small dwelling than a carriage house
- West – round window and all glass behind sliding doors – not appropriate

4:31

Historic Structures Advisory Board Meeting Memorandum

HDC/HSAB

Date: 6-24-21

Address 27 W Chester

Scope of Work: Pergola & Spa

Historic information/known history

() Non-Contributing () Contributing () Individually significant

STAFF COMMENTS

Name: _____

- () Incomplete application () Historical information needed () No Concerns () Recommend View
() Does not meet guidelines Visibility: Yes or No
() Not appropriate (As noted below)

Michay will be
sending in comments

HSAB COMMENTS

- () Incomplete application () Historical information needed () No Concerns () Recommend View
() Does not meet guidelines Visibility: Yes or No
() Not appropriate (As noted below)

MCR - No prob. pergola between wings

BPM - Spa will be somewhat visible; how about
pergola over spa; Visible from sunset hill?

Lucy - agree/aw, w.b.s.

X Angus MacLeod X Lucy Dillon () Jascin Leonardo Finger X Milton Rowland X Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

Angus MacLeod
Lucy Dillon
Brook Meerbergen

by phone

see
notes

HSAB Recommendations for HDC
June 21, 2021

27 W Chester – spa

- The spa appears to be not visible in the photos.

4:00
B.C.P.

Historic Structures Advisory Board Meeting Memorandum

HDC/HSAB

Date 6-21-21

Address 1 CAMBRIDGE ST

Scope of Work: SECOND STORY ADDITION

Historic information/known history

() Non-Contributing () Contributing () Individually significant

STAFF COMMENTS

Name: _____

- () Incomplete application () Historical information needed () No Concerns () Recommend View
() Does not meet guidelines Visibility: Yes or No
() Not appropriate (As noted below)

HSAB COMMENTS

- () Incomplete application () Historical information needed () No Concerns () Recommend View
() Does not meet guidelines Visibility: Yes or No
() Not appropriate (As noted below)

MCR - Don't respect neighborhood; Not enough has changed; ~~no~~ 3 story
competes w/ Library/Pac. Club/Dreamland. Lower pitch;
Lower ceiling; clapboard to shingle

Agnes - likes detail but scale of detail makes building feel
larger; downscale

Lucy - Agnes w/ MCR & HDC comments/

BPM - Gaslight and Opera House should be the guiding
structures; Parchment style building

X () Angus MacLeod X Lucy Dillon () Jascin Leonardo Finger X by phone Milton Rowland X Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

Brook Meerbergen Lucy Dillon Angus MacLeod

HSAB Recommendations for HDC

June 21, 2021

1 Cambridge St – addition

- Not enough has changed. The building is still too tall and formal, and the HDC notes reflect that they agree with HSAB in this regard.
- This neighborhood consists of simple 1 ½ to 2 story buildings of moderate height. The exceptions are the Atheneum, the Dreamland, and the Pacific Club which should remain as the dominant structures. Adding another three story building next to the new one on South Water Street will compete with these iconic structures and diminish their importance. We should not allow three story buildings to slowly infiltrate downtown Nantucket. They should remain the exception and not become the rule. Several new proposals for downtown have all included a third floor.
- Aside from Main Street, the modest scale of our commercial downtown is one of its defining characteristics. Most of the buildings in the core area were once residences that were converted to commercial use. That scale is what gives those streets their character and charm. Allowing three story structures will permanently alter that feeling.
- This building should mimic that modest scale and not overshadow the others that remain as they have been for well over a hundred and fifty years.

Recommendations:

- Lower the height by:
 - Shallow the roof pitch to 8/12 or so
 - Lower first floor ceiling height (currently 9 ft)
 - Lower the eave to the second floor window casings
- Change from clapboard to shingle. The commercial fenestration on the north is formal enough. Changing to shingles above and everywhere else will soften the feel.
- Simplify the detailing so that it feels more like a converted dwelling.