



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, OliverVallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, December 30, 2021

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez; PLUS Administrative Assistant
Attending Members: Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra
Absent Members: McLaughlin, Welch, Thornewill
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as amended. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. NEW BUSINESS 12/07/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Tomas Forman 12-5323	6 Coffin Street Sias	Spa & hardscape	73.1.4/19	Waterscape
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Dutra				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Jesse Dutra, Waterscape				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:07)	Dutra – Presented project; 7x12; not visible; willing to soften the edges and add screening. Backus – SAB didn't review this. It is within the old historic district (OHD) of 'Sconset; main dwelling is 2002 infill; not visible; bluestone patio has sharp edges; left property line should have additional screening. Oliver – Aside from screening in perpetuity, she has no concerns. Coombs – The patio corners should be relaxed. Agrees with additional screening along the west property line. Camp – Agrees the patio should look more natural and screening the left property line. 12' is too wide; feels 8X8 is a good size for a spa. Pohl – Regarding the size, it isn't visible and isn't really too large. Agrees with rounding the patio corners and supplementing vegetation along the west line.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the patio corners softened and screening in perpetuity. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-1//Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye; Camp-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5323
2.	Rose R.T. 11-5107 (OB)	28 India Street	Spa	42.3.4/8	Jardins Int.
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Elisabeth O'Rourke, Jardins International				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:18)	Pohl – Only 2 of the people sitting are present; there is no quorum.				
Motion	No action due to lack of quorum.				
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #	

3.	Jim & Karen Poole 11-5232	43 Main Street Sias	Fence	73/18	Brent Young
Voting	Pohl, Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs,				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:20)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	No Action at this time.				
Roll-call Vote	N/A				
				Certificate #	

4.	Anthony Noto 11-5270	40 Lincoln Avenue	Additional & renovation	30/184	Emeritus
5.	450 Green Park, LLC 11-5272	2 Stone Alley	Addition, alter, & foundation	42.3.1/102	Emeritus

III. OLD BUSINESS 12/14/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Rich Gillis	38 Prospect St. Lot 29	Hardscape	79/214	Linda Williams
2.	Rich Petersen	30 Main Street Sias	Relocate garage & addition	73.3.1/46	JMorash/Concept dsn
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	TJ Waterson, Concept Design				
Public	Rich Petersen, owner				
Public	Chris Staudt, 6 Moray Lane				
Concerns (1:22)	Waterson – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Backus – Main dwelling is circa 1916 colonial revival; this is contributing circa 1923. SAB comments: revisions don't address concerns; 2nd-floor deck is larger and ridge higher; SAB and HDC indicated design is not appropriate; the addition should be low to give credibility to the existing garage; 2nd-floor deck is inappropriate for size; west elevation has more glass. She concurs with their comments. Staudt – Appreciates changes to the south elevation. He shares SAB & HDC concerns: 2nd-floor deck, extent of fenestration, height. Regarding screening, a view would help understand that. Petersen – Will be putting the pool equipment under ground; there will be no new lighting; the 2nd-floor is for a gym to be used only during the day. He's committed to keeping the corner of Moray Lane open. Coombs – At 23'1", it is under 24'. Her main concern is 4 French doors on the front; would like those reduced to 2 doors with windows and the 2nd-floor deck should be reduced to the size of the original submission. The west elevation should be as simple as possible. Camp – Confirmed the history of this structure. Agrees with Ms. Coombs; the west elevation deck should be simpler. Okay with the height. Dutra – Agrees with Ms. Camp and Ms. Coombs. Pohl – Agrees with reducing the west elevation deck. If you had a more appreciable step down to the deck, the columns would be less tall.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				
				Certificate #	

3.	23 Broad St, LLC	23 Broad Street	Fenestration & addition	42.4.2/77	Emeritus
----	------------------	-----------------	-------------------------	-----------	----------

IV. NEW BUSINESS 12/21/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Ann Dougherty 11-5275	2 Lincoln Street Sias	Stonewall	73.4.2/8.3	Thornewill Designs
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Thornewill				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:41)	Thornewill – Presented project. Backus – SAB comments: no concerns. Because this is replacing an existing timber wall and replicating an existing wall, there are no concerns; the wall should taper down as the grade goes down. It would be nice to know the age of this property. Pohl – It looks like the wall would be about 3’ tall. Suggested not bringing the wall all the way back and allow the grade to taper. We could put a maximum height for the wall at 27” with the grade tapering above it. Coombs – Agrees with capping the height at 27”. Oliver – The stone will match what’s already on site. Camp – Confused with what we’re looking at. We need to be specific about the type of shrub and what it’s hiding and capping the height of the wall. Dutra – He has no concerns. The grade isn’t dropping as much as it drops in the front. Agrees with the height capped and using native stone and native screening.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the stone to match what’s already on site and the maximum height of the wall at 27” and to taper down going toward New Street. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Oliver, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; Camp-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5275
2.	John & Joanne Archer 12-5283	14 Dukes Road	New shed	41/60	Charles Lenhart
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Charles Lenhart				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:56)	Lenhart – Presented project. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5283
3.	Richard Rosenbaum 12-5293	16 Cliff Road	New shed	42.4.4/69	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:58)	Thornewill – Presented project. Backus – HSAB comments: small and simple; shouldn’t be so close to the street; move away from the street. Oliver – There are no little structures this close to the road in this area; either bring the privet down or tuck it into the corner against the hedge. Coombs – This is a historic structure in the OHD; it should be moved away from the road; if something happens to the hedge, it will be visible. We haven’t addressed their proposed gate. Camp – In that location, it takes away from the historic structure; it should be in the back or tucked around the corner. Dutra – Ms. Camp’s point is valid but he’d like to see a proposal with Ms. Oliver’s suggestion. This is a very tiny shed.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

4.	Richard Rosenbaum 12-5292	16 Cliff Road	Fence and gate	42.4.4/69	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:06)	Thornewill – Presented project; suggested holding to track the shed. Backus – Dwelling circa 1757. HSAB comments: The proposed recessed gate with flanking fences is very unusual and inappropriate; it essentially provides a parking space right off the sidewalk; the original gate is more in keeping and should remain. Camp – Wants more photos of the house.				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track the shed. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Dutra, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
5.	Julie Layden 12-5301	22 Atlantic Avenue	Fence	55/26	Julie Layden
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:10)	McCarthy – This is simple. Backus – This is associated with a 1920 bungalow; she sees no concerns with the fence; the design of the gate is not consistent with the fence. Oliver – It's a continuance of an existing picket fence with a get between the hedges. With the exception of the gate as proposed, this is approvable.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the gate to match the picket fence. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5301
6.	Andrew Sievers 12-5305	12 Codfish Park	New shed	73.2.4/9	Salt Spray Sheds
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:14)	Backus – SAB comments: vertically too stretched. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
7.	Wayne & Janet Berman 12-5310	98 Tom Nevers Road	Addition & fenestration	91/40	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Bill McGuire, Nantucket Architectural Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:15)	McGuire – He sent in the requested drawings. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for January 4. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
8.	Edith Anderson 12-5312	15 Hawthorne Lane	Replace windows	56/265	Edith Anderson
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:17)	Oliver – You can't see it; it's behind the mudroom bumpout.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5312

9.	3 Beaver St, LLC 12-5316	3A Beaver Street	Dormers, raise foundation	55.1.4/97	Polly Walldorf
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:18)	McCarthy – They are asking to hold this to run with 3 Beaver.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for January 4th. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
10.	Colby Crenshaw 12-5325	24 Almanack Pond Road	Addition	25/37	Thornewill Designs
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public					
Concerns (2:19)	Thornewill – Presented project.				
	Oliver – She wants to view this; she didn't see the link for it.				
	Pohl – It's very atypical for Nantucket but extraordinarily well done.				
Motion	Motion to View. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
11.	Peter Kurzina 12-5336	26 New Street Sias	Rev. to door & windows	73.4.2/24	Thornewill Designs
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:22)	Thornewill – Presented project.				
	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Dutra, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5336
12.	NIR/Andy Maltby 12-5394	Straight Wharf	Transformer surround	42.3.2/15	Robert Newman
13.	6 Village Way RT. 12-5352	6 Village Way	New dwelling	14/42	WAPD
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:25)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
14.	William Maclean 12-5348	2 Spring Street	New dormer	55.1.4/16	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:07)	McCarthy – This is in error, it was already approved.				
Motion	No action necessary				
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #	
15.	Jim & Cindy Henrich 12-5354	37 Fair Street	Roof & fenest. changes	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
16.	John Manera	4 Larrabee Lane	New dwelling	55/102.7	Linda Williams
17.	Koyote Realty Trust	4 Hickory Meadow Lane	Roof walk	41/900	Linda Williams
18.	8 North Star NT	8 North Star	Roof walk	30/212	Linda Williams

19. Sam Shamoun	9 Field Avenue	New dwelling	80/162.1	Linda Williams
20. 6 N Beach, LLC	6 North Beach Street	Revised window color	42.4.1/65	Linda Williams
21. 8 N Beach, LLC	8 North Beach Street	Revised window color	42.4.1/65.1	Linda Williams

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	December 21, 2021
Other Business	• Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, January 4, 2022 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:26 pm. (Oliver)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board