



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, December 9, 2021

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

Called to order at 1:02 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez; PLUS Administrative Assistant; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Oliver, Dutra,
Late Arrivals: McLaughlin, 1:08 pm (then immediately disappeared) back at 1:31 pm
Early Departures:

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Welch)**

Roll-call vote Carried 4-0//Welch, Coombs, Thornewill, and Camp-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. NEW BUSINESS 11/23/2021

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Nantucket Land Bank 11-5161	113 Madaket Road	Demo shed	40/25.4	Greg Keltz
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historical documents.			
Representing	Greg Keltz			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:09)	Keltz – Presented project; no one is interested in taking it; about 20 years old. No concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5161

2. Cannonbury Holdings 11-5164		20 Cannonbury Lane	New main house	74/14	WAPD
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Irina Casale, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:12)	Casale – Presented project; height is 27’11”; chimney to be whitewashed. Backus – Read SAB comments 12/6: 31’ chimney is overly tall and color of brick not specified. She concurs with SAB that the chimney is too tall. Coombs – Feels this structure too tall for the area; it should be reduced. The chimney needs to be redesigned to be more typical and shouldn’t be painted. Front elevation, the walk out fence should be a picket to match the white trim; crossbucks and picket fence don’t go together. The opening in the top of the chimney is not typical. Welch – Agrees the chimney should be shorter with the corbelling no more than 3’ above the ridge. Agrees the vertical balusters and crossbucks compete. Regarding the ridge height, it will not present as a 2-story 5 bay; there are dormers on 1.5-story structures. Suggested the whitewashing of the chimney come in as a modification accompanied by context photos. Thornewill – Agrees with what’s been said. South elevation, thinks the full-sized doors/windows are too contemporary and wants to ensure they won’t be visible. Camp – Agrees about reducing the chimney. There is precedent for large windows in ‘Sconset. Agrees blusters or crossbucks. We don’t normally approve walkdowns on the front, so it will have to be screened.				
Motion	Discussion about the ventilation openings at the top of the chimney. Motion to Approve through staff with chimney to be 3’ from ridge to bottom of corbelling with natural brick and walkdown blusters not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch) Motion failed. Motion to Approve through staff with chimney to be 3’ from ridge to the bottom of the corbelling with natural brick and no ventilation opening and the walkdown blusters not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5164	
3. Cannonbury Holdings 11-5165		20 Cannonbury Lane	New guest house	74/14	WAPD
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Irina Casale, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:29)	Casale – Presented project. Backus – Read SAB comments 12/6: building is higher than it needs to be, could bring down a foot or more; side access door is perhaps too “dressy.”; any, if not most of new construction applications in recent years have shown parking and garages in front of the main houses; this trend is an unfortunate one, in that cars shouldn’t become the primary visual aspect between the street and an otherwise nicely-designed home McLaughlin – He drove by today and has no concerns. Thornewill – Agrees it would be better if this weren’t in the front but the structure itself is cute. Welch – It could come down about 6” without impact. He’d prefer 1 car in the garage with fewer vehicles parked outside. A garage in the front isn’t uncommon as a separate building; it would be different if it were attached. Coombs – She too would like to see the height reduced. Instead of all parking at the front of the house, would prefer it be moved to the side. Camp – Agrees with what’s been said. Everyone is concerned about the amount of parking in front.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to height and parking. (Coombs) Motion failed Motion to Approve through staff with the height reduced 6” to 12”. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill, and Camp-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5165	
4. Okay Okay Café, LLC 11-5132		15 Washington Street	Door	42.3.1/99	BPC
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:37)	Martinez – She hasn’t received any submission for this and no one is here. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Coombs, and Camp-aye		Certificate #		

5. Rich Gillis	38 Prospect Street Lot 29	Hardscape: retaining wall	Linda Williams
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill		
Alternates	None		
Recused	None		
Documentation	None		
Representing	None		
Public	None		
Concerns (8:32)	Not opened at this time.		
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)		
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye	Certificate #	
6. Jeremy & Sarah Trottier 11-5166	4 Winsor Road	New dwelling	49/193 Emeritus
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill		
Alternates	None		
Recused	None		
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.		
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development		
Public	None		
Concerns (1:39)	Martinez – SAB asked this be held for their review. MacEachern – Presented project; structure set outside the 100' buffer to wetlands on a flat area of the lot; visibility is minimal; height is 27'11". Thornewill – This is appropriate; except for the front, right-most piece; the eave line and ridge should drop to be more additive. Welch – Agrees. If the south elevation were visible, the porch portion should be stepped down a bit. Asked if any grade change is proposed (no). On the cover sheet, west and east are reversed. East elevation, the left most eave should be dropped as well as the right most piece McLaughlin – No comments. Coombs – No concerns. Camp – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill about the front right mass and about dropping the rear porch section beyond the chimney.		
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with right-most front mass dropped 1' at the ridge and eave and with the option to do the same on the left most mass. (Welch)		
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, and Camp-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5166
7. Tack3, LLC 11-5100	26 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.3.2/23 CWA
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill		
Alternates	None		
Recused	None		
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.		
Representing	Amy Ledoux, Chip Webster Associates.		
Public	None		
Concerns (1:51)	Ledoux – Presented project. Backus – Read HSAB comments 12/6: sections of this building are likely over 100 years old; the history of this building and original date of construction should be determined before approving a demolition; Sanborn maps should be provided. Coombs – We went through a tear-down application for this structure before; they would have to work around a Town tree. Wants to view this. In the old historic district (OHD), we should see what's going in its place before approving this. Welch – He'd be willing to do a view. Since the replacement is up for Tuesday, that could work out. Suggested moving this to be heard with the new house. He'd like to get some historical information on this. In 2017, it was approved for removal; it probably fell under the COVID freeze so is still valid; he's leery of reversing a prior commission's decision without new information. McLaughlin – He wants to view this. Thornewill – She finds it interesting that the front and back seem like different buildings. It would be interesting to see the evolution of the structure. Would also like to view.		
Motion	Motion to View and held for more historic information to include minutes from the prior hearings. (Coombs)		
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Welch, Coombs, and Camp-aye	Certificate #	

8. Rose Realty Trust 11-5107	28 India Street	Inground spa	42.3.4/108	Jardins Intl.
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Elisabeth O'Rourke, Jardins International			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:00)	O'Rourke – Presented project; there is existing board fencing; equipment is to be under the skirted porch; 10'x8' and 3.5' deep with benches; 8' privet hedge is existing; no proposed lighting except inside the spa. Backus – Although this is a spa, historic information should be submitted for any historic structures in the OHD; circa 1834-1836. Read HSAB comments 12/6: no concerns about the gate but would like to know the proposed color – hopefully white or natural; the spa is a modern element within the OHD and will have a detrimental effect on the historic character and quality of life of the neighborhood; the voters of Nantucket and the neighbors have made it clear that pools are not wanted in the OHD; a spa of this size is simply a small pool; where is the pool equipment going and what is the proposed outdoor lighting; are other hardscaping changes going to be proposed later; the spa might be visible from Rose Lane so needs screening from that side Coombs – Spas in the OHD are not appropriate, especially for an 1834 structure; neither is an 8' privet on India Street. Welch – Generally spas are typically inappropriate in the OHD based upon character and setting. For him to make an informed decision he needs to know some things: will it be raised or at grade (at grade) and the lighting; these tend to be lit as it gets dark. We have approved these in the OHD, so we need to be careful. He would like to view for the setting. Thornewill – Agrees with what's been said. Looking at the site plan, it doesn't relate to anything and is floating in the yard. She'd like to see an aerial photo of the immediate area to see if there are any spas on India Street; Orange and Main Streets are not this neighborhood. McLaughlin – He walked down Rose Lane; you can look in the backyard and it will be visible from Rose Lane. Camp – At 8X10, it's more than 1000 gallons and considered a swimming pool. Agrees with everything that's been said. The visibility has been brought into question and it looks "unattached."			
Motion	Motion to View with corner stakes. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, McLaughlin, Thornewill, Coombs, and Camp-aye			Certificate #

9. LBC Sconset, LLC 11-5040	9 Hawk Circle	Rev. 08-4387: doors & fenst	74/37.1	Adam Davis
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Adam Davis, J Graham Goldsmit Architects			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:18)	Davis – Presented project. Backus – SAB didn't review. She believes the changes are an improvement. Welch – The windows are smaller than the 2nd-floor windows, but he's okay with that. Coombs – No concerns. McLaughlin – No comments. Thornewill – Totally appropriate.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Camp-aye			Certificate # HDC2021-11-5040

Rest held for Tuesday Dec. 14.

10. Jay Hammer 11-5142	10 King Street	New shed	43.4.2/12	B & C
11. 33 North Mill St, LLC 11-5137	7 North Mill Street	New shed	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz
12. 33 North Mill St, LLC 11-5126	7 North Mill Street	Hardscaping	55.4.4/77	Atlantic Landscaping
13. 36 Easton St, LLC 11-5138	36 Easton Street	Door & window change	42.1.4/19	McMorrow Designs
14. Kristy Kay Snyder 11-5140	7 Comeau Lane	Addition & alterations	49.3.2/13	Val Oliver
15. Reunion, LLC 11-5184	6 Union Street	Roof replacement	42.3.1/185	Sanne Payne
16. 90 N Liberty Prsv. Tst 11-5178	90 North Liberty Street	Roof & windows replace	41/22	Botticelli + Pohl
17. Prickly Pear Tr. 11-5155	17 Broadway (Sias)	Storage containers	73.1.3/112	Val Oliver
18. Richard Oneslager	8 Cliff Road	Windows like-kind	42.4.4/23	Rich Johnston
19. Julianne Mara	1 Broadway (Sias)	Outdoor shower	73.2.4/37	LINK

VIII. OLD BUSINESS (11/23/2021)

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Hoehn-Saric	34 Easton Street	New dwelling	41.14/18	CWA
2. Tack3, LLC	26 Washington Street	Rev. 10-4863:	42.3.2/23`	CWA
3. Tiffany Lawrence	5 Todd Circle	Pool & hardscape	66/296	Atlantic Landscaping
4. Paul Benk	8 North Gully	Rev. 09-4592: add dormer	71.1.3/48	Emeritus

IV. NEW BUSINESS 12/07/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Posie Constable	3 Barrett Farm Road	Combine exst sheds to one	40/80.1	Thornewill Design
2.	Kim Wentworth	14 Lincoln Avenue	Rev COA	30/182	Mark Cutone
3.	Kim Wentworth	14 Lincoln Avenue	Rev COA pool	30/182	Mark Cutone
4.	Ann Rosenblatt	2 Shawkemo Hills Lane	New doors	27/38	Mark Cutone
5.	Benjamin McGrath	12 Cliff Road	Roof repair	42.4.4/62	Vasil Marinov
6.	Le Select Prop, LLC	1 Ash Street	Fenestration changes	42.4.2/85	Normand Residential
7.	Moors End Farm	42 Polpis Road	Rooftop solar barn 1	54/266	Cotuit Solar
8.	Moors End Farm	42 Polpis Road	Rooftop solar barn 2	54/266	Cotuit Solar
9.	Francis McGillin	7 Atlantic Avenue	Shed	55/15	Structures Unlimited
10.	20 Cannonbury Lane, LLC	20 Cannonbury Lane	Pool and hardscape	74/14	Ahern
11.	Rich Meisenberg	86 Polpis Road	Solar ground array	44/25.4	ACK Smart
12.	ReMain Nantucket	22 Federal Street	Solar pergola	42.4.2/31	ACK Smart
13.	Jared Mitchell	50 Hummock Pond Road	Rev COA – add spa to pool	56/286	KM Designs
14.	Ray Owen	80 Vestal Street	Rooftop solar	56/273	Cotuit Solar
15.	Mark Alexandrisdis	36 Madequecham Vly Rd	Move/demo shed	89/25	Thornewill Design
16.	Mark Alexandrisdis	36 Madequecham Vly Rd	New shed	89/25	Thornewill Design
17.	Bluefin Partners	27 Ellen's Way	New dwelling	81/180	Lori Geddes
18.	Doug Carlson	2 Blueberry Lane	Pool	80/178	Val Oliver Design
19.	Greg Hughes	6 Walbang Avenue	Alteration	82/144	Billy Saad
20.	33 North Mill, LLC	7 North Mill Street	Rev. wdw wells/fenestration	55.4.4/77	Sophie Metz Design
21.	Yvonne Archer	39 Monomoy Road	Demo/move garage	54/79	Linda Williams
22.	Richmond Great Point	4 Honeysuckle Drive	New dwelling	68/887	KOH
23.	Richmond Great Point	26 Honeysuckle Drive	New dwelling	68/386	KOH
24.	Richmond Great Point	57 Old South Road	Flag sign	68/156	TJ Fossa
25.	Barry Ang	11 Jonathan Way	Pool/spa/pergola/wall	75/42	Ben Champoux
26.	Susan Doughan	63 Orange Street	Rev 10-4878 roof walk skirt	55.4.1/16	Gryphon Architects
27.	Parent	11 Skyline Drive	Rev. doors and windows	79/136.1	Thornewill
28.	Bonita Bar, LLC	1 Chins Way	Partial Demo	55/165	J. Newman
29.	Bonita Bar, LLC	1 Chins Way	Addition	55/163	J. Newman
30.	7 Plum St, LLC	7 Plum Street	Shed	80/26	Structures Unlimited
31.	32 Hulbert Trust	32 Hulbert Avenue	New dwelling	29/72	Botticelli + Pohl
32.	Oliver Carr III	84 Cliff Road	Demolition	30/74.1	Robert Newman
33.	Sue Ellen & Mark Alderman	17 High Brush Path	Move shed on site	56/375	Robert Newman
34.	Kelley Carrero	8 Walnut Lane	Driveway revisions	42.3.4/69	Robert Newman
35.	Cynthia McClinlock	32 Brewster Road	Color change	54/84	Robert Newman
36.	Surfside Assets, LLC	16 Gladlands Avenue	Pool	80/220	Robert Newman
37.	Surfside Assets, LLC	16 Gladlands Avenue	Partial demo	80/220	Robert Newman
38.	Nantucket Land Bank	101/103 Hummock Pd Rd	Gate	56/67.1&307	Robert Newman
39.	Nantucket Land Bank	101/103 Hummock Pd Rd	Sign	56/67.1&307	Robert Newman
40.	Twig Perkins INC	3 Valley View Drive	Rooftop solar	67/228/.2	Karen Alence
41.	Maureen Blitman Trust	54 Squam Road	Rooftop solar	13/32	Karen Alence
42.	7 Masaquet, LLC	7 Masaquet Avenue	New garage	80/144	Emeritus
43.	7 Masaquet, LLC	7 Masaquet Avenue	New gazebo	80/144	Emeritus
44.	Michelle Whelan	13B Mary Ann Drive	Addition/ Deck	58/222	Self
45.	Jim & Karen Poole	43 Main Street Sias	Fence	73/18	Brent Young
46.	Marcia Moran	15 McKinley Avenue	Shed	73.3.1/28	Structures Unlimited
47.	Steven Arst	5 Flintlock Road	Solar ground array	75/94	ACK Smart
48.	Shenandoah Trust	40 Easton Street	New foundation/ renov	42.1.4/20	Botticelli + Pohl
49.	Harborside Partners	5 York Street	Fenestration rev & pergola	55.1.4/162	Gryphon Architects
50.	Nt Investment Holding, LLC	22 Pocomo Road	Pool & hardscape	14/73.1	Emeritus
51.	Michael & Kelly Kohos	29 Nonantum Avenue	Move structures onsite	87/51	Ben Normand
52.	Michael & Kelly Kohos	29 Nonantum Avenue	New dwelling	87/51	Ben Normand
53.	Ryan Craig	28a Pleasant Street	Hardscape & fence	55.4.1/65	KM Designs
54.	Blake Drexler	95 Washington Street	New garage	55.1.4/71	Val Oliver Design
55.	Jason Davidson	73 Burnell Street	Move off -dwelling	49.3.2/1.2	Linda Williams
56.	Jason Davidson	73 Burnell Street	Move off- barn	49.3.2/1.2	Linda Williams
57.	Jason Davidson	73 Burnell Street	Move off-she	49.3.2/1.2	Linda Williams
58.	Jason Davidson	21 Clifton Street	Move on- dwelling	49.3.2/34	Linda Williams
59.	Jason Davidson	21 Clifton Street	Move on-barn	49.3.2/34	Linda Williams
60.	Jason Davidson	21 Clifton Street	Move on-shed	49.3.2/34	Linda Williams

61. NHA	4 Whaler Lane	Alter deck	42.4.4/60.1	Linda Williams
62. Ted Silva	14 Harborview Drive	Rev. chng fenst & chimney	42.4.1/26	Linda Williams
63. Vivian Johnson	5 Felcon Drive	New cottage	80/329	Linda Williams
64. Phillip Bloom	9 Lily Street	Hardscape	42.3.4/49	Linda Williams
65. Marc Knight	60 Nobadeer Avenue	Fenestration changes	80/10	Permits Plus
66. Darlene Demichelle	Lot 26- Birdsong	New dwelling	55.44/80.2	Brook Meerbergen
67. Darlene Demichelle	Lot 26- Birdsong	2 nd new dwelling	55.44/80.2	Brook Meerbergen
68. Darlene Demichelle	Lot 26- Birdsong	New garage	55.44/80.2	Brook Meerbergen
69. Morely- Cothran	3 Correia Lane	New dwelling	80/63	Val Oliver Design
70. Marshall & Holly Pagon	28 & 32 Baxter Road	Pool house & pergola	49.2.3/29	Design Associates
71. Mark Wilmot	35 Monomoy Road	Rev 2021-05-3718	54/74	Gryphon Architects
72. Michael Langlois	14 The Grove	Shed	38/145	David Ring
73. Michael Robinson	13 Fayette Street	Roof walk	42.3.2/28	Sanne Payne
74. Triple Farm, LLC	21 Crooked Lane	Pool	41/480	Atlantic Landscaping
75. Waldman Winger	5 Old Quidnet Milk Rte	Pool	20/54.1	Atlantic Landscaping
76. Robert Buckley	62 South Shore Road	Pool & hardscape	80/112	Atlantic Landscaping
77. Anthony Noto	10 Lincoln Avenue	Addition & renovation	30/184	Emeritus
78. Jim Ikard	1 Bloom Street	Basement walkout	42.3.3/140	Emeritus
79. 450 Green Park, LLC	2 Stone Alley	Addtn/alter/foundation	42.3.1/102	Emeritus
80. Patrick Bailey	3 Doc Ryder Drive	Rev. 10-4851	66/210	JB Studio
81. Stephen Cohen L Trust	55 Sankaty Road	Window changes	49/69	Jamie-Lynn Finchman
82. Marshall & Molly Pagon	28 & 32 Baxter Road	Pool & spa	49.2.3/29	Jardins Intl.
83. Joe Arno	31 Easy Street	Like window replacement	42.4.2/16	Gordon Folger
84. Chris Skehel	61a Cato Lane	Rev. 03-3239: door & fenst	56/49	LINK

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	November 30 & December 2, 2021
Other Business	• Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, December 14, 2021 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	Welch – His term as HDC's Section 106 representative has ended; as far as he knows, HDC now has no Section 106 representative. Backus – Will put that on the agenda to vote someone into the position.

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:25 pm. (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board